

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

BEFORE THE CALIFORNIA STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION
450 N STREET
SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA
STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING
TELECONFERENCE

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT
FEBRUARY 23, 2021

REPORTED BY: Jillian M. Sumner
CSR NO. 13619

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

APPEARING TELEPHONICALLY

For the Board of
Equalization:

- Honorable Antonio Vazquez
Chair
- Honorable Mike Schaefer
Vice Chair
- Honorable Ted Gaines
First District
- Honorable Malia M. Cohen
Second District
- Yvette Stowers
Appearing for Betty T.
Yee, State Controller
(per Government Code
Section 7.9)

For the Board of
Equalization Staff:

- Brenda Fleming
Executive Director
- Henry Nanjo
Chief Counsel
Legal Department
- David Yeung
Deputy Director
Property Tax Department
- Lisa Renati
Chief Deputy Director
- Lisa Thompson
Chief
Taxpayers' Rights Advocates
Office
- Sara Garrett
Appeals Attorney
Legal Department
- Jack McCool
Chief
State-Assessed Properties
Division
- Cathy Taylor
Chief
Board Proceedings Division

---oOo---

	<u>INDEX</u>	
		<u>PAGE NO.</u>
1		
2		
3	Introductions	1
4	Item C1a	13
5	Item C1b	15
6	Item C1b Motion	20
7	Item E3b	20
8	Item E3b Motion	28
9	Item F1	29
10	Item F1 Motion	31
11	Item H1	33
12	Item H1 Motion	35
13	Item J1	35
14	Item J1 Motion	36
15	Item K1a	37
16	Item K1b	38
17	Item K1c	41
18	Item K1d	43
19	Item K3a	45
20	Item K3b	52
21	Item K3b Motion	57
22	Item K5a	58
23	Item K5a Motion	81
24	Item K4a	83
25	Item K4c	83
26	Item K4a and K4c Motion	85
27	//	
28		

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

INDEX CONTINUED

PAGE NO.

Item N	87
Motion to Reopen Roll for K4a and K4c	90
Motion K4a and K4c Restated	91

1 STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

2 TELECONFERENCE

3 FEBRUARY 23, 2021

4 ----oOo----

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: It looks like we have
6 everybody here.

7 So we're going to get this meeting started.
8 If I could just -- is Ms. Taylor on the call?

9 MS. TAYLOR: Yes. Good morning. I'm here.

10 MR. VAZQUEZ: Good morning. Good morning.
11 If we could have you please call the roll.

12 MS. TAYLOR: Certainly.

13 Chairman Vazquez.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Present.

15 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

16 MR. SCHAEFER: Present. Here.

17 MS. TAYLOR: Member Gaines.

18 MR. GAINES: Present.

19 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen.

20 Member Cohen.

21 Deputy Controller Stowers.

22 MS. STOWERS: Present.

23 MR. VAZQUEZ: So we have a quorum present.
24 That will officially start the meeting.

25 If I could just, once again, as we get
26 started here, if I can get you all to stand and we'll
27 start with the pledge of allegiance first.

28 (Whereupon the pledge of allegiance was

1 recited.)

2 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you all.

3 And, just once again, a friendly reminder
4 that we are all sharing the same line. So your
5 patience, obviously, is needed.

6 And if I could just ask once again for all
7 of us Members and any of the participants that we
8 might have on the line today to remind -- remind you
9 all that because we're sharing the same line, we need
10 you to, one, please be -- wait to be recognized, so I
11 can announce who's speaking, and make it as easy as
12 possible for our transcriptionist as she's
13 documenting these minutes.

14 So with that, let me begin.

15 And I wanted to just open up with an
16 announcement first on our agenda. And in case you
17 haven't seen the agenda for today, just wanted to let
18 you know that items G, Rulemaking; K1d, Operational
19 Priorities and Projects; K4a, b, and c, Legislative
20 Division Chief's Report; and M, Public Policy Hearing
21 on Proposition 19 Implementation will be taken up
22 tomorrow. We'll take these up tomorrow, which is the
23 24th, to allow more time.

