

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BEFORE THE CALIFORNIA STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

450 N STREET

SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

SEPTEMBER 27TH, 2022

CALIFORNIA STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

BOARD MEETING

REPORTED BY: Jillian M. Sumner

CSR NO. 13619

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES

For the Board of
Equalization:

Honorable Malia M. Cohen
Chair

Honorable Mike Schaefer
Vice Chair

Honorable Ted Gaines
First District

Honorable Antonio Vazquez
Third District

Anthony Epolite
Appearing for Betty T.
Yee, State Controller
(per Government Code
Section 7.9)

For the Board of
Equalization Staff:

Yvette Stowers
Executive Director

Henry Nanjo
Chief Counsel
Legal Department

Lisa Renati
Chief Deputy Director

Lisa Thompson
Chief
Taxpayers' Rights Advocate

David Yeung
Deputy Director
Property Tax Department

Patricia Lumsden
Chief
County-Assessed Properties Division

Michelle Cruz
Manager
State-Assessed Properties Division

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

For the Board of
Equalization Staff:

- Dustin Weatherby
Chief
Legislative, Research & Statistics
Division
- Cathy Taylor
Chief
Board Proceedings Division
- Mary Cichetti
Clerk
Board Proceedings Division

	INDEX	PAGE NO
1		
2		
3	Item J1	11
4	Motion	13
5	Item K1a	14
6	Motion	31
7	Item K1b	53
8	Motion	65
9	Motion	67
10	Item K1c	69
11	Item K1d	74
12	Item K2a	79
13	Item K4a	112
14	Item K5a	138
15	Item M1	142
16	Item M2a	143
17	Item N	144
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION
450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO
SEPTEMBER 27, 2022

---oOo---

MS. COHEN: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen.

I'd like to call this meeting to order.

Good morning to you.

It's Tuesday, September 27th, 10:07 in the morning.

This is the regularly-scheduled meeting for the California State Board of Equalization.

My name is Malia Cohen, Chair of this body.

And to my left is the Vice Chair, Mike Schaefer.

Ms. Cichetti, good morning to you.

MS. CICHETTI: Good morning.

MS. COHEN: Could you please call the roll.

MS. CICHETTI: Would you mind holding one minute. We're have a little bit of a technical difficulty. We're trying to get the AT&T operator on.

MS. COHEN: Absolutely.

MS. CICHETTI: All right. We are live.

MS. COHEN: All right. We are live.

Welcome.

1 MS. CICHETTI: All right.
2 Chair Cohen.
3 MS. COHEN: Present.
4 MS. CICHETTI: Vice Chair Schaefer.
5 MR. SCHAEFER: Present.
6 MS. CICHETTI: Member Gaines.
7 MR. GAINES: Present.
8 MS. CICHETTI: Member Vazquez.
9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Present.
10 MS. CICHETTI: Deputy Controller Epolite.
11 MR. EPOLITE: Present.
12 MS. COHEN: Thank you, Ms. Cichetti. I
13 appreciate that.
14 A quorum is present.
15 Board, colleagues, let's begin our meeting
16 with the Pledge of Allegiance.
17 Please rise if you're able, and place your
18 right hand over your heart, and repeat after me.
19 (Whereupon the Pledge of Allegiance was
20 recited.)
21 MS. COHEN: All right. Thank you very much.
22 I am really excited. It is Latino Heritage
23 Month in September. And I just wanted to frame our
24 conversation on the purpose of why we celebrate
25 Latino Heritage Month.

1 It's entirely appropriate we honor the
2 tradition, that we honor the tradition of Latin folks,
3 Hispanics throughout the Americas.

4 The observation started in 1968. And it
5 started as Hispanic Heritage Week under President Lyndon
6 Johnson, and it was expanded by President Ronald Reagan
7 in 1988 to cover a 30-day period starting on
8 September 15th and ending on October 15th.

9 And this period of celebration honors the
10 contribution of American citizens whose ancestors come
11 from Spain, Mexico, the Caribbean, Central and South
12 America.

13 The day of September 15th is significant
14 because it is the anniversary of independence for
15 Latin American countries. Those countries include
16 Costa Rica, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, and
17 Nicaragua.

18 And in addition, Mexico and Chile also
19 celebrate their independent days on September 16th and
20 18th, respectively.

21 Also want to note Columbus Day, or Dia de la
22 Raza, which is scheduled -- which is celebrated on
23 October 12th, also falls within this 30-day period.

24 So here in California we recognize that
25 between 2010 and 2020 Latino share of the state's

1 population grew from 37.6 percent to 39.4 percent. And
2 in 2020, the Latino's share of the population exceeded
3 non-Hispanic white share of the population, with Latino
4 being the state's largest population group.

5 And the Latino population is younger than any
6 other Californians. More than half, 51.6 percent of all
7 Californians under 18 are Latino. So the future of our
8 state will be shaped by these young Latinos as they
9 become leaders here in the state of California.

10 I also want to recognize a significant
11 political gains made by representation, by Latins in our
12 state and in our nation, including our very own Board
13 Member, Antonio Vazquez, who is the first Latino Chair
14 of the Board of Equalization.

15 As well as -- as with all great communities
16 that make up our state, our nation's diversity, we take
17 a great joy in living in a time when the horizons are
18 open for achievement and excellence. After all, that is
19 truly the American dream.

20 So, therefore, we honor Latino Heritage Month.

21 And with that, I'd like to pivot to our own,
22 Tony Vazquez.

23 Thank you.

24 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

25 Thank you, Madam Chair. Great job with some

1 of that background history. You covered actually most
2 of my points.

3 But let me just add that I am honored, like
4 the Chair just mentioned, to be the first Latino --
5 actually Mexican-born, to sit on the State Board of
6 Equalization.

7 And I was blessed when I was locally in
8 Santa Monica to be the first Latino city counsel member,
9 and the first Mayor, Latino Mayor, of the city of
10 Santa Monica.

11 And a lot of it has to do with what the Chair
12 had just touched on, just the growing population. As a
13 young student at USC, I was real involved with voter
14 registration.

15 Because as our population was blowing up, we
16 realized that we needed to get more and more of these
17 folks, one, to become citizens, and then, two, to be --
18 to vote.

19 And it all ties into -- and I look at it more
20 as the Latino Heritage Month. Somehow they gave us
21 Hispanic. I'm not sure where that name came from. It
22 has really no roots in my history, or Latino or Mexican
23 roots. And even for some of the other Latin American
24 countries that were mentioned.

25 I think it was kind of created out of the

1 census back when Carter was the President. And to me it
2 has really no significance or history connection. So I
3 like to use Latino Heritage Month. And I know some
4 people mix the two.

5 But I really appreciate the fact that the
6 Governor, our current Governor stepped up and actually
7 did a proclamation just recently talking about the
8 Latino Heritage Month, and really dedicating this month,
9 starting September 15th, which is really the day before
10 the independence of Mexico from Spain.

11 And it's part of the Grito, and then carried
12 over all the way to October 15th, which encompasses also
13 the other la Raza, which is better known, or was known
14 as a kid when I was growing up, you know, we didn't talk
15 about it. It was Columbus Day, basically. And now
16 that's flipped, and rightfully so.

17 And I really appreciate the embrace and the
18 support we've been getting throughout the state of
19 California. And only looking forward to continue this
20 growth.

21 Because at the end of the day, the Latino
22 agenda is really California agenda. It's all about
23 education, where we're going to talk a little bit later
24 today, affordable housing, and good-paying jobs.

25 So I really appreciate the support, and

1 looking forward, not only here on the Board, but many of
2 the cities throughout the state of California have done
3 some real good celebrations throughout this period.

4 And I was blessed actually just last week to
5 attend the 60th anniversary of KMEX. Now it's better
6 known as Univision. It started, you know, back 60 years
7 ago. And I remember attending it at their little --
8 they were literally in a little shack on Melrose just
9 outside of Hollywood. And now if you look at their
10 facility, it's in Culver City just off -- real close to
11 LAX. They have this beautiful building and many arenas.

12 It's kind of -- the actual station in terms of
13 advertisement has just blossomed. Many -- I didn't
14 realize the advertising power of Univision is sometimes,
15 depending on what they're looking at, it has more
16 financial power than some other, like Channel 7 and
17 Channel 4, in terms of advertising dollars.

18 So it's really grown. And I'm looking forward
19 to continuing that growth and that support.

20 And thank you for those kinds words,
21 Madam Chair. And I'll turn it back to you.

22 MS. COHEN: Thank you. I appreciate that.

23 Thank you. Colleagues, I want to open up the
24 floor to you to see if there's any remarks that you may
25 like to share.

1 Yes, Mr. Schaefer.

2 And then we'll go to you, Senator Gaines.

3 MR. SCHAEFER: Yes.

4 I just wanted to toot the horn for my
5 District 4. We are the fastest growing Latino community
6 in the state.

7 And I'd also like to take note that today is
8 the last day of Happy New Year of the Jewish community,
9 Rosh Hashanah. And we celebrate that this time every
10 year.

11 Thank you.

12 MS. COHEN: Yes, you're right. We have a lot
13 to celebrate.

14 Thank you for reminding us of that.

15 Senator Gaines, what's on your mind?

16 MR. GAINES: Yeah. Let's see.

17 My mic's on? You can hear me?

18 MS. COHEN: I can hear you.

19 MR. GAINES: Okay. Great.

20 Good morning, and thank you for those great
21 comments.

22 And I just want to add in, in terms of Latino
23 Heritage Month. And I think America has an exciting
24 future, as does California, with the expanding Latino
25 population, and the contributions that they make to our

1 society. Family-oriented, hard working, entrepreneurs.
2 You know, when you take a look at those aspects, that
3 bodes hope for the future in America.

4 So I'm very excited to embrace Latino Heritage
5 Month and honor those who have served. Times have not
6 been easy for Latinos in America or California, if you
7 look back at our history. But I think our future is
8 bright, and I look forward to that future.

9 Thank you.

10 MS. COHEN: Couldn't agree more. Our future
11 is bright.

12 Okay. Seeing that there are no other
13 speakers, Ms. Cichetti, please announce our first order
14 of business.

15 MS. CICHETTI: Good morning.

16 Our first order of business is an announcement
17 regarding public safety and Board Room procedure.

18 Good morning, Madam Chair and Members.

19 The Board Meeting information announcement is
20 as follows.

21 First, I'd like to remind the audience to
22 silence your cell phones and any other wireless devices.

23 The current COVID-19 guidelines for the Board
24 of Equalization strongly encourages, but no longer
25 mandatory, that all BOE employees wear a mask while

1 inside the BOE facility, or while attending any BOE
2 event.

3 If needed, supplies of mask and hand sanitizer
4 are available to all, and can be found in the back of
5 the auditorium.

6 The public will be invited to comment during
7 the matters before the Board. If there are any members
8 of the public wishing to speak before the Board on any
9 agenda item in person, we ask that you complete and
10 submit to the sergeant at arms a public comment
11 appearance sheet, located at the entrance of the
12 auditorium.

13 If you wish to speak before the Board by
14 telephone, please dial the phone number and access code
15 provided on our Public Agenda Notice, and follow the
16 instructions of the AT&T moderator.

17 If you intend to make a public comment today
18 using the AT&T moderator, we recommend dialling into the
19 meeting on the teleconference line prior to the
20 beginning of the agenda item you wish to make a comment.

21 We recommend this, as the audio broadcast on
22 our website experiences a one-to-three minute delay
23 between the livestream and the live event.

24 When giving a public comment, please limit
25 your remarks to three minutes.

1 The order that the Board identifies public
2 comments at the conclusion of any agenda item is as
3 follows:

4 The clerk will first identify any public
5 comment request that had been received by our Board
6 Proceedings staff in the auditorium.

7 Then we will identify any public comments
8 within the AT&T moderator. And, lastly, we will read
9 into the record any public comments received in writing
10 in advance of today's meeting.

11 This concludes the information announcement.

12 Thank you.

13 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

14 Ms. Cichetti, could you please call the first
15 item.

16 **ITEM J1**

17
18 MS. CICHETTI: The first item is J,
19 Administrative Consent Agenda; J1, Approval of the Board
20 Meeting Minutes for the May 24th, 2022; June 28th, 2022;
21 July 26th, 27th, 2022; and August 30th, 31st, 2022.

22 The minutes of the meeting were attached to
23 the Public Agenda Notice for your consideration.

24 MS. COHEN: Thank you very much, Ms. Cichetti.

25 Well, colleagues, let's go ahead and get

1 started.

2 Go ahead.

3 MR. VAZQUEZ: Oh, are we going to hear from
4 Ms. Stowers, or did you want to just --

5 MS. COHEN: Ms. Stowers, are you coming up?
6 Come on up. Come on up. Tell us about these
7 minutes.

8 MS. STOWERS: I guess I'm coming up.

9 MS. COHEN: Okay. Good to see you. Good
10 morning.

11 MS. STOWERS: Take my seat and stay here.

12 Good morning, Chair Cohen and Members.

13 I'm Yvette Stowers, Executive Director for the
14 Board of Equalization.

15 Before you are the minutes for May, June, July
16 and August. Just to -- a brief reminder, I previously
17 came to you indicating that I was going to make a change
18 to the minute policy. I received feedback from your
19 offices indicating that the proposed change would not
20 provide sufficient transparency that we need, and that
21 we have for our minutes.

22 Therefore, I made the decision not to change
23 the policy. And before you today are the minutes that
24 provides a summary of items that were discussed, action
25 items taken, and all exhibits that were provided during

1 the meeting or part of the Public Agenda Notice have
2 been included within those minutes.

3 MS. COHEN: All right. Thank you very much.

4 Mr. Vazquez.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes.

6 Thank you, Ms. Stowers. And thank you for
7 including now I guess the Pledge of Allegiance and all
8 the exhibits that we had before. I think that makes a
9 lot of sense.

10 And the summary descriptions, as you
11 mentioned, I think makes it a little bit easier for the
12 public and for us, as we go back and reference these, if
13 we ever have to go back, you know, months or even a year
14 back into the minutes.

15 And also I noticed, you know, with the contact
16 information on each of the exhibits that is now
17 accessible by the disabled, I think is a key piece as
18 well, so that the public or the staff can easily obtain
19 copies, you know, as requested.

20 And if there's no other comments, I'm prepared
21 to move the motion to accept the minutes of May, June,
22 July and August.

23 MS. COHEN: Perfect.

24 All right. A motion has been made by
25 Mr. Vazquez.

1 Is there a second?

2 MR. EPOLITE: Second.

3 MS. COHEN: Second by Mr. Epolite.

4 Let's take a roll call vote.

5 MS. CICHETTI: All right.

6 The motion is to approve the minutes for the
7 May 24th, 2022; June 28th, 2022; July 26th, 27th, 2022;
8 and August 30th, 31st, '22.

9 Chair Cohen.

10 MS. COHEN: Aye.

11 MS. CICHETTI: Vice Chair Schaefer.

12 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

13 MS. CICHETTI: Member Gaines.

14 MR. GAINES: Aye.

15 MS. CICHETTI: Member Vazquez.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

17 MS. CICHETTI: Deputy Controller Epolite.

18 MR. EPOLITE: Aye.

19 MS. COHEN: Great. This motion passes
20 unanimously.

21 Ms. Cichetti, please call the next item.

22

23 **ITEM K1a**

24

25 MS. CICHETTI: The next item is K,

1 Other Administrative Matters; K1(a), Executive
2 Director's Report, Organizational Update, Report on the
3 status of Pending and upcoming organizational
4 priorities.

5 This matter will be presented by Ms. Stowers.

6 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

7 MS. STOWERS: Hello.

8 Yvette Stowers here. Executive Director for
9 the Board of Equalization.

10 Happy Latino Heritage Month. And for those
11 who are celebrating the Jewish New Year, Happy New Year.

12 Today I'm going to provide you with three
13 items. I'm going to highlight several upcoming meeting
14 of notes, provide a report on the Member-requested work
15 plan for Board Work Group on communication and outreach,
16 provide an overview of the assessment practices survey
17 program.

18 Up first today, Members, I would like to
19 provide you with some upcoming dates.

20 On September 29th, 2022, the BOE has been
21 invited to participate in the California Society of
22 Enrolled Agents Annual State Tax Agency Liaison Meeting.
23 The event will be held virtually.

24 I will attend and give a brief overview of the
25 BOE, along with staff from the Property Tax Department,

1 who have been asked to provide information on Prop. 19.

2 This will be our first appearance at this
3 annual event. And I believe it's an excellent
4 opportunity and forum for outreach to our stakeholders.
5 And not only the agency's role in property tax, but also
6 for getting information out to stakeholders on important
7 property tax information.

8 Next, on October 19th, we will hold our annual
9 meeting with the assessors as part of October 18th and
10 19th Board Meeting. Staff and I continue to work with
11 the Chair's office to finalize the details for this
12 meeting.

13 Then on November 2nd through the 4th,
14 California Lawyers Association will hold its 2022 Annual
15 Meeting at the Tax Bar and Tax Policy Conference in
16 San Diego.

17 BOE Chief Counsel, Henry Nanjo, will be
18 participating as part of the chief counsel round table
19 discussion, along with chief counsels from other
20 California agencies, California tax agencies.

21 And, finally, Members, on November 14th
22 through the 17th the 120th Annual CAA Conference will be
23 held at Solano County. Conference information and
24 registration has been sent to your offices.

25 I will always continue to keep you updated on

1 upcoming dates. That's my first part of the
2 presentation on upcoming dates.

3 Do you have any questions or comments?

4 MS. COHEN: I do have a question.

5 Director, can you tell me again the dates of
6 the conference and the location?

7 MS. STOWERS: For the November, or all of it?

8 MS. COHEN: Both.

9 MS. STOWERS: Okay. Not a problem.

10 For the -- I like the shorthand, we call it
11 the Tax Policy Conference. But Tax Policy Conference,
12 November 2nd through the 4th. It's in San Diego,
13 California.

14 MS. COHEN: Now, that's an annual conference,
15 right?

16 MS. STOWERS: That is an annual conference.

17 MS. COHEN: You've attended?

18 MS. STOWERS: I've attended. I attended last
19 year in my prior role.

20 MS. COHEN: Mm-hm.

21 MS. STOWERS: It is really an excellent
22 conference. There's, I mean, one, our attorneys and
23 CPAs can get continuing ed.

24 MS. COHEN: Right.

25 MS. STOWERS: So that's critical.

1 MS. COHEN: Okay.

2 MS. STOWERS: But it's also where you have tax
3 administrators, The Franchise Tax Board, the BOE, the
4 CDTFA, they're there presenting workshops in hand and in
5 partnership with professional consultants, attorneys and
6 representatives.

7 MS. COHEN: And that -- this is the tax policy
8 conference that you're going to be speaking at about
9 Prop. 19?

10 MS. STOWERS: No. I'm sorry. No, I'm not
11 speaking at that at all.

12 MS. COHEN: Okay.

13 MS. STOWERS: Let me back up. I'm sorry. I
14 skipped one.

15 MS. COHEN: Okay.

16 MS. STOWERS: The one that I'm speaking at is
17 on September 29th. And that is with the California
18 Society of Enrolled Agents.

19 MS. COHEN: Mm-hm.

20 MS. STOWERS: I'm going to talk about BOE and
21 all the great work that we do. And then the team is
22 going to go into Prop. 19.

23 MS. COHEN: Okay.

24 MR. SCHAEFER: What is the site of that?

25 MS. STOWERS: What is the site?

1 MS. COHEN: Where is the -- where is this
2 party?

3 MS. STOWERS: It's a virtual conference, and
4 it's limited to members of the California Society of
5 Enrolled Agents.

6 MS. COHEN: Okay. Got it.

7 So you're an invited guest to present to talk
8 about this?

9 MS. STOWERS: We're an invited -- yes.

10 And that will include, again, all the other
11 tax agencies. They, for some reason, have not included
12 us. But members of the California Society of Enrolled
13 Agents are part of our tax -- what do we call it --
14 advisory council.

15 MS. COHEN: Got it. Understood.

16 Okay. Thank you. I'm glad I asked.

17 So September 29th, the California Society of
18 Enrolled Agents, discussing Prop. 19, virtual.

19 The tax policy is November 2nd through the 4th
20 in San Diego.

21 Now, you, and, I assume, your executive team
22 will be going down there?

23 MS. STOWERS: Henry is definitely going down
24 there. I am considering going -- I am going down there.
25 I just haven't made the confirmation yet.

1 MS. COHEN: Okay.

2 MS. STOWERS: I am going, and I believe there
3 are different individuals within your offices --

4 MS. COHEN: Yes.

5 MS. STOWERS: -- that have expressed a desire
6 to go.

7 MS. COHEN: I think we've attended before in
8 the past.

9 MS. STOWERS: Yes, I think -- I know you have.

10 MS. COHEN: Okay. All right. Thank you.

11 MR. SCHAEFER: I will be down there, because I
12 live there. So I'll stop in.

13 MS. STOWERS: Okay.

14 MS. COHEN: Okay.

15 Yes, Mr. Vazquez.

16 And then we'll go to Mr. Epolite.

17 MR. VAZQUEZ: First of all, thank you,
18 Ms. Stowers, for your, one, the update on these
19 conferences. I know there's several. Well, one of
20 them, the 29th, is this week.

21 But in regards to the Tax Policy Conference,
22 the annual one, I would like to send a formal letter to
23 the California Tax Bar requesting that next year they
24 include a course on property tax incentives for
25 affordable housing. Particularly, the Welfare Exemption

1 and the assessment of the restricted properties under
2 section 402.1.

3 I think it's an area where the legal community
4 should be aware and become more involved. And the BOE
5 has -- and the BOE has access to experts who can serve
6 on the instructional panel.

7 Perhaps the Board, you know, my colleagues
8 here, would join me in this letter to see if we can have
9 that included in their next year's conference.

10 MS. COHEN: Can you circulate the language?
11 Do you have language for us to consider?

12 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, we will submit that.

13 And if people are comfortable with it,
14 especially in light of the hearings we've been having,
15 and what we're trying to do to, hopefully, not only
16 facilitate, but try to streamline some of these issues
17 around, not only the abatement, the welfare, and then
18 now just trying to expedite the process.

19 And I know there's been some conversation with
20 other constitutional members on this. And I think we,
21 as a state, could do a better job to try and fast track
22 these things.

23 MS. COHEN: Thank you very much.

24 MS. STOWERS: Thank you, Member Vazquez.

25 I look forward to receiving the draft

1 language. And I will have the team reach out to the
2 committee for the Tax Policy Conference.

3 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

4 MS. STOWERS: And see what we can do about
5 getting that on the agenda.

6 MS. COHEN: Mr. Epolite.

7 MR. EPOLITE: Just wanted to share with the
8 Members that the Tax Policy Conference is organized by
9 the Franchise Tax Board, and is attended by Franchise
10 Tax Board, attorneys, the private bar, and CDTFB
11 attorneys also attend, and that the Deputy State
12 Controller usually attends the conference as well,
13 annually.

14 MS. COHEN: So you'll be there?

15 MR. EPOLITE: I will be there.

16 MS. COHEN: Thank you. I appreciate that.

17 Yes.

18 MS. STOWERS: I think it's important to note
19 that program staff goes too. So the FTB side, USC, some
20 of their auditors. Some of their more experienced
21 auditors.

22 When you look at some of the topics, he's not
23 going to be happy. But there's some topics there that
24 lead the way to property tax administration.

25 And Mr. David Yeung, or someone within his

1 team, could get some value from the conferences.

2 MR. EPOLITE: And this year's location is the
3 Hotel Del. So it's always that nice location.

4 MS. STOWERS: We have a discounted rate.

5 MS. COHEN: Of course.

6 MR. EPOLITE: The government rate is \$125.
7 They always set it up nicely.

8 MS. COHEN: Thank you for all this
9 information.

10 Any questions?

11 Okay. Thank you very much. Let's keep
12 moving.

13 MS. STOWERS: Okay. Wow. Okay. So that was
14 dates.

15 My next item is the potential Board Work Group
16 on communication and outreach. I trust that you guys
17 have this pamphlet in front of you titled Potential
18 Board Work Plan for Communication and Outreach.

19 Okay. Sorry for the delay. It did not get
20 finalized until yesterday, so, therefore, it's not
21 attached to the PAN. But it will be incorporated into
22 our exhibits for the minutes, and I will send you an
23 electronic copy before the end of the day, so that your
24 team can review it.

25 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

1 MS. STOWERS: But I think I have enough copies
2 for the chief deputies.

3 Thank you, Cathy.

4 Okay. So let's talk about this. Back on the
5 July 2022 Board Meeting, I was directed to bring back a
6 work plan on potential Board Work Group on communication
7 and outreach that would include communication with the
8 legislators, stakeholders and others.

9 To assist the Board's discussion on this
10 potential Work Group, it's important to review and align
11 the Board Members' strategic plan goals on education and
12 outreach.

13 Specifically, there are two goals. One, the
14 focus on education and outreach, which is goal three.
15 And the other one, which focuses on building agency-wide
16 branding, which is goal four.

17 Additionally, it's important to look back at
18 what the Board has accomplished to date with respect to
19 communication and outreach.

20 For example, depending on district basis,
21 Members have augmented their communication and outreach
22 with respect to monthly news letters, press releases,
23 constituent affairs, collaboration with local government
24 and social media.

25 Members, you have also performed outreach

1 within your district to provide your constituents with
2 the opportunity to express issues regarding Property Tax
3 Administration. And once those issues have been
4 expressed, you have brought them back to the entire
5 Board and to the agency to take action when necessary.

6 On the statewide basis, Members, you have held
7 multiple public hearings and discussions on important
8 issues, including base year value transfer, Prop. 19,
9 intergenerational transfer exclusions, Prop. 19,
10 COVID-19 response, Assessment Appeals Boards remote
11 hearings, and property tax incentives to encourage
12 affordable housing.

13 These accomplishments provide many lessons
14 learned and experiences that can be built upon. I
15 believe that this provides a good foundation for finding
16 next steps.

17 For your consideration, I have drafted a
18 high-level review of these items, and provided some
19 suggested next steps, as well as the draft work plan.

20 Some suggested next steps is, one, evaluate
21 the strategies that was recommended last August by what
22 I'm referring to as the informal Work Group that was
23 presented by Vice Chair Schaefer and Member Gaines
24 regarding branding of the BOE.

25 Another recommendation is to have the

1 equalization districts to continue to develop an annual
2 outreach and education plan that reflects consistent and
3 share approach, while recognizing the different and
4 unique needs within a district.

5 Have the Board continue to act as ambassadors
6 to promote the Board of Equalization. Continue to have
7 the Board Members electronic communications, such as
8 newsletters and social media campaigns.

9 And, most importantly, leverage existing
10 agency prepared material for education and outreach.

11 This material includes our Prop. 19 web page,
12 our fax sheet, our checklist, our comparisons, and our
13 frequently asked questions. It also includes the
14 taxpayer rights information sheets, our information
15 about disaster relief, and our publications, such as
16 introduction to the California State Board of
17 Equalization, and our annual report.

18 And, finally, as you all do, continue to work
19 in partnership with the legislators.

20 That concludes my presentation on the Board
21 Work Group Communication and Outreach. I'm available to
22 answer any questions or comments that you may have.

23 MS. COHEN: Thank you very much.

24 Mr. Vazquez.

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: First of all, I know I'm looking

1 at this for the first time, so some of my comments you
2 may have touched on a little bit on this, the written
3 form we just got handed.

4 But I just wanted to thank you for the
5 outreach and the fact that you and your staff have been
6 diligent in, you know, putting this thing together.

7 I think it's great. It's a great start. But
8 I'd like to see us continue to develop it, so we have a
9 final proposal that the Board can adopt by year-end if
10 possible.

11 Above all, I would like the plan to carry out
12 our mission per our Governance Policy, to be open and
13 accountable to the legislators, taxpayers for assessing
14 and collecting the proper amount of taxes due and
15 administering exemptions.

16 This requires a strong outreach plan with the
17 focus on educating taxpayers and increasing voluntary
18 compliance, including streamlining the exemption
19 requirements on both a statewide and regional basis.

20 I think that working closely with assessors,
21 local officials, legislators and tax practitioners is an
22 effective and cost-efficient method, and should
23 encourage staff and Board Members participation and
24 education activities that are proven, like the nonprofit
25 seminars, tax practitioners, class -- educational

1 classes, information on new laws and regulations,
2 telephone, town halls, and a speakers bureau that can
3 respond to specific educational needs, are just some of
4 my thoughts.

5 But thank you for this preliminary report.

6 MS. COHEN: Ms. Stowers, you were reporting on
7 the Board workload plan, right?

8 MS. STOWERS: The Board Work Plan for
9 Communications and Outreach.

10 MS. COHEN: Okay. Colleagues, do you have any
11 other questions for Ms. Stowers?

12 If not, I want to talk.

13 MR. GAINES: I do at some point.

14 MS. COHEN: Yes, please. Go ahead.

15 MR. GAINES: Oh, okay.

16 MS. COHEN: My discussion is a motion. So go
17 ahead.

18 MR. GAINES: Oh, okay. All right. Good.

19 So I wanted to thank you for bringing this
20 forward. And it's a great first step. And we can move
21 forward and develop a workshop on some of these areas in
22 the future.

23 But I -- I think I want to emphasize just
24 these means of communication, and how important they
25 are. This list that you've given us that -- many of the

1 things that we've presented in our presentation that we
2 made to the Board in terms of branding and outreach.

3 And so I think these are all effective means
4 of doing that, right?

5 So a monthly news letter. Which I do, you
6 know. We send that out to constituents.

7 Member press releases, member events. Which
8 we've done some of those in our first term here.

9 Member constituent affairs, you know, trying
10 to make sure that we're communicating to our
11 constituents that they have a means of having issues
12 addressed.

13 Certainly collaboration and working with local
14 government. And both the Member and staff
15 representation with government affairs groups is so
16 important in terms of what is happening in the
17 Legislature. That we're in sync with what's happening
18 in the Legislature.

19 But also those bodies that may come before the
20 Board of Equalization. That we're listening to what
21 their needs are. Because there's certain groups that
22 represent taxpayers. And we want to hear from them.

23 And, of course, social media. And then,
24 finally, upgrading the Members' website. But these are
25 all effective means of being able to communicate with

1 our constituent. And we can expand on these. And I'm
2 excited about those opportunities to do so.

3 And as we move forward, I just wanted -- I
4 guess I want to be careful that we're doing this in the
5 right fashion, as Members of the Board of Equalization.
6 That what we do is not political. Not even perceived as
7 being political. That we are doing things that are
8 means of reaching out to our constituents and providing
9 services for those.

10 And I guess the reason I'm bringing that up is
11 I just want to make sure that we remember some of the
12 issues that came before this Board, the Board of
13 Equalization, that were construed or handled in the
14 wrong way.

15 And so as we move forward, I just think we
16 need to do it in a careful fashion. I think we have a
17 great opportunity and story to tell about what we do.
18 But we have to make sure that it is dealt with in a
19 careful fashion.

20 So I look forward to that. And I think we
21 have, you know, a great opportunity before us. But I
22 just want to do so with some deliberation and caution in
23 terms of doing it in the right way.

24 MS. COHEN: So what -- what are you saying?

25 MR. GAINES: I'm saying that we have a history

1 at the BOE where things went awry in terms of outreach.

2 MS. COHEN: Not our collective history, our
3 predecessors.

4 MR. GAINES: Not ours. Not ours. Right.

5 MS. COHEN: All right. Let's put that
6 distinction out there on the record.

7 MR. GAINES: Yeah. Thank you. Thank you.

8 So I just want to be careful in how we do
9 this. I think there is a pathway. There is a way to do
10 it. But I just want to make sure we do it in the right
11 fashion so that we can continue to be a good, effective,
12 transparent organization, which I believe we have been
13 since we've been elected.

14 MS. COHEN: Yes, I agree with you.

15 And I'm sure our counsel, Mr. Henry Nanjo, is
16 jumping for joy over there to know that he has another
17 ally that is going to always err on the side of
18 abundance of caution.

19 I appreciate you bringing that and making sure
20 that's at the forefront of our mind always.

21 MR. GAINES: Great. Great. Thank you.

22 MS. COHEN: I want to make a motion that we
23 create a Board-standing Work Group on communications and
24 outreach.

25 And this is different from branding. What I'm

1 proposing.

2 And the reason why I'm recommending this, is
3 actually in the spirit of what you just laid out,
4 Senator Gaines, the creation of the Work Group would
5 allow us to publicly notice meetings so that we can
6 facilitate coming together. And we will not be in
7 violation of any Bagley-Keene laws.

8 And will facilitate the ability for our
9 offices and the agency to work together on a regular
10 basis without violating, like I said, Bagley-Keene.

11 So I'm making a motion to create a
12 Board-standing Work Group on communications and
13 outreach. And I believe I would like to entertain a
14 second to this motion if there's appetite.

15 MR. SCHAEFER: I would second the motion.

16 MS. COHEN: Okay. Is there any discussion on
17 this motion?

18 Yes, Mr. Epolite.

19 MR. EPOLITE: For further discussion on this
20 work plan?

21 MS. COHEN: Yes, that will be part of the
22 discussion. Yes.

23 But what I'm trying to do is create an
24 independent body that has full transparency for the
25 members of the public, as well as our office, as well as

1 a space for the staff to all come together. And in
2 doing that, this work plan, it's a, like a, what do you
3 call it, an evergreen document, kind of constantly fluid
4 and subject to changes if need be.

5 I don't foresee any, but it's a structural
6 framework is what I'm trying to propose that we'll be
7 discussing items like this.

8 Yes? Is that clear?

9 Okay. I see our friend and counsel,
10 Mr. Nanjo, has stepped up to the microphone. I'd like
11 to acknowledge him.

12 MR. NANJO: Thank you, Chair Cohen.

13 I would be remised in my duties if I didn't
14 mention to the Board that there is a little bit of
15 caution that needs to be exercised when we're discussing
16 communications and outreach.

17 Specifically, as the Board may remember, when
18 the Government Code 15600 was altered to redefine or
19 focus the Board's duties, if you will, one of the key
20 components of that action was the Board's communication
21 and outreach was specifically called out.

22 And what was important -- and, again, I'm not
23 saying that you shouldn't do this. All I'm saying is
24 please keep in mind that one of the things the
25 legislation was very clear about was that the Board had

1 its own independent communications and outreach duties,
2 vis-a-vis their individual districts.

3 And the -- that is to be distinguished from
4 the agency's communication and outreach duties.

5 The Board was not -- was specifically
6 mentioned in that legislation not to interfere or affect
7 or have any operational control over or work with the
8 Board's agent -- or the agency's, I should say,
9 communications and outreach, that that was supposed to
10 be done separately.

11 Any communications and outreach the Board
12 Members were to do were supposed to be done with their
13 own staff.

14 We also, as you may remember, also have an
15 attorney general's guidance that also kind of confirmed
16 that at that time.

17 So, again, as you work forward, move forward
18 on this Board communication and outreach plan, just kind
19 of be mindful of that distinction, if you can.

20 MS. COHEN: Of course.

21 And we do not intend to violate any laws.
22 But, ultimately, this will allow us to work together for
23 just the maximum reach and maximum impact. We're
24 talking about just using our collective ability.

25 I appreciate the counsel -- advising counsel.

1 And I'm in agreement, and I receive it.

2 MR. NANJO: Absolutely. And --

3 MS. COHEN: I'm not moving this body in a
4 place that would present us to be in a vulnerable
5 position, or even to receive accusations that we're in
6 violation of Bagley-Keene.

7 MR. NANJO: Yeah.

8 Along those lines, I just wanted to remind the
9 Board.

10 So thank you very much, Chair Cohen.

11 MS. COHEN: Yes. Of course.

12 MR. GAINES: Could I expand on that? Just
13 to --

14 MS. COHEN: Yes.

15 MR. GAINES: Because I just need clarity in my
16 mind in terms of the reference.

17 You're referencing AB 102?

18 MR. NANJO: Correct.

19 MR. GAINES: Okay. And so can we get more
20 information on that?

21 Because what you've said is that -- I think
22 what you've said is we can't do what's being suggested
23 in the motion. So I want to understand that. And if we
24 can't, then we need to figure out a plan B.

25 MR. NANJO: Yeah.

1 So to the extent that the motion involves
2 Board Members and Board Member staff, that's
3 appropriate. Where AB --

4 MS. COHEN: Which, by the way, is what the
5 motion states.

6 MR. NANJO: What AB 2 -- 102, and what --
7 which got embodied in Government Code -- changes to
8 Government Code Section 15600, and what the attorney
9 general's opinion talks about is the Board has the
10 ability to do communications and outreach in their own
11 districts if they utilize their own staff to do that.

12 As far as the agency, the agency can do
13 communications and outreach. But that's with their own
14 staff. And there needs to be a division between the two
15 bodies.

16 MR. GAINES: Okay.

17 MR. NANJO: So that's, essentially, the upshot
18 of --

19 MR. GAINES: Okay. Because I know that
20 there's -- you know, if I -- like, for a newsletter, I
21 run the newsletter through the Executive Director before
22 we send it out. Because I want to make sure there's not
23 anything that's inappropriate in terms of what I'm
24 putting in my newsletter.