24 And as we speak, we're having some changes
25 being made to try to give you the latest information
26 we have, especially on the Prop. 19 bill that you've
27 seen that's already out there.

28 So with that, let me have -- if I can have

1 Ms. Taylor please announce our first order of
2 business.

3 MS. TAYLOR: Our -- our first order of
4 business is an announcement regarding the public
5 teleconference participation.

6 Good morning, and thank you for joining
7 today's Board of Equalization meeting via
8 teleconference.

9 Throughout the duration of today's meeting,
10 you will primarily be in a listen-only mode.

11 As you may know from our public agenda
12 notice on our Web site, we have requested that
13 individuals who wish to make a public comment fill
14 out the "public comment submission form" found on our
15 "additional information" Web page in advance of
16 today's meeting.

17 Or, alternatively, participate in today's
18 meeting by providing your public comment live.

19 After the presentation of an item has
20 concluded, we will begin by identifying any public
21 comment requests that have been received by our Board
22 Proceedings staff, with the AT&T operator providing
23 directions for you to identify yourself.

24 After all known public commenters have been
25 called, the operator will also provide public comment
26 instructions to the individuals participating via
27 teleconference.

28 Accordingly, if you intend to make a public

1 comment today, we recommend dialing into the meeting
2 on the teleconference line, as the audio broadcast on
3 our Web site experiences a one- to- three-minute
4 delay.

5 (Whereupon Ms. Cohen became present.)

6 MS. TAYLOR: When giving a public comment,
7 please limit your remarks to three minutes.

8 We ask that everyone who's not intending to
9 make a public comment, please mute their line or
10 minimize background noise.

11 If there are technical difficulties when we
12 are in the public-comment portion of our meeting, we
13 will do our best to read submitted comments into the
14 record at appropriate times.

15 Thank you for your patience and
16 understanding.

17 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Ms. Taylor.

18 And I see Member Cohen has just joined us.
19 And I see a hand up.

20 So welcome. Good morning.

21 MS. COHEN: Thank you. Thank you.

22 Good morning, everyone. It's good to see
23 you.

24 Mr. Chair, I'd like to ask permission just
25 to say a couple of remarks to set the tone honoring
26 Black History Month before we proceed with our
27 agenda.

28 May I have your permission?

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: Sure. Go ahead.

2 MS. COHEN: All right.

3 MR. VAZQUEZ: And I hear the youngest
4 Member.

5 MS. COHEN: Yes. She gets more and more
6 verbal as the days go on.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: That's okay.

8 MS. COHEN: So thanks for giving me an
9 opportunity to -- just to present some ideas. I want
10 to acknowledge my staff that's been tremendously
11 helpful.

12 John and Regina, I appreciate your love and
13 support.

14 Well, good morning, colleagues.

15 In honor of Black History Month, I would
16 just like to take a few minutes to make a few brief
17 remarks.

18 And I truly believe that now is the time for
19 us to begin to reflect on the countless contributions
20 that African Americans have made to various
21 communities that we live, work, play in.

22 And now it's also a time to reflect on the
23 many inequalities that still exist for all of us.

24 In 2020, while we celebrate the election of
25 the first Black woman as the Vice President of the
26 United States of America, we also want to acknowledge
27 the stark racial reckoning facing our country and
28 facing our state.

1 This racial reckoning is exacerbated by
2 COVID-19, a pandemic, and the worst economic downturn
3 since the great depression.

4 Both events have disproportionately impacted
5 the African-American community.

6 However, in the midst of facing countless
7 inequities over the years, we, as a people, have
8 found the resolve, we have found the determination
9 and the strength to still make incredible
10 contributions to our country and to our state.

11 While we remember that it was Harriet Tubman
12 who led the enslaved people to freedom through the
13 Underground Railroad.

14 And we remember Thurgood Marshall, the great
15 jurist. The first African American Supreme Court
16 Justice who founded the NAACP Legal Defense Fund and
17 Educational Fund, and successfully argued the
18 landmark case of Brown v. The Board of Education.