25 MR. NANJO: Sure.

1 MR. GAINES: So I'm asking for advice on that.
2 For counsel, in a sense. So there --

3 MR. NANJO: And that's perfectly appropriate.

4 MR. GAINES: There's some interaction in that
5 sense. But I think the way I perceive that is I just
6 want to make sure our office is doing what we're doing
7 in terms of communication in the right way.

8 MR. NANJO: Absolutely.

9 I mean, we have -- you have the Legal
10 Department. You have the Property Tax Department who's
11 there to help ensure that the information that you're
12 presenting is accurate and doesn't have any issues.
13 That's perfectly acceptable.

14 Essentially, what the government code and the
15 legislation talked about was to the extent that the
16 Board Members have communication and outreach
17 activities, that's your communication and outreach
18 activities, and it's done with your own staff.

19 To the extent that the department or agency
20 has communication and outreach activities, those are
21 done with the department and their own staff. And
22 basically it's two separate bodies, if you will.

23 MR. GAINES: Right. Okay. And we can seek
24 legal advice from you in terms of --

25 MR. NANJO: Absolutely.

1 MR. GAINES: -- how we're communicating as our
2 own office?

3 MR. NANJO: Absolutely.

4 MR. GAINES: Yeah. Okay.

5 MS. STOWERS: I also want to add, although
6 there's a separation, the material the agency
7 produced --

8 MR. GAINES: Right.

9 MR. NANJO: -- can be shared.

10 MS. STOWERS: -- should be. And it is shared.
11 And you guys do use it. And that's why I said continue
12 to leverage on this material.

13 I'm not sure -- and in the motion, if that was
14 the intent of Chair Cohen, is to continue to leverage on
15 what we have, or if you were looking for agency staff to
16 play a more active role.

17 MS. COHEN: No, I wasn't looking for agency
18 staff.

19 MS. STOWERS: Okay.

20 MS. COHEN: Quite honestly, we as a Board have
21 dealt with this issue already. You have been on the
22 record. We've addressed this. The law doesn't prohibit
23 the agency and the Board Members to work together. I'm
24 not looking to overstep the boundaries of the law.

25 MS. STOWERS: Okay. I didn't think so. I

1 just wanted to hear you say it.

2 MS. COHEN: I understand. I understand.

3 But this is just for my colleagues to bring
4 them an additional layer of comfort.

5 MR. GAINES: Okay.

6 MS. COHEN: Mr. Schaefer, hold on. I have to
7 recognize Mr. Vazquez. And then I'll get back to you.

8 Yes.

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Along those same lines, I think
10 it's a great idea. And I hear the caution, I guess from
11 our Legal Department, that we've got to be careful that
12 we don't mix the two and put, in this case, I guess, our
13 own individual districts, for example, demanding your
14 services for some of the community outreach stuff.

15 And I agree that I think we should do it. And
16 I think a lot of us are trying to do the best we can.
17 But I think if somehow maybe in that motion incorporate
18 that we all -- I believe we all -- are on the same page,
19 and there's a consensus here, that given the surplus
20 that's sitting in the government's -- or our Governor's
21 office, that we push for more staffing.

22 Because, I mean, we all represent ten million
23 people. And I've been trying to do as much outreach,
24 you know, in my district. But it's difficult. You
25 know, we're very limited. That's why I think a lot of

1 times there's frustration, and we're usually looking to
2 the BOE staff to provide help.

3 So I don't know if there's some way to
4 incorporate that. Because if you think it's going to
5 happen with just our current staffing, it's not going to
6 happen. We don't have the resources.

7 MS. COHEN: So let's -- we're going to take
8 our first steps first. We have to create the framework
9 first.

10 And I think what you're describing is a
11 separate action. Something that we can certainly
12 consider. We can consider it next month.

13 What we're doing here today is formally --
14 formally coming together and saying this is a Work
15 Group, and this is an area that we want to be able to
16 come together and talk about -- talk about items. Not
17 specific items. We haven't noticed anything to the
18 public just yet. But this is a Work Group just on
19 communications and outreach.

20 And the reason why I'm proposing this as a
21 Work Group is because, yes, we can individually work on
22 our own. But, just like the hand, right, we have
23 individual fingers, but we can be a lot more stronger if
24 we were able to collectively bring our resource -- pull
25 ourselves together, pull our thoughts together.

1 That doesn't restrict you from talking
2 individually to your constituents. Because I'm sure you
3 communicate different things. As a matter of fact, I
4 read your stuff, you communicate different things than
5 what I would communicate to my constituents.

6 So I'm not -- this is not supplanting or
7 substituting anything.

8 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

9 MS. COHEN: This is an additional tool for us
10 as a body to be able to talk collectively, and most
11 importantly, legally, with full transparency.

12 So we have to notice to the public that we're
13 going to come together, these are the things we're going
14 to talk about.

15 So this -- what I'm proposing is a framework
16 that just, I think, enhances our efforts to, if we want
17 to use it, we can. If we don't use it, that's
18 completely fine.

19 I want to take Mr. Schaefer.

20 MR. SCHAEFER: I would withdraw my second on
21 it. I was really interested in promoting discussion on
22 the matter, which we have done. And you now have a
23 chance to modify it if you'd like.

24 But our office, from what -- where we are
25 right now, are not in support of it.

1 MS. COHEN: Okay. Got you.
2 Mr. Gaines.
3 MR. GAINES: Yeah. So I'm just trying to
4 clarify what we're doing.
5 MS. COHEN: Yes.
6 MR. GAINES: And so the motion is to create a
7 workshop environment.
8 MS. COHEN: Work Group.
9 MR. GAINES: Work Group that we can call when
10 we want to, and put on the agenda.
11 MS. COHEN: That is correct.
12 MR. GAINES: Okay. And that Work Group would
13 be communications and outreach.
14 MS. COHEN: Correct.
15 MR. GAINES: And would give us an ability to
16 collaborate or share --
17 MS. COHEN: Correct.
18 MR. GAINES: -- ideas in terms of what each of
19 our offices are doing, and to do that in a public
20 setting.
21 MS. COHEN: That's correct.
22 MR. GAINES: Okay. And then we could get
23 advice from legal counsel or from --
24 MS. COHEN: They're part of the Work Group.
25 So they'll be present. Just like they're present today.

1 MR. GAINES: Right. Okay. Sounds good.

2 MS. COHEN: Okay. Looks like we're okay.

3 May I have a second? The second I originally
4 had was withdrawn.

5 May I have a second for that motion?

6 MR. GAINES: I'll second that.

7 MS. COHEN: Thank you, Mr. Gaines. I
8 appreciate that.

9 Seeing that there is no further discussion,
10 let's call the roll.

11 Thank you.

12 Ms. Cichetti.

13 Oh, wait. I'm sorry. Ms. Julia has a
14 question.

15 MS. CICHETTI: We're going to go to public
16 comment first before we go to --

17 MS. STOWERS: Before you go to public comment,
18 Madam Chair.

19 MS. COHEN: Yes.

20 MS. STOWERS: I understand your motion. It's
21 a standing Work Group.

22 MS. COHEN: Correct.

23 MS. STOWERS: I'm not sure if this motion
24 passed, if it's the desire of the Board to convene this
25 Work Group within the next 93 months. If it is, I just

1 want to highlight that it would be an open meeting,
2 subject to Bagley-Keene, as you said. And I have to
3 consider Board Proceedings in their capacity to
4 facilitate another Work Group, as we are concluding our
5 Work Group for affordable housing, and as we are moving
6 into appeals season.

7 MS. COHEN: Yeah. We'll work together on the
8 details. I appreciate you speaking that into the
9 record. But we're not --

10 MS. STOWERS: You're not there yet.

11 I just wanted to say that.

12 MS. COHEN: I don't have a secret agenda that
13 I'm pushing. I'm, again, really, one of the things that
14 I've been really focused on is just creating the
15 infrastructure in place, so that we have a space to talk
16 to each other that is fully transparent.

17 So we will continue to work together and to
18 take into consideration. Because your staff is working,
19 our staff is working, other offices are working. So I
20 think that Mr. Vazquez has made it very clear that we
21 need additional staff. But that is --

22 MS. STOWERS: That's a separate issue.

23 MS. COHEN: -- a separate issue.

24 So now there's a second. A motion has been
25 made. We're going to take public comment, and then

1 we're going to take action on the motion.

2 MS. CICHETTI: Yes.

3 MS. COHEN: All right. Let's go to public
4 comment.

5 MS. CICHETTI: AT&T moderator, please let us
6 know if there is anyone on the line who would like to
7 make a public comment regarding this item.

8 AT&T MODERATOR: Ladies and gentlemen, if you
9 wish to make a public comment, you may press one, then
10 zero at this time.

11 And it will be just a moment for our first
12 comment.

13 And at this time, there's no one in queue.

14 MS. COHEN: Thank you. I appreciate that.

15 So let's go to -- oh, Mr. Vazquez.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: Just one more of a point of
17 clarification. And I think Ms. Stowers kind of hit it
18 on the nail.

19 So it's obviously your intentions to create
20 this mechanism that we may or may not be able to use the
21 next, I guess, 90 days, depending on the workload of
22 staff; is that correct?

23 MS. COHEN: No. What I was -- what I was
24 doing is create -- I don't know what the staff's
25 workload is. And I don't know what we want to talk

1 about. So I don't -- we're creating the infrastructure.
2 I don't know.

3 If we're discussing an item and she says, "You
4 know what, that's really burdensome. I don't know if we
5 can get to that this month. Maybe next month."

6 So the point that I'm making is that it would
7 be -- we would be talking about it. Just like we talk
8 about when we add some things to the agenda. So --

9 MS. STOWERS: So if I may, if the motion
10 passes, it's a standing Work Group. So as a standing
11 Work Group, I am assuming this would be an item on our
12 Public Agenda Notice.

13 MS. COHEN: Correct.

14 MS. STOWERS: And then when the group is being
15 convened, it is convened.

16 MS. COHEN: Correct.

17 MS. STOWERS: So we would have to take some
18 steps on our side. But that's not a major issue at all.

19 MS. COHEN: Right. I think the steps on your
20 side in terms of just adding it to the agenda item.

21 MS. STOWERS: Yeah. We can handle that.

22 MS. COHEN: Exactly. Got that.

23 MR. NANJO: And, Chair Cohen, I'm sorry to
24 interrupt. But I don't know if you wanted to discuss
25 this at this point or not, but pursuant to the Board's

1 Work Group Charter that this Board has adopted, in
2 forming a work group according to the charter, you're
3 supposed to include the meeting plan per the charter.

4 I don't know if you want to just kind of put a
5 pin in that, and do that at your next discussion of this
6 work group. But, typically, the charter talks about the
7 whole meeting plan and having a little bit more meat, if
8 you will, to the formation of the charter, the work
9 group, I should say.

10 So I just bring that to your attention as a
11 reminder.

12 MS. COHEN: Thank you very much.

13 Is there precedent for establishing a work
14 group without the work plan? Because I -- this is new
15 information to me.

16 MR. NANJO: So the charter that the Board
17 adopted talks about non -- when you form the work group,
18 also having a meeting plan, and having a little bit more
19 scope attached with the motion in starting a work group.

20 So this would be a departure from your work
21 group charter, which obviously the Board can do on a
22 vote. It's just -- I'm, again, bringing it to your
23 attention.

24 MS. COHEN: Thank you. I appreciate that.

25 Then let's table this item, and we'll bring it

1 back next month.

2 MR. NANJO: Okay. Thank you.

3 MS. COHEN: Or maybe even tomorrow. I don't
4 know. We'll see. We'll see how quickly we can pull our
5 stuff together.

6 So we're going to adjourn this meeting. Not
7 adjourn. But we're going to recess this meeting.

8 MR. NANJO: Right.

9 MS. COHEN: And so let's leave it open and
10 possibly bring it back for discussion tomorrow.

11 MR. NANJO: Great.

12 The other thing -- I'm sorry. My apologies.
13 I was a little slow on the draw.

14 I noticed that you did not do public comment
15 for the approval of the minutes. And that's typically
16 what the Board does.

17 So what I would suggest is we make a call for
18 public comments at this point in time. If we have a
19 public comment, we can then retake the vote. If we have
20 no public comments, then the vote should be fine.

21 MS. COHEN: Great.

22 So what we can do is take public comment on
23 the minutes, simultaneously, as we take public comment
24 on this item.

25 MR. NANJO: I think we already took public

1 comment on this item, so we're good to go with the
2 minutes.

3 MS. COHEN: Okay. So then before we go to the
4 next item, let's take -- open up for public comment for
5 the first item on the agenda, which was the approval of
6 the minutes.

7 MS. CICHETTI: I apologize for missing the
8 public comment on the minutes.

9 Let's go to the AT&T moderator.

10 Can you please let us know if there is anyone
11 on the line who'd like to make a public comment
12 regarding item J1, Approval of the Board Minutes.

13 AT&T OPERATOR: Once again, if you'd like to
14 make a public comment, you may press one, and then zero
15 at this time.

16 And I'm seeing no one in queue.

17 MS. COHEN: All right. Thank you very much.

18 MR. NANJO: And that means the vote should be
19 fine.

20 So thank you very much, Chair, Members of the
21 Board.

22 MS. COHEN: All right.

23 Please, let's call the next item.

24 MS. CICHETTI: The next item on the agenda is
25 K1B, Executive Director's Report, Approval of the 2023

1 Board Workload Plan.

2 The plan consists of the 2023 Board Meeting
3 calendar, annual property tax calendar, and significant
4 dates considered in setting Board Meeting dates.

5 This item is presented by Ms. Stowers.

6 MS. STOWERS: Thank you.

7 Actually, I'm still on K1a.

8 MS. COHEN: Okay.

9 MS. CICHETTI: Okay.

10 MS. STOWERS: Told you I was going to be up
11 here a while.

12 Before we go to the K1b, I also wanted to
13 report out on the 3rd item, which is the assessment
14 practices survey program.

15 Members, as you know, when assessment practice
16 surveys are completed, the surveys are issued to various
17 parties, as required by statute, as well as to the
18 public, as they are part of our letters to assessors,
19 and they're also placed on our website.

20 Also, many of our stakeholders announced in
21 their newsletters the results of an assessment practice
22 survey.

23 Finally, the current five-year cycle of
24 scheduled surveys is included in the Board's 2023 Annual
25 Work Plan, and is available on our website.

1 A little history, in 2014, we launched a web
2 page dedicated to the information about the assessment
3 practices survey program. The web page was developed in
4 consultation with the California Assessors' Association
5 to provide greater transparency about the survey
6 program.

7 The web page includes the scope of the review
8 of a survey, the authority and citations for the review,
9 again, the letters to assessors, common recommendations
10 per topic, and historical recommendations going back to
11 1998, the assessment practice survey topics, which are
12 as described in this web page, includes administration
13 issues, such as appeals, forms, and staffing. It also
14 includes real property issues, such as change of
15 ownership and decline in value.

16 And, finally, it includes personal property in
17 fixtures such as aircrafts, property statements, and
18 business property valuation.

19 In addition to this web page, it is important
20 to note that the agency staff evaluates the surveys to
21 determine the need for additional training for the
22 assessor's staff, the need for redesign or a new
23 property tax form, the need for possible legislative
24 changes to address an issue and identify emerging
25 issues.

1 At the December 2020 Board Meeting, as part of
2 Chair Cohen's L Item, the Board directed the
3 Executive Director to look into the feasibility of
4 placing LTAs, including surveys, on the Board agenda.

5 As a result, beginning in 2021, we began
6 placing all LTAs, including assessment practice surveys,
7 on the Board's agenda under the Property Tax Deputy
8 Director's Report, where the Chief of the
9 County-Assessed Properties Division reports out on these
10 LTAs.

11 This provides the Board the opportunity to
12 have discussion on any of the items, recognizing that
13 there may be a need to provide additional sunlight on
14 the assessment practice survey program.

15 Staff will be having a meeting with the
16 California Assessment Practice Surveys Subcommittee to
17 discuss how we can do more within our Board agenda of
18 providing more information.

19 Members, that concludes my presentation on the
20 assessment practice survey program. I'm available for
21 any questions or comments.

22 MS. COHEN: Great.

23 Thank you very much for the update. I
24 appreciate you bringing this matter before the Board.

25 The information you provided today is very

1 helpful and gives us something to consider.

2 Let me see if there's anyone else.

3 Any other -- no?

4 Okay. Thank you.

5 Ms. Stowers, that concludes your presentation?

6 MS. STOWERS: I now have K1b.

7 MS. COHEN: Okay.

8 MS. STOWERS: That is the Board Workload Plan
9 for 2023.

10 MS. COHEN: Okay.

11 MS. STOWERS: Okay. I will go ahead.

12

13 **ITEM K1b**

14

15 MS. STOWERS: Next, I'm presenting to you for
16 your consideration the 2023 Board Workload Plan.

17 The Board Workload Plan contains the proposed
18 Board Meeting calendar for 2023, based upon statutory
19 timeframes and deadlines.

20 It also includes the 2023 property tax
21 calendar, and other significant dates for your reference
22 and planning.

23 This item is presented for Board discussion
24 and consideration. The Board's adoption of the workload
25 plan before you today will allow staff to prepare the

1 2023 calendar of regular Board Meeting dates.

2 Then, if the Board would like to schedule
3 additional meetings, the 2023 Board Workload Plan can be
4 updated accordingly.

5 Members, I now ask for your adoption of the
6 2023 Board Workload Plan.

7 Thank you.

8 MS. COHEN: Of course.

9 I think Mr. Vazquez has something.

10 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes.

11 In looking at it, I'm comfortable with it. I
12 was just -- my only question, I guess, on the -- you
13 know, you have the projected dates for our meetings for
14 2023?

15 MS. STOWERS: Yes.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: If we were to tweak those, those
17 still could happen, you know, two or three months out,
18 right?

19 MS. STOWERS: Yes, it can happen two or three
20 months out, based on the Board's pleasure.

21 MR. VAZQUEZ: Okay.

22 MS. STOWERS: What we would normally do, let's
23 say a Member decides -- would like to have an additional
24 day, or would like to have --

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: Or changes the date.

1 MS. STOWERS: -- another topic or something,
2 we would just confirm everyone's availability, and, of
3 course, take the necessary steps to secure the
4 auditorium.

5 But there is flexibility in the dates and the
6 topics, except for the ones that we have to do by
7 statutory deadline.

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Right. Right. I am good with
9 the rest.