19 And we remember Mary Fields. Mary Fields
20 may not be a familiar name for some folks that are
21 listening. But Mary Fields was born enslaved. She
22 was the first Black woman to work for the United
23 States Postal Service. And she never missed a day of
24 work. And so much so that she was named -- she
25 earned the name Stagecoach Mary.

26 Also want to recognize Charles Houston, who
27 was the Dean of Howard University. Which is the same
28 university that our Vice President graduated from.

1 And as the Dean, he trained a generation of
2 Black lawyers who fought for civil rights. And
3 Howard University of Law still continues to train
4 Black lawyers.

5 A name that we might also recall is Ruby
6 Bridges. Ruby Bridges is a six-year-old little girl
7 that took the historic walk to school, integrating an
8 all-white elementary school in Louisiana.

9 We also remember Claudette Colvin, a
10 15-year-old girl who refused to give up her seat nine
11 months before Rosa Parks did, who was more successful
12 in kicking off the Civil Rights protest. But
13 actually it was Claudette Colvin who was the first.
14 And she was 15 years old.

15 Bessie Coleman, who was the first Black
16 woman to earn a pilot's license.

17 So it's with sorrow that we remember four
18 girls, Addie Mae Collins, Carole Denise McNair,
19 Carole Robinson, and Cynthia Dionne Wesley, 14, ages
20 11 through 14, who were murdered in 1963 in the
21 bombing of a Sixteenth Street Baptist Church in
22 Birmingham, Alabama.

23 So needless to say, these are just
24 highlighted examples. And I frankly could go on and
25 on in celebration, and also in sorrow and sadness
26 about the contributions that African-American people
27 have made to this great country and to our state.

28 All of whom have made it possible for me to

1 be here. These are the shoulders of the folks of the
2 men and women that I stand on to be on this esteemed
3 body as a constitutional officer.

4 But this year we face this darkness. A dark
5 moment of inequity and continued systemic racism.

6 I challenge all who can hear my voice to dig
7 deep and reflect on what side of history you want to
8 be remembered on.

9 I think I'm in good company when I say we
10 are joining together and working together to end this
11 inequity system of racism.

12 Every child, regardless the color of their
13 skin or zip code, must have an opportunity to realize
14 Dr. Martin Luther King's dream. A dream that's not
15 materialized just yet. But we are working every day
16 to make happen.

17 This Black History Month I want -- I ask
18 that you have the courage, the courage to have
19 conversations with family members and friends about
20 systemic racism. And many of you on this call have
21 had these conversations.

22 I want to acknowledge the many conversations
23 I've had with Senator Gaines, delightful
24 conversations that I really do cherish.

25 Thank you, Senator Gaines.

26 And I want people to move outside their
27 comfort zones. Say something when you see something,
28 an inequity, an imbalance, an injustice that's

1 happening. Have that courage. Make a decision to
2 hire or promote someone that doesn't look like you.
3 We must do everything that we can at all -- at all
4 walks.

5 I strongly believe that we must be conscious
6 and consistent about the policy decisions that we
7 make that impact the economic progress and
8 opportunities for Black families.

9 And when we speak about addressing the
10 wealth gap, our words must be more than just
11 rhetoric. We've actually got to put some action and
12 some energy behind those words.

13 We must be more thoughtful and careful when
14 we consider the impacts of such measures of Prop. 19
15 that take away the hard-earned economic progress of
16 Black families who fought for their own family homes.

17 And we must look at all the actions of
18 government with a critical eye. It's going to take a
19 lot of work and a lot of courage to do that.

20 I would like to say in closing that this is
21 one of my favorite songs as I get older. It's "Lift
22 Every Voice and Sing." And you might have heard
23 Dr. Weber talk about this song in previous speeches.
24 But we're singing a song full of faith and of the
25 dark pasts, and what it has taught us. And we're
26 singing a song all full of hope that the present has
27 brought us. So let's continue to march on till
28 victory is won.

1 Mr. Chair, I appreciate you giving me a few
2 minutes. Well, maybe a few more than a few minutes.
3 But thank you for allowing me an opportunity to make
4 this address. It was on my heart, and I just really
5 wanted to share it with everyone that's listening,
6 and colleagues.

7 Thank you, colleagues. Thanks for serving
8 with me. It's a pleasure.

9 Thank you.

10 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you for those remarks.
11 And really appreciate the -- just, you know, putting
12 it out there.

13 Because I think so many times we go through
14 our daily lives, and we assume things just happened.
15 But there was a lot of struggle, and a lot of lives
16 were lost over the years.

17 MR. SCHAEFER: This is Vice Chair Schaefer.
18 I want to comment.

19 MR. VAZQUEZ: Vice Chair Schaefer, go
20 ahead.

21 MR. SCHAEFER: I want to compliment Malia
22 Cohen on her very gentle and poignant remarks, and
23 add a few of my own.

24 Before we get started this morning, I wanted
25 to recognize from our district that February is Black
26 History Month. Being in my 80s, I enjoy the wisdom
27 and benefit of the ages. And I can remember when
28 society treated African-American citizens quite

1 differently than they do today.

2 I have a long history as an ally and friend
3 to the Black community dating back to when I
4 represented southeast San Diego on the San Diego City
5 Council in the 1960s.

6 I opened up a hotel business in Catalina
7 Island to house Count Basie and his big-band
8 orchestra, when none of the other hotels in Catalina
9 had any vacancies for them when they sent 20 of their
10 musicians over there to entertain the public.

11 In recent months I've spoken out against the
12 murder of George Floyd and demanded police
13 accountability.

14 I'm looking to the future as we continue to
15 promote equal justice under law, and the black lives
16 in our state and country. And I'm proud to be a
17 little part of that.

18 Thank you.

19 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

20 And I see a hand from Member Gaines.

21 Go ahead, Member Gaines.

22 MR. GAINES: Thank you so much.

23 I wanted to thank Malia Cohen for the
24 wonderful comments. Really appreciate that. And
25 recognizing Black History Month and how important
26 that is.

27 I had the pleasure of going through the
28 Black History Museum in Washington, D.C. the last

1 time we visited there. And it was so rich, and so
2 educational in terms of Black history, and how we
3 have to continue to be vigilant in making sure that
4 people are treated fairly.

5 Blacks have a history in our nation that we
6 have to be subconscious of, and we need to recognize
7 and make sure that everybody is treated equally.

8 And Martin Luther King, you know, he was
9 so -- such a great representative in terms of how he
10 dealt with the race issue in bringing it forward.

11 And as a Christian, I -- I share the same
12 faith as Martin Luther King. And he talked about the
13 content of individual's character, and how important
14 that is, and how we need to make sure that people of
15 a leveled playing field have an opportunity to excel.
16 Because that is the richness of America. And we need
17 to continue to strive to satisfy those dreams that
18 Member Cohen spoke of.

19 Thank you.

20 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

21 Anybody else?

22 Seeing no others, thank you once again.

23 And with that, we will go ahead and
24 officially begin our first item.

25 If I could have Ms. Taylor please call our
26 first item.

27 //

28

1 of this month.

2 We will, as always, continue to make
3 ourselves -- make ourselves available to any state
4 assessees that would like to meet with us to discuss
5 any matter.

6 Thank you, Mr. Chairman and Members of the
7 Board.

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

9 Are there any additional speakers in the
10 audience here, Ms. Taylor, on this one?

11 MS. TAYLOR: At this time, we don't have any
12 scheduled speakers, nor any written comments. So we
13 could proceed to open the public line.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Sure. Let's do that.

15 MS. TAYLOR: AT&T moderator, we will now
16 take public comment on State Assessees' Presentations
17 on Capitalization Rates and Other Factors.

18 Each caller will have up to three minutes to
19 speak.

20 For the record, we would request that
21 callers provide their name.

22 Is there anyone on the line who would like
23 to make a public comment regarding this matter?

24 AT&T OPERATOR: And, ladies and gentlemen,
25 for public comment, you may press 1, then 0 on your
26 telephone keypad.

27 If you are using a speaker phone, you may
28 need to pick up the handset before pressing the

1 numbers.