10 MS. COHEN: Okay. Good.

11 Anyone on my left? Any questions or comments?

12 No? Okay.

13 MR. VAZQUEZ: Need a motion for that?

14 MS. COHEN: Yes, but we'll --

15 MR. VAZQUEZ: Oh, I'm sorry.

16 MS. COHEN: That's okay.

17 We're going to take public comment, I think,
18 on both those last two items. We didn't take public
19 comment on the first one.

20 MS. STOWERS: I don't think so.

21 MS. COHEN: About the quarterly reports.

22 And so I wanted to close out that conversation
23 very quickly, and just reiterate that placing quarterly
24 reports on the agenda is something that I'd like to move
25 forward in practice that we do.

1 The assessment practice surveys, just bring
2 them to us so that we can discuss them, review them, if
3 there are any questions.

4 And I'd like for the quarterly reports to be
5 presented to the Board in the form of the assessment
6 practice surveys.

7 Is that -- am I clear?

8 MS. STOWERS: I think you're clear.

9 Basically you're asking that -- have more
10 discussion about the surveys, themselves? Highlight the
11 surveys --

12 MS. COHEN: More light. More transparency,
13 right?

14 If it warrants questions or more discussion,
15 then we'll go there. If not, then we obviously won't
16 take up the issue.

17 MS. STOWERS: Okay.

18 Let me work on how we can do that. I do want
19 to note that they're not necessarily completed on a
20 quarterly basis.

21 MS. COHEN: So are they -- I understand.

22 So can we -- can we gather what is completed
23 that is in the first quarter, present. Gather what you
24 have completed in the second quarter, and present them.
25 They don't have to necessarily be inseminated.

1 Does that make sense?

2 So maybe in the first quarter you have three,
3 and in the second quarter you have two.

4 MS. STOWERS: I understand that.

5 MS. COHEN: Okay.

6 MS. STOWERS: I think it might be more
7 efficient if we did it six months, because of the time
8 it takes to complete the surveys.

9 We can clearly present like a catch-up at some
10 point. Let's say January we can do an overview of the
11 completed surveys. And I don't think we need to go back
12 to 1998.

13 MS. COHEN: No, we don't need to go back to
14 1998.

15 MS. STOWERS: We can -- let's just stick with
16 current. And say these are the surveys, these are the
17 recommendations that we found. Maybe there was an
18 emerging issue. This was the emerging issue we saw.
19 This is the steps that we took to address it.

20 MS. COHEN: Mm-hm. I think so.

21 So, just, colleagues, just as a reminder, I
22 mean, the assessment surveys are important. Because
23 what it is, it's like an audit tool that the Board of
24 Equalization conducts randomly selected counties to help
25 them with -- to help them, period.

1 I don't know. There may be some issues.

2 There may not be any issues.

3 Ms. Stowers, you're right. I don't want to go
4 back to 1998. Is it possible to go back to maybe when
5 this Board began, three years?

6 Before you answer that, before you start
7 sweating, we can work together on exactly.

8 Because what we could possibly do is start
9 within the last six years -- six months, and then work
10 back to January, or the beginning of 2019. As opposed
11 to marshalling them all together, putting together a
12 presentation, and then bringing it back to us to the
13 Board of Equalization. I have some flexibility.

14 What I'm just looking to do now is just to
15 create, again, more transparency on the work that we're
16 doing here on the Board. And so those surveys are
17 really important tools. Few people know.

18 And the way in my mind -- the reason why I
19 like to bring this, you know, public, is just, again, as
20 an opportunity for the public to know what we're doing.
21 When I'm thinking about our outreach, when I'm thinking
22 about communicating our brand, communicating our value
23 add to the state of California.

24 It's making sure that people understand the
25 work that we're doing. What we've done, why we're doing

1 it, and how we do it.

2 So I don't want to be specific on -- I don't
3 want to focus on specific counties. I just simply want
4 to highlight best practices. That's it.

5 I want to understand the gaps in technology
6 and staffing. Because I think that bolsters our
7 budgetary arguments when we need -- when we go and make
8 a request for more money for technology that we've done
9 successfully on behalf of the counties, county
10 assessors.

11 So I want to be able to identify emerging
12 issues. These assessment survey practices can flag
13 emerging issues.

14 And also it gives us an opportunity to study
15 lessons learned.

16 So that's just -- I just wanted to give you a
17 little bit more insight into my thinking, my rationale.

18 And, colleagues, just so you know where --
19 where I'm trying to guide this body.

20 And, again, so that is my intent. And we will
21 work together. We will have flexibility.

22 I'm not looking to overburden. Although, I
23 will say, we have done a great job of hiring up and
24 staffing. But I don't want anyone to feel uncomfortable
25 about what I'm proposing. So I'm happy to articulate

1 anymore or answer any kind of -- any other questions.

2 Looks like Mr. Gaines has a question.

3 MR. GAINES: Just a comment.

4 MS. COHEN: Or a comment.

5 MR. GAINES: I think it's a great idea. Just
6 in terms of, you know, people ask us, what do we do at
7 the BOE. And I think one of the key roles is that we
8 audit. We do surveys, right, of the 58 county
9 assessors.

10 But that's about all -- all we ever hear,
11 right, is that the organization does it. But I never
12 really know what the net result is, or I just think it
13 would be nice for our constituents to know what's
14 happening at their assessor's office in their particular
15 county.

16 Because we do these things, and they go to the
17 assessor, and they go to the Board of Supervisors. But
18 maybe the Board of Supervisors doesn't bring it up.
19 Assessor has it, so they use it for their own personal,
20 or their use internally. Which is good. But it would
21 be nice for us to have some sort of oversight or review.

22 So it would be nice to know what are the
23 issues in particular counties? Is there a trend where a
24 lot of counties have the same problems?

25 MS. COHEN: So that is what I'm looking, like,

1 for big themes. And also the Board of Supervisors,
2 every county is unique, right?

3 MR. GAINES: Right.

4 MS. COHEN: So they may have capacity. They
5 may post it. They may not post it. But it's like an
6 additional -- it's a layer.

7 MR. GAINES: Right.

8 MS. COHEN: It's another layer of transparency
9 of the work that we're doing.

10 MR. GAINES: Right.

11 MS. COHEN: And I want to see -- and that's
12 pretty much it.

13 I see a love note was passed.

14 MS. STOWERS: Yes. Yes, a note was passed.
15 And I think I covered it.

16 I appreciate what you guys are saying. It's
17 just more to do -- have more discussion on the surveys.

18 What are the trends? What are the emerging
19 issues?

20 And you're not asking for it to go back to the
21 beginning of time.

22 MS. COHEN: No.

23 MS. STOWERS: And you're not asking to pull
24 the trigger tomorrow. Just take some time and plan it
25 out, so that we can have this discussion.

1 MS. COHEN: That's correct.

2 And more so what is most important to me is
3 that we establish it moving forward into the future.

4 MS. STOWERS: Okay.

5 MS. COHEN: And, again, these are really -- we
6 know the Board of Equalization staff spends a tremendous
7 amount of time and energy on this part of our business.
8 And we should be highlighting it and sharing it publicly
9 about what we're learning from the assessment surveys.

10 MS. STOWERS: I will -- I will work on that.

11 You're absolutely right. They are compliance
12 audits. They are critical. That's one of our key
13 functions. We use the term survey. But they're audits.

14 MS. COHEN: Yes, they are.

15 MS. STOWERS: And we have some really
16 experienced and qualified appraiser auditors. They have
17 valuation experience, and they have audit experience.
18 And they're the ones that are carrying out this work.
19 And I'm sure they would love to share.

20 So we will work on how we can push it out
21 more --

22 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

23 MS. STOWERS: -- in a public meeting.

24 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

25 And, again, I want to just reiterate, I don't

1 want any fear or intimidation. I'm not looking -- we
2 don't have to go back to 1998, to stick with the
3 example. And even flexibility. I threw out a number
4 going back, a date going back to just when this body
5 started. But my main priority really is moving forward.

6 MS. STOWERS: Moving forward, yeah.

7 MS. COHEN: Moving forward. Okay.

8 MS. STOWERS: I will work on that.

9 And although we do do some report out, it's
10 not as detailed. So we will expand on that.

11 And thank you.

12 MS. COHEN: Yes.

13 And I want to highlight something that
14 Mr. Vazquez said earlier about the staffing gap.

15 That staffing gap you'll also see in our
16 county assessor's office, which the assessment surveys,
17 these audit tools catch, and they have been catching.

18 And so our job in terms of providing oversight
19 and guidance and direction for the 58 county assessors
20 is to also advocate on their behalf.

21 So just like we are feeling the pinch on
22 reduced staffing levels, so are our assessors. And it
23 is impeding on them doing their annual -- their
24 business.

25 So this is just almost like another -- another

1 affirming what you said, but it would bolster the
2 argument when we go to ask for additional revenue.

3 And I'm just sticking with the example. I'm
4 not saying that we need more staffing, or we plan to go
5 ask for it. We're not advocating that. That was just
6 the example that was given, that I just wanted to
7 highlight how and connect the dots how the assessment
8 surveys filter into exactly what you're saying, to what
9 we are experiencing on an individual level.

10 So instead of -- taking it from a microlevel
11 and bringing it up to a macrolevel and elevating that.

12 So, yes, Ms. Stowers.

13 MS. STOWERS: Great conversation.

14 So that there's no misunderstanding, will you
15 make a motion, please. Or did you already?

16 MS. COHEN: Sure. A motion --

17 MS. STOWERS: To --

18 MS. COHEN: Okay. All right. I got it. Yes.

19 I will make a motion to adopt the staff
20 recommendation.

21 Maybe you can reiterate it.

22 MS. STOWERS: I'm sorry. We're talking so
23 many different items.

24 MS. COHEN: I know.

25 MS. STOWERS: Well, we do need to -- we have

1 not approved the workload calendar yet. So we need a
2 motion for that.

3 And I'm also asking for a motion with respect
4 to --

5 MS. COHEN: The assessment surveys.

6 MS. STOWERS: -- surveys. Yes.

7 MS. COHEN: All right. Sure.

8 So what I'd like to do, in terms of -- okay.

9 I'll make a motion to ask staff to bring the
10 assessment surveys to the -- or I'll make a motion to
11 recommend that quarterly agenda items be placed on the
12 Board agenda.

13 Broad.

14 And within that, it is understood that
15 assessment surveys will fall into that category.

16 MS. STOWERS: Okay.

17 MS. COHEN: Quarterly agenda items be placed
18 on the Board agenda for assessment practice surveys.

19 That is my motion.

20 MR. GAINES: Second.

21 MS. COHEN: Okay. I heard surround sound in
22 my second. But I think I heard Gaines first.

23 So I'm going to acknowledge the second made by
24 Senator Gaines.

25 And let's take public comment on this one, and

1 then we'll go back to the calendar.

2 MS. CICHETTI: AT&T moderator, could you
3 please let us know if anyone's on the line who would
4 like to make a comment regarding the assessment
5 practices motion.

6 AT&T MODERATOR: Ladies and gentlemen, if
7 you'd like to make a public comment, you may press one,
8 then zero.

9 And there's no one in queue.

10 MS. COHEN: Thank you very much.

11 All right. Let's take a vote on this, please.

12 MS. CICHETTI: Yes.

13 Chair Cohen.

14 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

15 Yes.

16 MS. CICHETTI: Vice Chair Schaefer.

17 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

18 MS. CICHETTI: Member Gaines.

19 MR. GAINES: Aye.

20 MS. CICHETTI: Member Vazquez.

21 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

22 MS. CICHETTI: Deputy Controller Epolite.

23 MR. EPOLITE: Aye.

24 MS. COHEN: All right. Sounds like this
25 motion passes unanimously.

1 Thank you.

2 All right. Ms. Stowers, one more item before
3 us. Okay.

4 MS. STOWERS: The workload plan.

5 MS. COHEN: Excuse me?

6 MS. STOWERS: The workload plan.

7 MS. COHEN: The workload plan.

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Staff recommendation on the
9 workload plan.

10 MS. COHEN: I'll make a motion to accept the
11 staff recommendation on the workload plan.

12 One caveat. I don't recall if we took public
13 comment on this or not.

14 MS. CICHETTI: No. We're going to have to do
15 that.

16 MS. COHEN: All right. Let's take public
17 comment before we take up the vote.

18 MS. CICHETTI: AT&T moderator, would you let
19 us know if there is anyone on the line who would like to
20 make a public comment regarding the Board Workload Plan.

21 AT&T MODERATOR: Once again, if you'd like to
22 make a public comment, you may press one, then zero.

23 At this time, there's no one in queue.

24 MS. COHEN: All right. Thank you very much.

25 So the motion has been made to accept -- a

1 motion has been made and second.

2 I just want to call for the record that
3 Mr. Epolite is going to be abstaining from this
4 particular vote.

5 And, Ms. Cichetti, if you can call the roll.

6 MS. CICHETTI: Yes. Can you -- who was the
7 second on this motion?

8 MS. COHEN: It was Mr. Senator Gaines.

9 MS. CICHETTI: Okay. Just wanted that for the
10 record. Thank you.

11 Chair Cohen.

12 MS. COHEN: Aye.

13 MS. CICHETTI: Vice Chair Schaefer.

14 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

15 MS. CICHETTI: Member Gaines.

16 MR. GAINES: Aye.

17 MS. CICHETTI: Member Vazquez.

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

19 MS. CICHETTI: Deputy Controller Epolite.

20 MR. EPOLITE: Abstain.

21 MS. COHEN: All right. Thank you.

22 Motion passes.

23 Ms. Stowers, thank you very much for the
24 presentation.

25 All right. Let's stick with the agenda and

1 continue to move forward.

2

3

ITEM K1c

4

5 MS. CICHETTI: All right.

6

7 The next item on the agenda is K1c,
8 Executive Director's Report: Operational Priorities;
9 Report on the status of the operational priorities of
10 the agency.

11 This matter will be presented by Ms. Renati.

12

13 MS. RENATI: Good morning, Chair Cohen and
14 Honorable Members.

15

16 My name is Lisa Renati. I'm Chief Deputy
17 Director.

18

19 Today I'll report on some of the agency's
20 operational priorities and projects.

21

22 The first item is our recruitment. Since the
23 last report to the Board, we have filled six positions,
24 three promotions of internal candidates, and three
25 positions were filled with professionals new to state
26 service.

27

28 Our remaining vacancies are in active
29 recruitment, and we continue to make meaningful progress
30 in our goal to reduce vacancies using merit-hiring
31 principles.

1 The next item is our strategic goal regarding
2 workforce development. Now that we've made solid
3 progress in filling key positions and reducing our
4 vacancies, we are working towards developing and
5 implementing succession plans for essential roles and
6 subject matter areas to ensure the continuity of
7 knowledge and to create a culture of professional growth
8 and development.

9 Members, as you know, the BOE, at BOE, we're a
10 specialized group of property tax experts. We must be
11 strategic in the way we bring in and grow our talent.

12 To be proficient, we know it takes time and
13 experience to develop the property tax expertise that
14 the state local governments and stakeholders rely on.

15 As we bring on new staff and as we promote
16 staff into positions of greater responsibility, we must
17 provide staff with tools needed to successfully perform
18 and grow in their roles.

19 In addition to our traditional coursework and
20 training, we are holding weekly team meetings, we are
21 fostering mentor/mentee relationships. We are
22 cross-training staff on multiple functions. We are
23 including multilevel staff and managers in planning
24 sessions, which allows everyone a seat at the table to
25 contribute and learn. And we are providing practical

1 experience with an intentional focus on knowledge
2 transfer and succession planning.

3 The management team is committed to these
4 efforts so that we may develop the next generation and
5 also to develop the next experts for property tax
6 administration and management.

7 This concludes my presentation on the agency's
8 day-to-day operational priorities. And I'm available to
9 answer any questions.

10 MS. COHEN: Thank you very much.

11 Colleagues, questions?

12 MR. GAINES: I do, if I could.

13 MS. COHEN: Please. Mr. Gaines.

14 MR. GAINES: Great. Thank you.

15 So we hired -- okay. So we promoted three
16 from within, and then we hired three from the outside?

17 MS. RENATI: Correct.

18 MR. GAINES: Did we have any retirements?

19 MS. RENATI: Not as of this past two months.

20 MR. GAINES: Okay.

21 MS. RENATI: Well, I don't have that in front
22 of me. I don't believe so.

23 MR. GAINES: Okay. Great.

24 And I'm not sure if this is the right term,
25 but our vacant positions are declining, right?

1 MS. RENATI: They are.

2 Incrementally, they are declining. We've
3 had -- you know, when you have a promotion in house,
4 that creates another vacancy.

5 MR. GAINES: Right.

6 MS. RENATI: So you have to just look at the
7 new hires coming in.

8 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

9 MS. RENATI: So we are down considerably from
10 where we were, especially two years ago.

11 MR. GAINES: Great. Excellent.

12 Good job. Thank you.

13 MS. RENATI: Thank you.

14 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

15 Mr. Vazquez.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you for that update.

17 And now that, I guess, there's been a shift,
18 right? Now that the priorities have shifted to
19 succession planning and workforce development and
20 knowledge transfer, could you give us a brief outline on
21 what those processes entail?

22 MS. RENATI: Well, as I described, we are
23 working -- in addition to our regular intensive
24 training, and making sure all of our staff have the
25 coursework needed and get the certificate needed --

1 certification needed, we are doing more meetings.

2 We are -- we have weekly meetings with the
3 management, staff -- management and staff. Weekly
4 meetings with managers, weekly meetings with executive
5 staff.

6 So we're constantly having -- I know it seems
7 like a lot of meetings. But through that in person and
8 also in sometimes hybrid collaboration, you're having
9 more and more people listen to what's going on.

10 It's difficult when everyone was hybrid to try
11 to do that. And now that we are doing this -- really
12 doing a focus on it, we're having more people at the
13 table. And I bring that up, because if it's just
14 Ms. Stowers, Henry and I in a room deciding what's going
15 to be done, it doesn't really translate to getting all
16 the good ideas.

17 We're bringing new people into the room.
18 We're bringing new managers, new supervisors into the
19 room and asking their opinion.

20 Same thing is going on within the department.
21 That knowledge transfer, that ability to bring new ideas
22 to the table, the idea -- the process improvement
23 project that we've been talking about for the last year
24 also works in that. Because as you do process
25 improvement, you break down the processes, figure out

1 how you're doing things, and how to make it better.
2 That trains all your new staff of why do we do things,
3 how can we do it better. So that's a couple of
4 examples.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

6 MR. SCHAEFER: Ms. Renati, what I'm hearing is
7 that you're no longer doing virtual meetings. We've
8 gone back to face to face.

9 MS. RENATI: We're doing hybrid.

10 Some of our meetings are completely in person,
11 which is kind of fun to do when you haven't seen people
12 for a few years. Some are hybrid, and some are
13 completely virtual.

14 It's just hard to coordinate schedules of
15 everyone when not everyone has the same days in the
16 office.

17 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

18 Let's take public comment.

19 MS. CICHETTI: Ms. Renati has one other item
20 we're going to take up before we go to public comment.

21 MS. COHEN: Okay. Thank you.

22

23 **ITEM K1d**

24

25 MS. CICHETTI: K1d, Executive Director's

1 Report, Prop. 19 Implementation Project: Report on the
2 status of the agency's Proposition 19 Implementation
3 Project.

4 Presented by Ms. Renati.

5 MS. RENATI: Thank you.

6 Again, I'm Lisa Renati, Chief Deputy Director.

7 Today I'll provide an update on our
8 Proposition 19 Implementation Project.

9 A high-level implementation plan is attached
10 to today's agenda. This plan includes seven identified
11 work categories needed to implement Prop. 19, and a
12 high-level description of associated activities within
13 each category.

14 I'm happy to report that the status of
15 BOE's Implementation Project is green. That means no
16 issues to report.

17 The BOE has a dedicated web page regarding
18 Prop. 19, which can be accessed through our home page.
19 The web page includes guidance, frequently asked
20 questions, and related legislation, in addition to other
21 resources to assist taxpayers.

22 As of September 26th, our Prop. 19 web page
23 has received approximately 383,000 unique external page
24 views since we launched the page in November 2020. This
25 includes an additional 28,100 unique external page views

1 for the two-month period of August and September.

2 This concludes my presentation on this topic.
3 I'm available to answer any questions you may have.

4 MS. COHEN: Thank you. I have no questions.

5 Colleagues, do any of you have any questions?

6 MR. GAINES: I do, if I could.

7 MS. COHEN: Yes, please.

8 MR. GAINES: Yes. Just in reference to
9 Prop. 19.

10 What are we doing from a staffing standpoint
11 because of the additional workload as a result of
12 Prop. 19?

13 MS. RENATI: When we implemented Prop. 19, we
14 had a lot of vacancies, as you understand. And so we --
15 but when we -- we went through and looked at our -- our
16 plan of how we were going to manage the plan, we were
17 able to use existing positions. And as we fill them,
18 continue to fill existing positions.

19 MR. GAINES: Okay.

20 MS. RENATI: So we didn't have a need for
21 additional staffing. But should another historic
22 Prop. 19-type legislation be passed, we would probably
23 need to find more.

24 MR. GAINES: Okay. All right.

25 So that -- and that need may change in the

1 future, too.

2 Part of my concern is tracking all these
3 properties and the ownership changes. I guess that's
4 happening at primarily -- that's really happening at the
5 local level.

6 MS. RENATI: And I know Dave can speak better
7 to it when he gives his presentation. But we do have
8 technology of our own that we've developed to track our
9 portion of different items.

10 So he can speak much more eloquently than I
11 can on that subject.

12 MR. GAINES: Right.

13 And as long as we, you know, if we've got
14 excess capacity because of the fact that we haven't been
15 fully hired, that's great use --

16 MS. RENATI: Yes. We're very close to being
17 filled.

18 MR. GAINES: -- of those positions.

19 MS. RENATI: We're very close to being filled.
20 We're very close.

21 MR. GAINES: Good. All right.

22 Thank you.

23 MS. COHEN: Mr. Epolite has a question now.

24 MR. EPOLITE: Ms. Renati, are we also able to
25 track how many hits we're getting for the career

1 opportunities link on the homepage as well?

2 MS. RENATI: We would be able to. I don't
3 have that information. But we would be able to do that,
4 yes.

5 MR. EPOLITE: Okay. Thank you.

6 MS. COHEN: All right. Looks like we have no
7 other questions.

8 Thank you for the presentation.

9 Let's go to public comment.

10 MS. CICHETTI: AT&T moderator, can you please
11 find out if there is someone on the line who would like
12 to make a public comment regarding these reports.

13 AT&T MODERATOR: Ladies and gentlemen, if
14 you'd like to make a public comment, you may press one,
15 then zero at this time.

16 At this time, there's no one in queue.

17 MS. COHEN: Thank you very much.

18 Let's call the next item, please.

19 MS. CICHETTI: I'm not sure if we wanted to
20 take a break at this time, or we wanted to continue on.

21 MS. COHEN: I'm happy to take a break.

22 How long do you suggest?

23 MS. CICHETTI: Ten-minute break.

24 MS. COHEN: All right. We'll take a
25 ten-minute break. We'll recess. We will reconvene at

1 11:45.

2 Thank you.

3 (Whereupon a break was taken.)

4 MS. COHEN: All right. Let me call the
5 meeting back into session. Thank you very much.

6 All right, ladies and gentlemen. Let's go
7 ahead and resume on our agenda.

8 I believe, Ms. Cichetti, will you remind us
9 where we are?

10

11

ITEM K2a

12

13 MS. CICHETTI: At the K2 item, where the next
14 item is K2a, The Taxpayers' Rights Advocate Office
15 Report.

16 MS. COHEN: All right. Thank you.

17 MS. CICHETTI: Operational Update; Update on
18 activities of the Taxpayers' Rights Advocate Office,
19 including Prop.19 education outreach, and other matters.

20 This matter will be presented by Ms. Thompson.

21 MS. THOMPSON: Good morning, Chair Cohen and
22 Honorable Members.

23 I'm Lisa Thompson, Chief of the Taxpayers'
24 Rights Advocate.

25 And I'm here to provide you with an update on

1 the activities of the Taxpayers' Rights Advocate Office,
2 as well as Proposition 19 education and outreach.

3 First, I'd like to share with you some
4 statistics on the number of taxpayer cases that were
5 completed by our office last month, and provide some
6 insight on the types of those cases to keep you
7 informed.

8 This month, attached to the Public Agenda
9 Notice is a memorandum from our office to the
10 Executive Director reporting the number of completed
11 cases last month.

12 And it is broken down by Board Member
13 District, as well as within the administrative and
14 valuation categories, and within the topic areas within
15 each of those categories.

16 In August 2022, we completed 18 cases, 6 were
17 in Board Member Gaines' District; 4 in Board Member
18 Cohen's District; 3 in Board Member Vazquez' District,
19 and 5 were in Board Member Schaefer's District.

20 Of the 18 cases, 3 were from the
21 administrative category, and 15 were from the valuation
22 category.

23 The administrative category includes topics
24 such as creating and mailing of tax bills, refund
25 penalty cancellations, defaulted taxes, access to data,

1 special assessments, or direct levies on the property
2 tax bill.

3 The valuation category includes topics such as
4 change in ownership, decline in values, appraisal and
5 methodology, exclusions, exemptions, new construction,
6 actual enrollment of values, general property taxation,
7 and assessment appeals.

8 With respect to the administrative category
9 and its three cases in total, one pertained to
10 delinquent or defaulted taxes, one pertained to
11 penalties, and one involved a tax payment.

12 With respect to the valuation category and its
13 15 cases in total, 4 pertained to the actual enrollment
14 of values, 7 cases pertained to exclusions from
15 reassessment, 3 involved exemptions, and 1 case involved
16 new construction.

17 So that we can provide some additional insight
18 on the specific types of exclusion and exemption cases,
19 I offer this further breakdown:

20 For the 7 cases involving exclusions from
21 reassessment, 1 pertained to the parent-child exclusion,
22 5 pertained to the base year value transfers for persons
23 age 55 and over, and 1 pertained to base year value
24 transfers for a disaster.

25 The parent-child exclusion case fell under

1 prior law, proposition 58, since the transfer occurred
2 before the February 16th, 2021 effective date of
3 Proposition 19's intergenerational transfer provisions.

4 With respect to the 6 pertaining to base year
5 value transfers, 2 occurred during the time of current
6 law of Proposition 19, and 4 were under prior law.

7 One of the cases under prior law involved an
8 intercounty transfer from one county to another.

9 For the 3 exemption cases, 2 pertained to
10 historical aircraft, and 1 pertained to the disabled
11 veterans exemption.

12 To provide additional insight on the nature of
13 those cases that our office works on to assist
14 taxpayers, I offer some additional information on a case
15 our office worked on and how we helped the taxpayer.

16 An example of a case that our office helped
17 resolve involved a taxpayer who had contacted our office
18 because her property had been reassessed after she added
19 her son on title, and she received a supplemental tax
20 bill.

21 The taxpayer didn't understand why the
22 property was reassessed, and said that she had filled
23 out all the necessary forms so the property would not be
24 reappraised.

25 MS. COHEN: So what was the end result?

1 It was not re --

2 MS. THOMPSON: It was reassessed by the
3 assessor's office.

4 MS. COHEN: It was reassessed.

5 MS. THOMPSON: So we helped her understand,
6 after analyzing why.

7 So we look into specific reasons of why it was
8 reassessed, and help them understand why that is.

9 So as part of that analysis, we talked with
10 the taxpayer about her son and the addition on title.
11 And at that time, she had indicated that she had owned
12 the property for many years. And since she was getting
13 older, she added her son on title, you know, with the
14 intent so they wouldn't have to -- they wouldn't --
15 they'd basically have to deal with probate after she
16 passed, so it would be simpler.

17 The taxpayer also said the assessor's office
18 told her that since the property was not her primary
19 residence and was a rental home, that the parent-child
20 exclusion form, if it was filed, it still would not be
21 granted.

22 And basically this was not a house that the
23 taxpayer lived in. It was a rental property. And the
24 son was added on title prior to Proposition 19's
25 effective dates.

1 So even if the taxpayer had not already used
2 her lifetime limit of one million dollars for
3 non-residential property, under Revenue and Taxation
4 Code Section 63.1, because as of the date of the
5 transfer, it would have been eligible for the transfer
6 exclusion. Because the law changed as of February 16th,
7 2021.

8 So we examined a copy of that deed that was
9 provided to us by the assessor's office. And,
10 unfortunately, the transfer had been notarized -- had it
11 been notarized three days earlier, taxpayer could have
12 claimed exclusion under Proposition 58 and RTC 63.1.

13 MS. COHEN: So she was three days short?

14 MS. THOMPSON: She was for that purpose.

15 But because she said that the supplemental tax
16 bill we analyzed showed that 50 percent was reassessed
17 on that, and because ultimately the quitclaim deed was
18 silent as to how property was held, it didn't basically
19 indicate whether the son or the mom held property, and
20 as tenants in common, or as joint tenants.

21 And, basically, exclusion from reassessment,
22 once somebody is added to title, occurs if the property
23 isn't held in joint tenancy.

24 MS. COHEN: And if it is held in joint
25 tenancy?

1 MS. THOMPSON. Yeah. So basically if, say, a
2 mom adds a son on title, and she remains on title. So
3 this is different from passing away, obviously.

4 So in accordance with property tax law and
5 Rule 462.040, if a person is added to joint tenancy, and
6 that transferrer, like a mom, like myself, would
7 transfer it. If they remain on title, then that is not
8 something that is reassessed. That is, in essence --

9 MS. COHEN: So the assessor made a mistake?

10 MS. THOMPSON: No, the assessor did not make a
11 mistake. There was no mistake involved on the
12 assessor's office. It was properly assessed.

13 MS. COHEN: Okay.

14 MS. THOMPSON: So it really was an issue with
15 this taxpayer.

16 But because she had indicated to us, the son
17 and her, that they really were intending to avoid
18 probate, that's the whole reason they wanted to do this,
19 we were aware, just based on our knowledge from existing
20 guidance from our Assessors' Handbook 541, Change in
21 Ownership, that our Property Tax Department publishes,
22 that that actually doesn't -- in tenants in common is
23 what would be -- be something that you would still have
24 to go through probate. Joint tenants is what it was.

25 So we directed the taxpayer to guidance in our

1 existing handbook, as well as, you know,
2 Rule 462.04 -- 020 for tenants in common, and then
3 Revenue and Taxation Code Section 61. So they could
4 consider whether they wanted to rescind that prior
5 transfer.

6 And instead -- or instead do a correction deed
7 to specify that it really wasn't tenants in common. So
8 the end result of that would be if they chose to do that
9 to their title, clarify that the intent wasn't for it to
10 be listed as tenant in common jointly. That that would
11 result in actually the property not being sent to
12 reassessment.

13 MS. COHEN: Assessed.

14 MS. THOMPSON: So that is something, you know,
15 for them to consider. And what they did.

16 MS. COHEN: What county did this happen in?

17 MS. THOMPSON: I don't --

18 MS. COHEN: You don't recall? It's okay.

19 MS. THOMPSON: But, yeah. I mean, we have
20 change-in-ownership cases that -- that are
21 throughout --

22 MS. COHEN: I know you do.

23 MS. THOMPSON: -- throughout California.

24 MS. COHEN: This case is just interesting.

25 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah, it really was

1 interesting. Because, you know, in this case, although
2 we're, you know, confirming that the assessor treated
3 them fairly according to the law, we were able to at
4 least provide that vehicle, you know, to indicate that,
5 you know, because of information that they provided to
6 us about the probate, you know --

7 MS. COHEN: And this was a rental property.
8 This is not even the home that she lives in.

9 MS. THOMPSON: Yes.

10 MS. COHEN: The mother.

11 MS. THOMPSON: That's correct. Yeah.

12 So -- yeah. I mean, we don't know the
13 circumstances with this. But we do know that that's why
14 this was -- he was added on a title to do that.

15 MS. COHEN: I'm sorry. Real quick.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: Along those lines real quick.

17 So if -- I know there's different ways you can
18 do it. Joint tenancies, there's limited partnerships,
19 and then there's tenants in common, you mentioned.

20 If it's joint tenancy, before the person
21 passes away, let's say the mother or whoever owns the
22 property now, it doesn't get reassessed when it's passed
23 onto whoever is on the joint tenancy, if it's the son or
24 daughter, or grandchild.

25 MS. THOMPSON: As long as -- as long as the

1 person that's transferring it, such as the mom, that
2 owned the property before, remains on title. Then
3 they -- that is something.

4 MR. VAZQUEZ: Right.

5 But up until death, and then upon death, she
6 gets quitclaimed off, no?

7 MS. THOMPSON: Well, I don't think it's a
8 quitclaim. But -- so what would happen --

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Well -- or --

10 MS. THOMPSON: So at the time -- but, I mean,
11 at the time you -- so at the time. At the time of the
12 transfer.

13 So if it's under joint tenancy, if I was to
14 add my son or daughter onto title onto a property, and I
15 remained on title, there is no reassessment of that,
16 say, 50 percent. Because the law says otherwise, as
17 long as they do.

18 But, yeah, you would look at it like at the
19 point, say I died, then they'd be looking at a
20 reassessment consequence at that point.

21 So when the original co-owner or transferrer
22 comes off title, then the entire property is subject to
23 reassessment. It's under property tax law.

24 So it would have to look at what exclusion
25 laws were available at that time. So --

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: Given what we have today, if you
2 were to put your child on as a joint tenant, heaven
3 forbid a year from now you passed away, your child would
4 take ownership of it without a change of ownership,
5 right?

6 MS. THOMPSON: She would take -- she or he
7 would take ownership to the property, and the property
8 tax law in place at that point would be -- would govern
9 whether it's reassessed.

10 Currently, if Prop. 19 is still under law at
11 that time, then, yes, it would not qualify for exclusion
12 if it was a rental property.

13 So that's kind of looking at it. But -- yeah,
14 so the joint -- I mean, there's many -- our property tax
15 rules are excellent resources to look at.

16 Property Tax Rule 462.020 and 040, those
17 actually discuss joint tenancies versus tenants in
18 common, our agency's assessors' handbook on change in
19 ownership also discusses kind of the differences in
20 holding property. And so those are good -- you know,
21 good resources.

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: Are those the only two ways you
23 can go, joint tenancy and tenants in common?

24 MS. THOMPSON: Well, I mean, I'm not an expert
25 on obviously how a title is held. But, I mean, those

1 are pretty much it as an individual.

2 I mean, if you're looking at corporations or
3 limited partnerships or LLCs, those are different. But
4 of course those aren't -- that would not be subject to
5 exclusion under the parent-child exclusion. That's just
6 property held by individuals.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: Prior to Prop. 19, it wasn't
8 considered a change in ownership if you were joint
9 tenant and the mom or dad passed away, right?

10 MS. THOMPSON: You could qualify for exclusion
11 before Prop. 19 on property. So it wasn't just
12 principal residence property. There was also exclusion
13 available under Revenue and Taxation Code Section 663.1.
14 And that was for other -- other properties. But it was
15 up to one million dollars lifetime exclusion.

16 So you could have a rental property, or you
17 could have a commercial business property or an
18 industrial property that could be done.

19 MS. COHEN: Thank you very much.

20 Member Gaines.

21 MR. GAINES: Could I ask you another question?

22 I'm sorry.

23 MS. THOMPSON: Sure. That's okay. And then
24 I'll go on to my next --

25 MR. GAINES: I'm just trying to under --

1 MS. COHEN: This is the wonderful benefit of
2 actually -- we have now reached a point where we know
3 what we're talking about.

4 MS. THOMPSON: Right. You guys are. Yeah.

5 MS. COHEN: We can follow the conversation.

6 Go ahead, Senator.

7 MR. GAINES: It's a good example to look at.

8 And I'm just, in this particular case, so the
9 mom was adding the son, which would trigger reappraisal
10 of 50 percent of the value?

11 MS. THOMPSON: Yes.

12 MR. GAINES: Okay. And then what if -- okay.
13 What if the son was added, and that would trigger
14 appraisal, reappraisal on half of it, and then the
15 mother dies, would the other half be reappraised upon
16 death?

17 MS. THOMPSON: Upon her death, it would be
18 100 percent reassessed. Because the law is such that
19 when an original transferor either is removed from title
20 or passes, then, I mean, you are removed from title,
21 essentially. But that is subject to reappraisal at that
22 point.

23 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

24 So there's no advantage of adding a child or a
25 grandchild to a joint tenancy --

1 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah. I can't really say --

2 MR. GAINES: -- that I can see from a tax
3 perspective. Because it's gonna be -- it will trigger
4 reappraisal then, and then it will be reappraised again
5 upon death of the mother or grandmother or grandparents.

6 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah. I mean, it's a choice of
7 people to do that. But that would save -- at least
8 putting somebody on title now would save at least -- I
9 mean, they would be on title, but you wouldn't be
10 reassessed at that point.

11 But at a later date when that person comes on
12 title, that you would be. And I guess depending on what
13 laws were in place at that time of the death or when
14 they're removed, then there might not be any property
15 tax consequences. But there are currently.