2 Again, for public comment, you may press 1,
3 then 0.

4 I have no one queuing up at this time for
5 public comment.

6 Please continue.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

8 Members, are there any questions from the
9 Board of Mr. McCool?

10 Seeing and hearing none, Ms. Taylor, why
11 don't we call the next item.

12

13

ITEM C1b

14

---o0o---

15

16

17

18

19

20

MS. TAYLOR: The next sub item, C1b,
Property Taxes, State Assessee's Presentations on
Capitalization Rates and Other Factors Affecting
Fiscal Year 2021 to '22, Taxable Values for Private
Railroad Cars, presented by Mr. McCool.

21

22

23

MR. McCOOL: Mr. Chairman and Members of the
Board, again, Jack McCool with the State-Assessed
Properties Division.

24

25

26

27

Property Tax Rule 903 also provides private
railroad car taxpayers an opportunity to make public
presentations to the Board on factors affecting the
taxable value of private railroad cars.

28

Again, I am not aware of any private

1 railroad car assessees that are planning to make a
2 presentation today; however, their annual property
3 statements are due on April 30th.

4 And they have another opportunity to make
5 public presentations to the Board in April as they so
6 choose.

7 Thank you.

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

9 Ms. Taylor, do we have any other speakers on
10 this item?

11 MS. TAYLOR: At this time, we do not have
12 any scheduled speakers, and we do not have any
13 written comments. So we may proceed to AT&T.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank --

15 AT&T OPERATOR: Ladies and gentlemen, for
16 public comment, you may press 1, then 0 on your
17 telephone keypad. Again, that is 1, then 0.

18 I have no one queuing up at this time.

19 Please continue.

20 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

21 Members, are there any other questions of
22 Mr. McCool on this item?

23 Seeing no hands, I will assume we're all
24 good.

25 Ms. Taylor, would you please call the next
26 item.

27 MS. TAYLOR: Certainly.

28

1 opinion for this consolidated case to memorialize the
2 decision made by the Board in November 2020.

3 If adopted, the decision will be posted to
4 the BOE Web site to fulfill the Board's obligations
5 under Section 40, allowing for transparency and
6 memorialization of the Board's decision.

7 At this time, staff recommends that the
8 Board adopt the non-presidential Section 40 written
9 decision for the consolidated case of Lodi Gas
10 Storage and Wild Goose Storage, LLC.

11 MR. VAZQUEZ: Members, are there any
12 questions before I entertain a motion to adopt staff
13 recommendation here?

14 Seeing and hearing none, I'd like to
15 entertain --

16 MR. SCHAEFER: Vice Chair Schaefer, so
17 moved.

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: So it's been moved by
19 Member Schaefer to adopt --

20 MS. STOWERS: Second.

21 MR. VAZQUEZ: -- staff summary decision and
22 recommendation.

23 MS. STOWERS: Second.

24 MR. VAZQUEZ: And then I see a second by
25 Ms. Stowers.

26 MS. STOWERS: Yes. Second.

27 MR. VAZQUEZ: Seeing no other comments or
28 questions, Ms. Taylor, can we please call the roll.

1 MS. TAYLOR: Would we like to open this item
2 to public comment?

3 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes. I'm sorry. I thought we
4 did. Or -- go ahead. Let's do that.

5 MS. TAYLOR: Let's see. There are no
6 scheduled speakers nor written comments.

7 AT&T moderator, we will now take public
8 comment on Tax Program Nonappearance Matters,
9 Adjudicatory Legal Appeals.

10 Each caller will have up to three minutes to
11 speak.

12 For the record, we request that callers
13 provide their names.

14 Is anyone on the line who would like to make
15 a public comment regarding this matter?

16 AT&T OPERATOR: And for public comment,
17 please press 1, then 0 on your telephone keypad.

18 I have no one queuing up on the phone.
19 Please continue.

20 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

21 Ms. Taylor, let's go ahead and -- if we can
22 get a roll call on the motion.

23 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman Vazquez.

24 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

25 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

26 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

27 MS. TAYLOR: Member Gaines.

28 MR. GAINES: Aye.

1 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen.