16 MR. GAINES: Okay.

17 MS. THOMPSON: Certainly.

18 But, again, people should look at, not just
19 property tax consequences, they should look at tax
20 consequences, like income tax.

21 MR. GAINES: I mean, probate's a big -- a big
22 deal too.

23 MS. THOMPSON: Well, income tax purposes is
24 another reason. But --

25 MR. GAINES: Yeah. The cost of probate is

1 another aspect.

2 But also in terms of -- well, let's see. I
3 had another question, darn it. And I can't remember
4 right now.

5 MS. THOMPSON: It's not -- I was just going to
6 mention that it's not my area.

7 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

8 MS. THOMPSON: But with passing on property,
9 I mean, the disadvantage for income tax purposes by
10 adding somebody on title now is that when you die, then
11 you don't get the step up in bases for income tax
12 purposes.

13 MR. GAINES: Oh, okay.

14 MS. THOMPSON: So that's what I understand
15 other people are looking at and considering when having
16 transfers, you know, to their children before they die.

17 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

18 In this particular case, though, they were
19 able to reverse it with no cons -- no adverse effect.

20 MS. THOMPSON: They have not -- as far as I
21 know, they have not reversed it yet. We just talked
22 with them about it.

23 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

24 MS. THOMPSON: It's their choice. So I did
25 extend the offer to them is, one, if they do decide to

1 go through and do a deed correction or recission --
2 excuse me -- to indicate that it was in tenants --
3 excuse me -- not in tenants in common, it was actually
4 joint tenants, then they could contact me after reaching
5 out to the assessor's office with the deed information,
6 and we could see if, you know, that could be removed.

7 Because in this case -- so the deed was
8 silent. It didn't say anything. It just said, I've,
9 you know, whatever, Mrs. Smith adds, you know, John, you
10 know. And they're together. It didn't say as joints
11 tenants, or it didn't say as tenants in common.

12 MR. GAINES: Okay.

13 MS. THOMPSON: And so under a different area
14 of law, I believe it's the civil code, basically says if
15 it doesn't expressly state it's a joint tenant, then
16 it's considered to not be.

17 MR. GAINES: Okay. So that's why there's the
18 flexibility after the fact.

19 MS. THOMPSON: Because -- yeah. And because,
20 again, they indicated that to me --

21 MR. GAINES: Yes.

22 MS. THOMPSON: -- to be why.

23 You know, the intent of it was to not -- you
24 know, to avoid probate. And we said, "Well, you don't
25 avoid probate the way you did it."

1 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

2 MS. THOMPSON: And so you might, you know,
3 want to look into that. And so they can choose to take
4 that information. If they want to pursue it with an
5 attorney, then they can do that.

6 And they have our contact information. And I
7 did extend that to them.

8 MR. GAINES: That's great. Thank you.

9 MS. THOMPSON: And happy to help them later if
10 I need to.

11 Okay. If there's no questions, I can go onto
12 the next item.

13 Okay. So the next item I wanted to report on
14 to the Members is on work completed for taxpayers that
15 submitted public comments at the Taxpayer Bill of Rights
16 Hearing, held as part of the August 30th, 2022 Board
17 Meeting.

18 One taxpayer, Mr. David Frankville, submitted
19 a public comment concerning Proposition 13, and what he
20 felt was the erosion of protections given to homeowners,
21 and being upsetting that people can't afford to pay
22 their property taxes with their fixed requirement
23 income.

24 The TRA office, during its remarks, explained
25 that Proposition 13 was passed by the voters in 1978,

1 and continues today with protections limiting the
2 property tax rate to one percent. Plus voter-approved
3 bonded indebtedness with increases in assessed value,
4 specifically to the factored base year value to two
5 percent, unless a change in ownership or new
6 construction occurs.

7 I also indicated that if he finds he is unable
8 to pay property taxes, then he may wish to look into the
9 Property Tax Postponement Program offered by the State
10 Controller's Officer.

11 During the meeting, Chair Cohen asked that the
12 TRA office could reach out to him to provide a direct
13 contact in the State Controller's Office, and asked that
14 we coordinate with Deputy Controller Epolite for a
15 contact person, rather than only giving public contact
16 information from the Controller's website.

17 After the meeting, we provided information to
18 Mr. Frankville about Proposition 13, the limitations of
19 the maximum two percent increases a year, and also about
20 the requirement that the assessor assess a property at
21 the lower of its factored base year value or market
22 value each year.

23 We provided information about the property tax
24 postponement program providing links to the State
25 Controller's Office website that contains comprehensive

1 information about the program and how to apply for it.

2 Additionally, we provided the name and phone
3 number of a person in the State Controller's Office that
4 he could call and speak personally with about the
5 program.

6 We completed work on another public comment
7 submission from the Bill of Rights Hearing from a
8 concerned tax agent who chose to remain anonymous.

9 The comment concerned appeals in Riverside
10 County, and indicated that they were allowing public --
11 weren't allowing public access to property tax
12 assessment appeals hearings.

13 And also that, although the law states the
14 hearing -- hearings must be made public, the clerk of
15 the Assessment Appeals Board refuses to allow access.

16 The comment indicated that the Assessment
17 Appeals Board cited COVID concerns. However, at the
18 hearing the tax agent attended, not everyone was wearing
19 a mask, and the requester asked that we could make sure
20 the public access is permitted to the hearing as
21 required.

22 As part of my remarks at the meeting, I
23 indicated that our agency's role in the assessment
24 appeals is to prescribe property tax rules and issue
25 instructional documents to assist appeals boards in the

1 performance of their duties. And individual counties
2 have their own rules or actual appeal proceedings.

3 I further indicated our office reviewed our
4 agency's publication on assessment appeals. And on
5 page 96 it discussed hearings being open to the public,
6 and addresses the requirements of the Revenue and
7 Taxation Code Section 1605.4 and Property Tax Rule 313.

8 I explained that the statutory and regulatory
9 provisions require appeals board hearing and hearing
10 officer hearings must be open, assessable and audible to
11 the public. But when a portion of the hearing involves
12 evidence regarding trade secrets, that that portion of
13 the hearing may be closed to the public.

14 At the meeting, I also explained that our --
15 after receiving public comment, we reached out to our
16 Legal Department to ask for information concerning a
17 local appeals board authority to not allow the public to
18 access county appeals hearings for -- in person for
19 COVID concerns.

20 They advised us that the state was under
21 emergency proclamation by the Governor due to the COVID
22 pandemic, and the actions of the local government and
23 local health department may be involved.

24 And they indicated that we should inquire with
25 the county and local appeals board to explore their

1 reasoning and authority to close the meetings.

2 As part of my closing remarks, I indicated
3 that the TRA office would coordinate with the county on
4 the taxpayer -- on what the taxpayer indicated to be
5 closed to the public, and the time period for which
6 meetings were closed to the public, to see if it was in
7 effect during the time of the Governor's order. And if
8 it has since changed since those Governor orders
9 stopped.

10 So after the meeting, we reached out to the
11 assessor's office to ask about their experience at the
12 assessment appeals board. And they indicated that
13 generally it's appraisers go into the hearing room to
14 testify when it's their turn. And that there are less
15 chairs than before COVID around the perimeter of the
16 room, presumably for social-distancing reasons.

17 They also said the appeals board may have
18 COVID concerns due to the size of the room, and it
19 wasn't very big.

20 The TRA office then contacted the clerk of the
21 board to ask about the county's policy on public access
22 to county appeals board hearings.

23 According to the clerk's office, hearings were
24 closed during March 2020 due to COVID, and reopened for
25 in-person hearings in July 2021.

1 Before July 2021, hearings were held via Zoom,
2 following the beginning of COVID. Once they learned how
3 to set up virtual hearings, they indicated that while
4 hearings were held virtually, only AAB members and the
5 clerk were allowed in the hearing room.

6 As to in-person hearings that opened up in
7 July 2021, the clerk indicated that although hearings
8 were open to the public since July 2021, due to their
9 county's ongoing concern with the spreading of COVID,
10 the small hearing room and the AAB members are seniors,
11 over age 60, if a person isn't connected with the case
12 being heard, the clerk of the board prefers the
13 contact -- the person contact them to request attendance
14 at the hearing. And they will try to accommodate them.
15 But the six-foot social distancing would likely not be
16 possible.

17 They indicated that persons showing up on the
18 hearing day without an appointment may be allowed into
19 the hearing room, provided there is room, depending on
20 the total persons already attending.

21 The clerk also advised the assessor's
22 office -- that the assessor's office only brings
23 one-to-two staff to present evidence, as opposed to the
24 past when they had more staff attending to -- listening
25 to the hearings.

1 At this time, persons awaiting their turn to
2 present their own cases are asked to wait outside the
3 hearing room until it is their turn.

4 The county clerk of the board also advises
5 that the policy is not meant -- is meant to protect the
6 public, as well as employees.

7 And they're open to suggestions how they could
8 operate hearings in a safe environment for all, while
9 still being within the Ralph Brown Act, meetings open to
10 the public.

11 Additionally, the county clerk of the board
12 advised us that if people wish to be informed about the
13 hearing, they can purchase an audio recording of the
14 entire day's hearing. And it is \$5 to make a copy of
15 that tape.

16 So based on our office's review, it seems that
17 the appeals board in Riverside County are available to
18 the public, since a person can request to attend a
19 hearing, even if they are not presenting, or they are
20 not involved with that case.

21 And people are allowed to be in the hearing
22 room, subject to capacity restrictions. And also since
23 anyone can obtain an audio recording of those hearings.

24 The next item I wanted to report on is -- to
25 keep the Members informed is on work associated with

1 Proposition 19 education and outreach.

2 As I indicated in my presentation at the July
3 Board Meeting, in June, our office completed work on six
4 information sheets. And they were published to help
5 taxpayers understand property tax laws and exclusions
6 available to them.

7 Thereafter, I had sent a letter to the
8 California Assessors' Association President, Leslie
9 Morgan, advising her of the issuance of those
10 information sheets, where they can be accessed on our
11 website, and asked that she share that information with
12 California assessors, as well as the CAA affiliates at
13 that August conference that was -- that was held.

14 Since my last update, the TRA office has
15 completed work on a new information sheet for base year
16 value transfers for disabled persons under
17 Proposition 19, as well as revised the existing
18 publication to identify them as applicable to transfers
19 prior to April 1st, 2021.

20 These information sheets were posted to our
21 website last week. And at future Board Meetings, I will
22 provide further updates on the activities of the TRA
23 office to keep you informed.

24 I'm available for any further questions if you
25 have any.

1 MS. COHEN: All right. Thank you.

2 Just to be clear, this information that you
3 were reporting on has happened this year in 2022?

4 MS. THOMPSON: Yes. Right. So I started
5 with --

6 MS. COHEN: One of my colleagues had a
7 question --

8 MS. THOMPSON: Oh, I'm sorry.

9 MS. COHEN: -- as to the report you were
10 making. Was it this year or last year?

11 And I just wanted to state for clarification
12 and for the record that you were reporting on our
13 conversations in cases that are happening in 2022.

14 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah. The cases that I'm
15 referring to -- so the beginning portion, when I talk
16 about completed cases, it's for the prior month that we
17 completed work on.

18 But as far as the second item, it was items
19 that we actually completed work on largely in September,
20 for the two items following the Bill of Rights Hearing.
21 Because the Bill of Rights Hearing was on August 30th --

22 MS. COHEN: Of 2021.

23 MS. THOMPSON: Of 2022.

24 MS. COHEN: Oh, yes. You're right. Last
25 month. You're right. I'm sorry.

1 MS. THOMPSON: So -- yeah. So I wanted to do
2 that as a separate item. Because I felt that was
3 important.

4 So the Members were advised that, you know, we
5 did take care of those two items. So in the upcoming
6 months, I will be also including those. So as we finish
7 cases that were brought to us, or issues that were
8 brought at the Bill of Rights Hearing, then I'll report
9 on that, kind of on a separate item.

10 So in that respect, most of them would be done
11 probably during the, you know, the current month.

12 MS. COHEN: Great. Thank you very much.

13 MS. THOMPSON: You're welcome.

14 MS. COHEN: Any questions on this side, on my
15 right?

16 Mr. Epolite, is that a yes, you have a
17 question?

18 MR. EPOLITE: Yes.

19 MS. COHEN: Go for it.

20 MR. EPOLITE: Ms. Thompson, on the information
21 sheets that are being posted, what was the review
22 process on those documents?

23 MS. THOMPSON: Well, so the TRA office, you
24 know, prepares them, and then they're circulated through
25 an internal review process. So our Legal staff looks at

1 it, Property Tax Department looks at it as well, and
2 then of course our Executive Director looks at that.

3 MR. EPOLITE: Okay. Great. Thank you.

4 MS. THOMPSON: You're welcome.

5 And our Communications Officer does also.

6 Thank you, Peter, for helping with those.

7 MS. COHEN: Mr. Vazquez.

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Just a quick question.

9 First of all, thank you for the report and all
10 the detail.

11 But I noticed on the Prop. 19 information
12 sheets your office has prepared are reachable, you know,
13 with the link under the taxpayers education. And within
14 that menu, the information, the options are for the main
15 TRA web page, but they don't seem to appear on the
16 Prop. 19 link for the web page.

17 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah. So actually I worked
18 with the Communications Officer earlier. We were
19 waiting until the base year value transfer for disabled
20 persons was added last week. So posted. And so
21 earlier, I think Monday, so yesterday, it posted.

22 So another link was created following last
23 week. So it's actually added under the additional
24 resources area of the Prop. 19. So you can --

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: So you get it through the

1 Prop --

2 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah. I think it's the third
3 bulletin item. But it's there now. So it actually
4 links you. So, yeah, thank you for that.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: Appreciate it.

6 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah. We want to expose as
7 many taxpayers to it as possible. So --

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

9 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

10 Any questions on my left?

11 Yes, Mr. Schaefer.

12 MR. SCHAEFER: Thank you for your report,
13 Ms. Thompson.

14 It comes to mind that you are more informed on
15 all these statutes than any of us are, because you work
16 with them all the time, and do a lot of good for people.

17 And it also appears to me that there may be a
18 statute that if you wish it were a little bit different,
19 you could do so much more to help the taxpayer. But
20 you're stuck with the statute.

21 In those cases, I would like very much to have
22 you write a little memo on proposing a modification in
23 the statute by the Legislature, that if it were done
24 would enable you to do so much for the taxpayers that
25 are coming to you for help.

1 I guess you would make that to our
2 Executive Director, and she would share it with us.
3 And each of us have friends in the Legislature, and we
4 have our own legislators. Like mine from Southern
5 California. I would call upon my legislators to say,
6 "Look what Ms. Lisa has found up here. And how if we
7 tinkered with it a little bit, we could do so much more
8 as a BOE."

9 And, you know, we could end up with some
10 happiness and benefit to a lot of taxpayers that maybe
11 was started with an idea from you.

12 I just want to be able to do more to help the
13 taxpayers, and I'm impressed with the stuff you run
14 across. And maybe you should be up here. You could do
15 a lot of stuff.

16 MS. THOMPSON: I think if we saw, you know,
17 something, you know, other than -- I mean, we implement
18 the law. I mean, our agency implements the law. And we
19 ensure -- our office ensures taxpayers are treated
20 fairly according to the law.

21 If we saw something that was maybe hindering
22 the ability for a taxpayer maybe to comply with
23 something, then that might be something that we would,
24 you know, identify internally and through our
25 legislative process.

1 You know, but in this case, you know, for
2 change-in-ownership laws, like, you know, the
3 reassessment consequences for rental properties under
4 Prop. 19, the California voters voted. And so they
5 voted that in.

6 So we could, you know, we are happy to help
7 taxpayers, you know, ensure they were treated fairly
8 according to the assessor's office. But it's not
9 something we might change --

10 MR. SCHAEFER: No, you do a very good job.

11 Thank you.

12 MS. THOMPSON: Thank you.

13 Well, I'm fortunate I have a really great
14 staff. I also have property tax background. So I think
15 that helps quite a bit.

16 MS. COHEN: Great.

17 MR. NANJO: Thank you, Chair Cohen.

18 If I could interrupt real quickly, I just
19 wanted to remind the Board that for those kinds of
20 directions, the Board, as a group, should have a
21 consensus and direct the Executive Director to direct
22 staff to do any ideas.

23 But all good ideas to be discussed.

24 Thank you.

25 MR. EPOLITE: Ms. Thompson, did you say the

1 information sheet on Prop. 19 has been issued or is
2 still forthcoming?

3 MS. THOMPSON: No. Well, okay, so there's
4 a -- well, there's the Proposition 19 facts sheets. But
5 there's also information sheets that -- at the
6 Taxpayers' Rights Advocate Office.

7 So I don't know if you're looking at the
8 Prop. 19 tab. Or are you going towards Mr. Vazquez' --

9 MR. EPOLITE: I'm on the Taxpayers' Rights
10 Advocate Office information sheet page.

11 MS. THOMPSON: Okay. So you've picked
12 "taxpayer education," and you're there.

13 So if you go to the very bottom of the website
14 and pick Taxpayers' Rights Advocate Office, one of the
15 choices is "taxpayer education."

16 And then if you click "taxpayer education,"
17 then you get to the page where you'll see all of our
18 information sheets on all topics. They all have been,
19 you know -- pertain to areas that were affected by
20 Proposition 19.

21 MR. EPOLITE: Okay.

22 MS. THOMPSON: And what Member Vazquez was
23 referring to is if you go to the very top of the website
24 and do the Proposition 19 page, if you do that, there's
25 several tabs within the -- because we have comprehensive

1 information about Proposition 19. One of those was
2 additional resources.

3 MR. EPOLITE: But I thought you had said there
4 was information sheets specific to Prop. 19?

5 MS. THOMPSON: Facts sheet.

6 MR. EPOLITE: Oh, it's a facts sheet.

7 MS. THOMPSON: It's a Proposition 19 fact
8 sheet.

9 MR. EPOLITE: Okay.

10 MS. THOMPSON: Although the -- so it's not one
11 of the Taxpayers Rights Advocate Office information
12 sheets, it's actually kind of produced but the agency.
13 But, Peter Kim, the Communications Officer --

14 MR. EPOLITE: Right.

15 MS. THOMPSON: -- and I, as the Taxpayers'
16 Rights Advocate, essentially did that.

17 MR. EPOLITE: Okay.

18 MS. THOMPSON: So it's not under the TRA.

19 MR. EPOLITE: Right.

20 MS. THOMPSON: But we're actually
21 contemplating somehow linking that into that. So he and
22 I are exploring that now to somehow maybe get it back to
23 the Prop. 19 page.

24 MR. EPOLITE: Okay. Thank you.

25 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

1 All right. Thank you.

2 MS. THOMPSON: Thank you.

3 MS. COHEN: We're going to go to the public
4 comment.

5 MS. CICHETTI: AT&T moderator, please let us
6 know if there is anyone on the line who would like to
7 make a public comment regarding this matter.

8 AT&T MODERATOR: Thank you.

9 If you would like to make a public comment on
10 this matter, please press one, followed by zero. One,
11 followed by zero at this time.

12 And, Madam Chair, nobody is queueing up.

13 MS. COHEN: I appreciate that. Thank you very
14 much.

15 We appreciate your work. Very important,
16 Ms. Thompson.

17 MS. THOMPSON: Thank you so much.

18 MS. COHEN: Very impressive. Thank you.

19 Ms. Cichetti, who do we have next?

20 MS. CICHETTI: Normally, we'd go to our next
21 item. But it is 12:30. And I wasn't so sure if you
22 wanted to break for lunch right now, or to take the next
23 item up.

24 MS. COHEN: Let's break for lunch.

25 Let's break for lunch.

1 Ms. Lumsden, we'll hear from you right after
2 lunch. Okay?

3 Ms. Cichetti, could you let us know how long
4 do we have for lunch?

5 MS. CICHETTI: Forty-five minutes.

6 MS. COHEN: Okay. So we will reconvene at
7 1:15. Thank you.

8 (Whereupon the lunch break was taken.)

9 MS. COHEN: Good afternoon, ladies and
10 gentlemen.

11 Let's reconvene. It is 1:19, Tuesday,
12 September 27th.

13 Ms. Cichetti, could you please.

14

15 **ITEM K4a**

16

17 MS. CICHETTI: The next item.

18 The next item on the Board agenda is K4A,
19 Property Tax Deputy Director's Report, Operational
20 Updates: Report on the status of pending and upcoming
21 projects, activities, and departmental issues, including
22 Proposition 19 Implementation Actions and Guidance,
23 Letters to the Assessors, Appraisal Training and
24 Certification, Assessment Practice Surveys, and the
25 State-Assessed Property.

1 These items will be presented by Mr. Yeung and
2 his team.

3 MR. YEUNG: Thank you, Mary.

4 MS. COHEN: Hi, Mr. Yeung.

5 MR. YEUNG: Yes.

6 Good afternoon, Chair Cohen, Honorable Members
7 of the Board.

8 For the record, my name is David Yeung, and
9 I'm the Deputy Director of the Property Tax Department.

10 So along with my usual report on Prop. 19
11 implementation, I have two additional reports to give
12 after that.

13 After my three reports, I will turn it over to
14 Ms. Lumsden, who will have the next three sub-items, and
15 then to Ms. Cruz for SAPD, then one sub-item there.

16 So with your okay, I'll start with the
17 Prop. 19 implementation.

18 MS. COHEN: Yes.

19 MR. YEUNG: Okay.

20 Staff continues to monitor the progress of
21 Property Tax Rules 462.520, the intergenerational
22 transfer property tax rule and 462.540, which is the
23 base year transfers through the -- through the
24 promulgating process.

25 As of last week, it has been turned into the

1 Office of Administrative Law for their review. Pending
2 their review, it will then be posted on their web site.
3 That will begin the 45-day public comment period.

4 Our goal is to have it before the Board in
5 November for public comment.

6 Of course staff continues to answer inquiries
7 from taxpayers and other stakeholders as part of our
8 daily routine in implementing Prop. 19.

9 And staff is also continuing their process in
10 reviewing our property -- our website dedicated -- our
11 web page dedicated to Prop. 19. So work continues
12 there.

13 And if I may actually loop back onto an issue
14 brought up by Board Member Gaines.

15 The -- on Prop. 19, the -- the Board staff has
16 already worked on implementing our technology component
17 of it. So there is a requirement that we track the base
18 year transfers, each person now. Instead of allowing
19 one base year transfer, they're allowed three.

20 So we have since expanded our system. And
21 it's already live, and we're already tracking that. So
22 we're in good shape. So I just wanted to loop back and
23 answer that for you.

24 The next item I wanted to bring up to give you
25 an update on is our Welfare Exemption Process

1 Improvement Project.

2 As you will recall, staff has been presenting
3 on that for about a year. That was started in direct
4 response to inquiries about our processing of
5 applications for the Welfare Exemption, and specifically
6 for low-income housing.

7 There was some issue as to are we doing it,
8 are we handling it quickly, how are we turning things
9 around.

10 So we started on a project -- on a process
11 improvement project. We took a look at the items it
12 would take for us to actually accept review and approve
13 these applications.

14 Some of the steps we did -- some of the steps
15 we took were to -- we re-examined the actual
16 application. We streamlined that. We made sure that we
17 were asking for the information that we actually need in
18 order to make a determination. Nothing more, nothing
19 less.

20 We also clarified our instructions in there to
21 make it a little simpler to understand. And we've added
22 information to our website to add extra guidance to --
23 for applicants when filling that out.

24 And on our end, we took a look at our internal
25 processes and what we did in order to review it. We set

1 up. We tried to streamline that. And where we can, we
2 did concurrent reviews. And -- and we try to look for
3 bottlenecks and -- and to solve that.

4 So we've been at it for about a year. And
5 what I -- now I have enough data points where I can
6 actually come and report back to you.

7 So I'm very happy to report that our efforts
8 are actually starting to pay off. So as of this year,
9 as of the end of August, we've already approved a
10 combined 877 OCCs and SCCs, organizational clearance
11 certificates and the supplemental clearance
12 certificates.

13 For affordable housing, they actually need
14 both. So we've already approved 877 for -- as of August
15 of 2022. For all of last year of 2021, we approved 833.
16 So we're only partway through the year. We have four
17 more months to go. And we're already on track. We've
18 already beat our last year's record, and we're on track
19 to do even more.

20 So initial results are very encouraging. And
21 I think most -- a lot of that is due to the revamp of
22 our application.

23 It's -- the real benefit to that is that it's
24 easier for folks to fill out. And when we get our
25 applications, it's more complete, and it has information

1 we actually need. So there's less of that contacting
2 the applicants, getting additional information, waiting
3 for them to submit, as we're looking at it again and
4 again, having to handle the application multiple times.

5 So that has gone a long way in -- in improving
6 that process.

7 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

8 MR. YEUNG: And then the last item I wanted to
9 give you a little bit of an un update on is the vessels
10 valuation factors.

11 So annually the Board publishes these vessel
12 valuation factors, and they're meant to assist county
13 assessors in the assessment of vessels. And vessels
14 include powerboats, watercraft, sale boats, whatnot.

15 So every year the staff collects information
16 and data during the year to figure out if you bought one
17 of these types of vessels, what happens to the value at
18 the next lien date.

19 We collect that data. We analyze it. And
20 somewhere -- and we publish these factors to help the
21 assessors come up with a fair market value.

22 And it's usually published right around the
23 beginning of the year, so they can use it for the lien
24 date.

25 So for 2022, the factors were published in the

1 LTA. It's LTA 2022/003. And those factors show a
2 general increase in the value of these vessels that were
3 purchased in 2021.

4 So for next year's lien date, so January 1,
5 2022, in general, they have gone up in value. And that
6 is to reflect that over the course of 2021, because of
7 the higher demand for these types of leisure property,
8 the demand has gone up, and the supply has gone down,
9 supply chain issues, workforce issues.

10 And so it's -- in classical economics, in
11 supply and demand, it was -- it shifted. So it resulted
12 in a little bit -- it resulted in a higher value.

13 So when -- so when applied to this year's
14 assessment, a lot of vessel owners actually got a higher
15 tax bill than last year.

16 So you may or may not have heard some of this
17 in your -- in your respective districts.

18 So, as always, if there are any questions
19 about this type of assessment, the first stop is always
20 with the county assessors. They can call their county
21 assessors and ask about the assessment.

22 If that becomes -- if there's no resolution
23 there, as with any other assessment, there will be
24 courses, is to of course go to assessment appeals. And
25 the appeals information and deadlines are actually given

1 to owners of these types of crafts, either during --
2 either with their notice of assessment, or at their --
3 with their tax bill. So one or the other will have that
4 type of information on there.

5 So it's just if you have heard of such issues
6 in your county. That is what we do, and that's probably
7 why it's been happening.

8 It's because overall, vessels have gone up in
9 price over -- in the last year, 2021.

10 MS. COHEN: Okay.

11 MR. YEUNG: This concludes my three issues for
12 the Property Tax Department. I'm available to answer
13 any questions you may have.

14 MS. COHEN: I don't have any questions.

15 Mr. Vazquez.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: First of all, thank you for that
17 report.

18 And then it was refreshing to hear how some of
19 the things you're doing now has really helped in terms
20 of streamlining the process, especially given the
21 numbers from last year.

22 And I was just wondering, building on that
23 success, have we ever tried, or have you ever tried
24 maybe producing some kind of a video that can kind of
25 expedite so you don't waste so much of your staff time

1 on it, and hopefully beef up the numbers?

2 Because it looks like you're obviously going
3 to be doing better than last year. But there's still a
4 lot of folks that get caught up in this waiting period.

5 MR. YEUNG: Right. Right. It's an issue of
6 resources and time. I think it's a great idea.

7 I will have to look into whether we have the
8 resources and have the ability to produce that. I think
9 it would be helpful.

10 MS. COHEN: All right.

11 Mr. Epolite.

12 MR. EPOLITE: Yes.

13 I just wanted to chime in as well and applaud
14 staff for its efforts on exemption claims and to help
15 expedite housing efforts throughout the state. So thank
16 you.

17 MR. YEUNG: Thank you, Deputy Controller
18 Epolite.

19 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

20 Anyone on my left?

21 Mr. Gaines.

22 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

23 Thank you very much. Appreciate your
24 presentation, Mr. Yeung.

25 And I wanted to make sure you brought up this

1 issue on vessels, on watercraft. Because I've gotten
2 questions from my constituents as to why, you know,
3 their property tax on their watercraft has gone up.

4 So I just thought in terms of transparency,
5 it's good to bring this forward. And my hope is that we
6 can do this on an annual basis in the future. Because
7 it's pretty unusual to have the value of your boat
8 actually go up year over year. Because it's typically
9 depreciating, and taxation is declining.

10 And so I just think that it's, you know, to
11 the degree that we can make our constituents aware of
12 it, and then what they need to do in the event that they
13 want to challenge the valuation there, I think, in many
14 of our counties there's, I think, a November 30th
15 deadline, as you had discussed earlier with me, David.

16 MR. YEUNG: Yes.

17 MR. GAINES: And so I just wanted to make sure
18 our constituents are aware that if you're not happy with
19 the valuation, you have an ability to appeal that
20 through your county assessor.

21 But also understand the market has changed.
22 And just as you described, there's been, you know,
23 limited supply, and a lot of demand for watercraft. And
24 as a result, prices have been going up.

25 So thanks for bringing that forward.

1 MR. YEUNG: Of course.

2 MR. GAINES: And, you know, I've got -- you
3 know, I don't have huge amounts of watercraft. But I do
4 have -- I've got some big lakes like Shasta Lake and
5 Lake Tahoe, and people on boats that are wondering why
6 those taxes are going up.

7 So thank you.

8 MR. YEUNG: Thank you.

9 MS. COHEN: Okay. Thank you very much.
10 Thank you.

11 MR. YEUNG: Then I will turn it over to
12 Ms. Lumsden for the next presentation on Letters to
13 Assessors.

14 MS. LUMSDEN: Thank you, Mr. Yeung.

15 Good afternoon, Chair Cohen and Honorable
16 Board Members.

17 I am Patty Lumsden, and I'm the Chief of the
18 County-Assessed Properties Division.

19 And this afternoon I'm going to be giving you
20 a brief report on Letters to Assessors.

21 Attached to the agenda again this month is a
22 memo on letters to assessors, which provides a list of
23 the LTAs that have been issued since our last Board
24 Meeting. And, in addition, provides a link to all the
25 letters to assessors that have been issued to date.

1 As of the date of the attached memo, BOE staff
2 have issued a total of 41 LTAs for calendar year 2022,
3 and 3 of those LTAs have been issued since our last
4 Board Meeting.

5 Those three LTAs are summarized as follows:

6 An LTA we issued was on the assessment
7 practices survey report for Sacramento County.

8 We also issued an LTA providing statistical
9 data collected by BOE staff from county assessors
10 regarding community land trust housing for the
11 January 1, 2021 lien date, as required under
12 Senate Bill 196.

13 As you may remember, Senate Bill 196, which
14 became effective as of January 1, 2020 lien date, added
15 section 214.18 to the Revenue and Taxation Code to allow
16 a CLT, which is a community land trust, to file a claim
17 for the Welfare Exemption if certain conditions were
18 met.

19 In addition, uncodified language in SB 196
20 required the BOE to annually collect data to quantify
21 the amount of the assessed value exempted and the number
22 of owner-occupied dwelling units or rental units, or
23 both, created by CLTs, that were granted this exemption.

24 Finally, we issued an LTA which provides
25 annual per acre value of California irrigated crop land

1 for lien date 2023 to be used by county assessors when
2 valuing enforcibly restricted land subject to an urban
3 agricultural incentive zone contract as provided under
4 Revenue and Taxation Code Section 422.7.

5 That will conclude my report on Letters to
6 Assessors, and I'm happy to answer any questions you may
7 have.

8 MS. COHEN: Mr. Vazquez has a question.

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Just a quick one on the LTAs.
10 Is your department looking to possibly put out
11 an LTA regarding the streamlining of the Welfare
12 Exemption Process?

13 MS. LUMSDEN: At this time we were not
14 planning on doing that.

15 Is there something more specific? And did you
16 mean in terms of talking about the expansions that we've
17 made, or is this something --

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: Pretty much along those lines.

19 You know, what I think Mr. Yeung mentioned
20 earlier in terms of the streamlining how you've
21 obviously helped in expediting this thing. And I was
22 wondering if it would help some of the counties to know
23 that.

24 MS. LUMSDEN: That's something we can look
25 into.

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: Appreciate it.

2 MS. COHEN: Thank you. That's it.

3 MR. YEUNG: Okay.

4 The next presentation will also be by
5 Ms. Lumsden, and it will be Appraiser Training and
6 Certification.

7 MS. LUMSDEN: Thank you again, Mr. Yeung.

8 Again, I'm Patty Lumsden. I'm the Chief of
9 the County-Assessed Properties Division.

10 And now I will be giving you a brief report on
11 the BOE's Appraiser Training and Certification Program.

12 Posted to our website is the appraiser
13 training schedule for the 22-23 fiscal year where we
14 have scheduled 33 classes covering 8 different courses.

15 And as you may remember, last fiscal year, we
16 were only able to schedule a total of 23 classes and
17 convert only 5 of our most-requested courses into a
18 virtual teaching format.

19 This fiscal year we have scheduled an
20 additional 10 classes, and an additional 3 different
21 courses than what we were able to offer last fiscal
22 year.

23 In addition, we were offering both in-person
24 conducted classes as well as virtually-conducted
25 classes.

1 So for the 22-23 fiscal year, we have
2 completed 6 classes, and 2 of those classes were
3 completed since our last Board Meeting.

4 And those two classes were Course 56, which is
5 Advanced Sales Comparison and Income Capitalization
6 Approaches, which was taught in person by BOE staff in
7 San Diego, which of course is in San Diego County.

8 And then we also taught Course 52, which is
9 Valuation of Restricted Lands. And it was taught
10 virtually by BOE staff through Microsoft Office Teams.

11 And that would conclude my report on Training
12 and Certification. And I'm happy to answer any
13 questions you may have.

14 MS. COHEN: Okay. Let's see.

15 On my right, any questions?

16 I think it's pretty straightforward.

17 Thank you.

18 MR. YEUNG: And our last sub-item for
19 Ms. Lumsden will be Assessment Practices Surveys.

20 MS. LUMSDEN: Again, I'm Patty Lumsden, Chief
21 of the County-Assessed Properties Division.

22 And now I will be giving you a brief report on
23 our assessment practices surveys.

24 For calendar year 2022, we have issued a total
25 of 8 assessment practices survey reports via letters to

1 assessors for the following counties:

2 Santa Barbara County in District 2, Alameda
3 County in District 2, Sierra County in District 1,
4 Stanislaus County in District 1, Amador County in
5 District 1, Inyo County in District 1, Sacramento County
6 in District 1, and most recently, Los Angeles County in
7 District 3.

8 Los Angeles County you won't see on the
9 letters to assessors memo, because it was posted after
10 our -- the date of the memo. So that -- but that did
11 get posted just last week.

12 In addition to these 8 counties, we actively
13 are working on completing surveys and/or samples for
14 10 other counties, 4 of which are in District 1; 4 in
15 District 2; and 2 in District 4.

16 Now, these surveys and samples of course are
17 in various stages of production. And once they are
18 completed, we provide a copy of the report to each of
19 the Board Members and their office for preview before it
20 is issued and posted to our website through an LTA.

21 BOE staff continue working with their new
22 hybrid plan of collecting some data remotely and some in
23 person. We've started traveling again, as I mentioned
24 last month, depending on each assessor's ability to
25 accommodate our hybrid plan.

1 So we work with each assessor's office prior
2 to going to their office to see what will work best for
3 them based upon their staffing and, of course, their
4 computer systems.

5 So we will continue to monitor this new
6 process and make adjustments as needed.

7 And that will conclude my report on assessment
8 practices surveys. And I'm available to answer any
9 questions you may have.

10 MS. COHEN: Yes, Mr. Vazquez.

11 MR. VAZQUEZ: Just one quick one. Kind of
12 going back to your first part of your presentation.

13 I noticed you mentioned that you're doing a
14 combination of in person versus virtual classes. And
15 I'm looking at the schedule for 2023, how do you
16 determine which ones are which?

17 MS. LUMSDEN: So we tried to do a variety.
18 We tried to do kind of half-and-half of each subject.
19 I call it a course.

20 And so, for example, if we're teaching six
21 Course 3s, we're trying to do three of them in person,
22 and three of them virtually.

23 So that gives the assessor and their staff the
24 options of intending in person or virtually, whichever
25 ends up working best for them.

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: And now to the last part of your
2 presentation, I was looking at, I guess, in the findings
3 in the report, especially about the Los Angeles County
4 assessors, and the assessors, you know, for the most
5 part agreed with most of the findings, but they do not
6 concur with the department. What happens in that case
7 if there's a difference?

8 MS. LUMSDEN: So it just depends on what those
9 differences are.

10 The recommendations -- of course there are --
11 you know, there are recommendations. And the assessor
12 can take them into consideration.

13 And they review them, and they determine
14 whether they agree. If there's a large disagreement,
15 sometimes we agree to disagree. And -- or it could be
16 that there is a disagreement in terms of what their
17 office is capable of doing.

18 Because sometimes it could be a computer
19 issue, or it could be, you know, staffing issue, or
20 resources, or something that is not really something
21 that we would need to address.

22 But if there's something where we completely
23 disagree with one another, typically, what we have done
24 in the past, which we have not done very often, is we
25 will then issue -- we have the ability to then make a

1 statement in regards to that -- to the assessor's
2 response. But we have not done that. We have not
3 needed to do that in most cases.

4 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

5 MS. COHEN: On my left, questions?

6 Mr. Gaines.

7 MR. GAINES: Yeah, if I could. Thank you.

8 On your report about the three LTAs, you had
9 mentioned a per-acre value of ag land.

10 Can you maybe explain a little bit more the
11 purpose of that?

12 MS. LUMSDEN: So we annually -- and keep in
13 mind, I'm not an expert on this particular topic.

14 So we annually issue the cropland -- irrigated
15 cropland numbers. So we get those values to try and
16 make things more accessible to the assessors. Because
17 they could actually get this information as well, but we
18 provide it to them.

19 So we're -- Revenue and Taxation Code 422.7
20 requires the county assessor to value land that is
21 enforcibly restricted at a rate that is based on the
22 average per-acre value of irrigated cropland of
23 California.

24 So that's why we provide that information to
25 them. Because they're required in statute to value it

1 in that manner. And so we put that number out for them
2 annually.

3 And it's through -- it's reported through the
4 United States Department of Agricultural -- their
5 National Agricultural Statistics Survey Land Values for
6 2022. And that's where that number comes from.

7 MR. GAINES: Okay. So we get the numbers from
8 U.S. Ag, and then we publish them and make them
9 accessible for assessors throughout the state.

10 MS. LUMSDEN: Right. Because they need them
11 to do those annual valuations.

12 MR. GAINES: Yeah. Okay.

13 So it's just a service of providing
14 information that's readily -- that's easier available
15 through an LTA versus them having to do their own
16 research.

17 MS. LUMSDEN: Yes.

18 And it also helps to keep it consistent, so
19 that everybody has that same place to go, and is getting
20 it directly from us as well.

21 MR. GAINES: Yeah. That's great. Thank you.

22 MS. COHEN: Mr. Yeung, did you have anything
23 you wanted to say?

24 MR. YEUNG: No. I just wanted -- if you're
25 looking for background on this urban ag land, it's an

1 inducement for people that own property in urban
2 environment, usually urban environment land. It's a
3 little bit more valuable than cropland.

4 So as an inducement to restricting your use to
5 only growing basically agricultural products in the
6 urban environment, they give you a preferential
7 assessment.

8 So usually it's lower than if it were assessed
9 as -- as urban land. So that's kind of why it's there.

10 MR. GAINES: Okay. So this LTA is narrow then
11 just for urban ag land?

12 MR. YEUNG: Correct. Yeah.

13 MS. LUMSDEN: It's forcibly restricted.

14 MR. YEUNG: It has to be restricted.

15 MR. GAINES: I'm trying to figure out what
16 that meant.

17 MR. YEUNG: Yeah.

18 MR. GAINES: Okay. Thank you.

19 MR. YEUNG: Of course. Any time.

20 Mr. Schaefer, did you have a question?

21 MR. SCHAEFER: Yes.

22 Mr. Yeung, automobiles are all assessed by the
23 Department of Motor Vehicles. And the value of our car,
24 on the records, goes down every year, and is done
25 automatically. And, you know, it works.

1 Getting to the yachts, that is our
2 responsibility. Can I assume that our assessors are
3 just as automatic as the DMV in rationing down the value
4 of the yacht every year? Is it with age?

5 Maybe we could have a call of my assessor, and
6 see how he's doing that. We have a lot of yachts, you
7 know, in water city. I'm sure he's had some inquiries
8 from people who don't think it's rationing down.

9 The most important day in the yacht owner's
10 life is when he buys himself a yacht, and then when he
11 sells the yacht.

12 MR. YEUNG: Right.

13 MR. SCHAEFER: And they do lose their luster
14 and their value rapidly. And I want to be sure they
15 don't go begging for this. I want to make sure the
16 assessors are leading the parade.

17 MR. YEUNG: The assessor is charged annually
18 to assess these vessels at their fair market value. So
19 on average, usually the physical depreciation carries
20 the day. And it's usually worth a little less, because
21 it's not getting any younger.

22 But in certain instances like last year, we
23 saw it with used cars, the demand for used cars, because
24 of the supply chain, was pretty high. And there were
25 folks that were basically able to sell their used car

1 for about what they paid for it, and sometimes maybe a
2 little bit more.

3 So the assessor's charge is to find its fair
4 market value on the lien date for these vessels.

5 MR. SCHAEFER: I realize it's been different
6 recently for cars.

7 MR. YEUNG: Yeah.

8 MR. SCHAEFER: Okay. At least they're aware
9 of it.

10 Thank you.

11 MR. YEUNG: You're welcome.

12 MS. LUMSDEN: No further questions for me?

13 MS. COHEN: No. No.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Just one quick -- now that you
15 mention on the assessed values, do you -- do we actually
16 handle that, like on a probate, for example, case?

17 You don't do property, right?

18 MR. YEUNG: No. We -- we do not -- we do not
19 value the property. Most of the property is valued at
20 the county assessor level. Except for, of course, the
21 state assessed, for the public utilities. That's the
22 only exception.

23 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

24 MR. YEUNG: If -- if there's nothing else, I
25 will move onto the very last item for --

1 MS. COHEN: Yes, please.

2 MR. YEUNG: -- for the Deputy Director's
3 Report. That will be by Ms. Cruz, and she will give you
4 an update on the State-Assessed Properties Division.

5 MS. CRUZ: Good afternoon, Chair Cohen and
6 Honorable Members.

7 My name is Michelle Cruz, Manager of the
8 State-Assessed Properties Division.

9 Today I'll provide information on the status
10 of ongoing work in our division.

11 SAPD staff continue to work on this year's
12 petition workload. Staff are currently working on
13 completing our written responses to each of the
14 petitions for unitary reassessment.

15 Some petitioners have requested an appeal's
16 conference as part of their petition filing.

17 SAPD staff are also preparing for those
18 appeals conferences, and look forward to attempting to
19 resolve petition issues with petitioner representatives
20 during the appeals conferences.

21 The first of this year's petitions to come
22 before the Board will be presented -- excuse me -- at
23 the October Board Meeting.

24 We also anticipate petition matters coming
25 before the Board at the November and December Board

1 Meeting as well.

2 That concludes my report. I'm available to
3 answer any questions.

4 MS. COHEN: Mr. Vazquez has one.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: Is this your -- this is your
6 first time before us, no?

7 MS. COHEN: No.

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Oh. I guess I didn't remember
9 the last time. Well, anyways, I was going to welcome
10 you. So go ahead.

11 MS. COHEN: Always been an online setting.

12 MS. CRUZ: Yeah.

13 MS. COHEN: Do you have a question?

14 MR. GAINES: If I could.

15 MS. COHEN: Yes, please.

16 MR. GAINES: Yeah.

17 Thank you for your presentation.

18 In terms of petitions, what sort of petitions
19 are coming forward?

20 MS. CRUZ: I would say they are a broad range
21 of petitions throughout our different industries, such
22 as gas and electric. We have some telephone. I believe
23 we have a couple pipelines and a powerplant.

24 MR. GAINES: Okay.

25 MS. CRUZ: We have a total, I believe, of

1 19 or 20 this year.

2 MR. GAINES: Yeah. Okay.

3 Are those appeals?

4 MS. CRUZ: Yes.

5 MR. GAINES: Okay. All right.

6 So a mixture coming from different industries?

7 MS. CRUZ: Yes.

8 MR. GAINES: All right. Thank you. I
9 appreciate it.

10 MS. COHEN: All right. Thank you for the
11 presentation.

12 MR. YEUNG: Of course.

13 MS. COHEN: Appreciate it.

14 Ms. Cichetti, let's take public comment.

15 MS. CICHETTI: AT&T moderator, please let us
16 know if there's anyone on the line who'd like to make a
17 public comment regarding this matter.

18 AT&T MODERATOR: If you would like to make a
19 public comment, you may press one, and zero at this
20 time.

21 And I'm seeing no one in queue.

22 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

23 Let's call the next item.

24

25

//

1 **ITEM K5a**

2

3 MS. CICHETTI: Our next item on the agenda is

4 K5a, Legislative, Research and Statistics Division

5 Chief's Report: Legislative Issues; Update on

6 administrative and program-related legislative bills

7 impacting the Board of Equalization.

8 This item will be presented by Mr. Weatherby.

9 MR. WEATHERBY: So good afternoon,

10 Chair Cohen, and Honorable Members of the Board.

11 This is Dustin Weatherby. I'm Chief of the

12 Legislative, Research and Statistics Division.

13 So attached to the PAN is a summary of any

14 legislation that is effecting the Board of Equalization

15 that's on the Governor's desk.

16 So the last day for the Governor to act on any

17 bills for the 2021-2022 legislative session is this

18 upcoming Friday, September 30th.

19 So the first bill I want to highlight is

20 BOE-sponsored SB 440 by Senator Dodd. SB 440 was signed

21 by the Governor on September 13th, and it authorizes the

22 BOE to provide deadline extensions and penalty-interest

23 relief to taxpayers under the alcoholic beverage tax law

24 during a Governor-proclaimed state of emergency.

25 This bill mirrors similar changes made by

1 CDTFA to other special tax and fee programs ensuring
2 equity in administrative efficiency and providing
3 taxpayer assistance during these circumstances.

4 The second bill is Senate Bill 1494 by the
5 Senate Governance and Finance Committee. Which also
6 contains one of the Board-sponsored legislative
7 proposals to amend Revenue and Taxation Code
8 Section 97.68 relating to a sales tax augmentation fund,
9 just to correct references from BOE to CDTFA.

10 That bill was also signed by the Governor on
11 September 19th.

12 And the final Board-sponsored proposal,
13 SB 1496, also authored by the Senate and Governance
14 Finance Committee amends Revenue and Taxation Code
15 Section 32471.5, which would extend the sunset date for
16 the author and compromise program under the alcoholic
17 beverage tax law for an additional five years until
18 January 1st, 2028.

19 That bill was also signed by the Governor on
20 September 2nd.

21 Then AB 1206 by Assemblymember Bennett, which
22 would require that a rental unit continue to be treated
23 as occupied by lower-income households when the income
24 of those occupants increases up to 140 percent of the
25 area's median income, if the owner of that property is a

1 community land trust whose land is leased to low-income
2 households for the fiscal years 2022-23 through 2027-28.

3 So the Board voted at the February Board
4 Meeting to support AB 1206. And that bill is currently
5 awaiting action by the Governor.

6 Next bill is Senate Bill 989 by
7 Senator Hertzberg, which allows certain taxpayers to
8 defer payment of local property taxes with penalty and
9 interest relief, if they have claimed a Proposition 19
10 property tax relief with the county assessor, and have
11 requested deferment with the assessor within one
12 calendar year, but before January 1st, 2024 of receiving
13 first property tax bill -- or the first tax bill for
14 that property.

15 The bill's provisions only apply to LA County
16 right now, but a county may opt into the bill's
17 provisions upon consultation with local officials, and a
18 resolution by the Board of Supervisors.

19 So that bill is currently also awaiting action
20 by the Governor.

21 And the final bill I'm going to highlight is
22 Senate Bill 518 by Senator Laird, which would require
23 the BOE, upon request, to provide confidential taxpayer
24 information on the wine grower tax return and schedule
25 for returns filed on and after January 1st, 2023, unless

1 the taxpayer is an actual person.

2 The bill's provisions require returns to
3 include an opt-out box for taxpayers who do not wish to
4 have their confidential information shared publicly.

5 And that bill was also awaiting action by the
6 Governor.

7 So that's going to conclude my presentation on
8 this item, and I'm available to answer any questions.

9 MS. COHEN: Thank you very much.

10 Mr. Vazquez has a question for you.

11 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you for those updates.

12 And I just had a quick question. And it's
13 partially related to the SB 1494 you mentioned.

14 Which, I understand that the existing property
15 tax law requires that certain revenues non-allocated to
16 the county, cities and special districts, are to be
17 transferred to this educational revenue augmentation
18 fund in that county for school districts, community
19 college districts, and other county office of education.

20 So if the county had significant property tax
21 revenue losses, is the lost split -- evenly split
22 between the education augmentation fund, and the county
23 cities and special districts?

24 MR. WEATHERBY: Thank you for that question.

25 I'm not exactly sure on the specifics.

1 M1, Public Policy Hearings, Proposition 19
2 Implementation.

3 There are no planned staff reports or external
4 speakers for this agenda item for this month's meeting;
5 however, persons who wish to address the Board on this
6 topic as a public comment may do so.

7 AT&T moderator, please let us know if there is
8 anyone on the line who would like to make a public
9 comment regarding this matter.

10 AT&T MODERATOR: Once again, if you'd like to
11 make a public comment, you may press one, then zero.

12 And I see no comments.

13 MS. COHEN: Great. Thank you very much.

14

15 **ITEM M2a**

16

17 MS. CICHETTI: The next item on the agenda is
18 M2a, Public Policy Hearings, Impact of Public Calamities
19 on Property Tax Administration: County Boards of
20 Equalization/Assessment Appeals Boards (AAB) Remote
21 Hearings.

22 There are no planned staff reports or external
23 speakers for this agenda item for this month's meeting;
24 however, persons who wish to address the Board on this
25 topic may do so as a public comment.

1 AT&T MODERATOR: If you'd like to make a
2 public comment at this time, you may press one, and
3 zero.

4 And I see none in queue.

5 MS. CICHETTI: Thank you.

6 The public comment was received by a
7 Michael Pisano. It was received via e-mail to our
8 meeting info mailbox.

9 Hello, BOE.

10 I talked with Michael from the BOE on May 12,
11 2022 at 916-274-3361. And Michael was going to get back
12 to me with answers to my questions.

13 As of today, I have not heard back from
14 Michael.

15 I re-emailed the BOE on September 6, 2022 to
16 change the method of calculations to fairly assess my
17 1968 mobile home.

18 I have been requested to contact the BOE by
19 the Santa Cruz County assessor's office regarding tax
20 section 5801, section 61, and section 62.1 per my notice
21 of supplemental assessment dated October 14, 2021. Also
22 tax sections 62, 63 and 63.1.

23 My County Supervisor also asked me to contact
24 the BOE directly, as did Congressman Jimmy Panetta's
25 support staff, and Senator John Laird's support staff.

1 I bought a membership share in a mobile home
2 park on February 1st, 2021 for \$48,000, and pay a
3 pass-through estimated property tax on the full purchase
4 price of \$235,000 on my 1968 mobile home in my space
5 rent invoice from the park homeowners' association for
6 \$218.56 a month.

7 I also pay HCD fees, and have not voluntarily
8 gone on the tax rolls per section 5801.

9 I understand the nonprofit bought the park
10 that I live in. And this is a pass-through tax for the
11 nonprofit. I want to pay my fair share, but only on the
12 \$48,000 for the stock certificate (membership). But the
13 calculation method is incorrect.

14 I think this would help many seniors with
15 fixed incomes afford to live where they are, and avoid
16 those large outside corporations that buy up mobile home
17 parks and raise space rents to force out residents.

18 Please encourage mobile home co-ops by
19 alleviating this large tax inequity. The only vehicle
20 that may have caused me to pay property tax, which the
21 previous owner did not pay property tax, was the
22 membership share of \$48,000.

23 So if this is the only vehicle, the \$48,000,
24 then it is logical to only pay property tax on the
25 \$48,000, and not on the full purchase price of \$235,000.

1 If I did not buy a membership, then I would
2 only pay HCD fees, since my mobile home was manufactured
3 in 1968.

4 It seems against the laws listed to assess the
5 full 235,000.

6 One, why is the property tax assessment not
7 only on my \$48,000 share, per section 61, a portion
8 thereof?

9 A. This seems usury to tax on the full
10 purchase price of 235,000. This seems unfair and not
11 equitable, based on the past owner's only paying HCD
12 fees.

13 Two, if I own a share of real property, why do
14 I also pay space rent?

15 Three, I pay both property tax and HCD fees,
16 and I never voluntarily went on the tax rolls.

17 A. The previous owners of my unit did not pay
18 property tax, and only paid HCD fees.

19 Four, what happens, God forbid, if the
20 management of the park does not pay the property tax?

21 Five, why would I not be assessed directly and
22 given my own APN number?

23 Six, what is an escape assessment per
24 section 62.1?

25 Seven, I cannot find a tax law to support

1 paying both HCD and property tax on a 1968 mobile home.

2 It only shows either/or, and not both.

3 Thank you for your time.

4 Michael Pisano.

5 MS. COHEN: Could you tell me, where does

6 Mr. Pisano live? Which BOE district he's in?

7 MS. CICHETTI: I'm not sure. But it appears
8 that he was from Santa Cruz. He had gone to the
9 Santa Cruz assessor, I believe. Let me go back to the
10 beginning.

11 MS. COHEN: Okay.

12 MS. CICHETTI: The Santa Cruz County
13 assessor's office.

14 MS. COHEN: Right. Thank you. I appreciate
15 that.

16 Did this person leave contact information?

17 MS. CICHETTI: He did, yes. His telephone
18 number and e-mail address.

19 MS. COHEN: Are there any other --

20 MS. CICHETTI: No other written comments.

21 MS. COHEN: All right. Let's go to the phone
22 line.

23 MS. CICHETTI: We did already prior. The way
24 that we did is fine.

25 MS. COHEN: Well, thank you very much. We

1 will receive that public comment.

2 And is there anything else on the agenda for
3 us?

4 MS. CICHETTI: No. Our last item is the
5 closing remarks for the day.

6 MS. COHEN: All right.

7 I don't have any closing remarks.

8 Colleagues, do you? Do you guys have any?

9 No? Okay.

10 So we will recess the Board Meeting until
11 tomorrow, Wednesday, September 28th, 10:00 a.m.

12 Thank you very much for your service.

13 (Whereupon the Board Meeting concluded.)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

State of California)
) ss
County of Sacramento)

I, Jillian Sumner, Hearing Reporter for the California State Board of Equalization, certify that on August 31, 2022, I recorded verbatim, in shorthand, to the best of my ability, the proceedings in the above-entitled hearing; that I transcribed the shorthand writing into typewriting; and that the preceding pages 1 through 149 constitute a complete and accurate transcription of the shorthand writing.

Dated: October 25, 2022



JILLIAN SUMNER, CSR #13619
Hearing Reporter