2 MS. COHEN: Aye.

3 MS. TAYLOR: Deputy Controller Stowers.

4 MS. STOWERS: Aye.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: So that's unanimous.

6 With that, Ms. Taylor, if you would please
7 call the next item.

8

9

ITEM E3b

10

---o0o---

11

12 MS. TAYLOR: The next item is E3b, Tax
13 Program Nonappearance Matters, Adjudicatory Legal
14 Appeals Property Tax matters, Section 40 matters.

15 Southern California Edison Company, (01480)
16 1064117.

17 Contribution disclosure forms are required
18 for these items.

19 Ms. Garrett will present.

20 MS GARRETT: Good morning again, Chairman
21 Vazquez and Honorable Members of the Board. Sarah
22 Garrett, Appeals Attorney with the Board's Legal
23 Department.

24 As you may recall, the Southern California
25 Edison case was heard and decided by this Board in
26 December 2020.

27 Under Revenue and Taxation Code Section 40,
28 the Board is required to adopt a written decision

1 where the amount in controversy exceeds 500,000 in
2 tax.

3 As this case meets the Section 40 threshold,
4 I have prepared for your consideration a draft
5 non-presidential written decision for this case to
6 memorialize the decision made by the Board in
7 December 2020.

8 If adopted, the decision will be posted to
9 the BOE Web site to fulfill the Board's obligation
10 under Section 40, allowing for transparency and
11 memorialization of the Board's decision.

12 So consistent with that, at this time staff
13 recommends the Board adopt the non-presidential
14 written decision for Southern California Edison.

15 MR. VAZQUEZ: Members, are there any -- any
16 questions of Ms. Garrett, or comments?

17 Yes. I see Member Cohen.

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: You're muted, Member Cohen.
19 Go ahead.

20 Member Cohen, can you hear me? There you
21 go.

22 MS. COHEN: I'm -- I'm here. I'm juggling
23 my documents. I'm sorry.

24 I just wanted to announce that I'm not going
25 to be able to participate in the Southern California
26 Edison matter. I just wanted to get that on the
27 record.

28 Thank you.

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.
2 Any other comments or questions on this one?
3 MR. GAINES: Yeah. This is Member Gaines,
4 if I could.
5 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes. Go ahead, Member
6 Gaines.
7 MR. GAINES: Yeah. Chair Vazquez, I just
8 wanted to clarify, I will be abstaining on this.
9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Okay.
10 Anybody else?
11 MR. SCHAEFER: This is Vice Chair
12 Schaefer.
13 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes.
14 MR. SCHAEFER: Chair Vazquez, aren't we sort
15 of obligated on this? We -- having had hearings back
16 in December and having made a wise decision, more or
17 less, at that time?
18 I don't know if without a change in -- a
19 substantial change in circumstances, if there's any
20 wiggle room. And I'd like to have discretion when I
21 vote on something. It looks to me if I don't vote on
22 this, we can't proceed.
23 MR. VAZQUEZ: Is our Legal -- is Hen -- is
24 Mr. Nanjo on the line?
25 MR. NANJO: Yes, I am, Chairman Vazquez.
26 At this point, there's still -- the Deputy
27 Controller may vote on this matter. So there is
28 still enough to support the vote.

1 Unless Vice Chairman Schaefer has a basis to
2 not vote, or decides not to vote in favor of this,
3 then in which case we would have to go to -- there
4 are other methodologies by which the vote can still
5 be supported.

6 MR. VAZQUEZ: I hear -- you're muted. Go
7 ahead, Vice Chair Schaefer.

8 MR. SCHAEFER: I have no conflict here, and
9 I will be voting. So we can -- that's a hands up.
10 Thank you.

11 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, Member Cohen. Go
12 ahead.

13 MS. COHEN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
14 So at the December 16th, 2020 Board Meeting
15 I didn't participate in the matter of the petition
16 for the reassessment of the unitary value for
17 Southern California Edison.

18 So in accordance with this action, I'm not
19 going to be participating in the vote. I just want
20 to be consistent. And I'm happy to be on the record.

21 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

22 MS. STOWERS: Chairman Vazquez.

23 MR. VAZQUEZ: I'm sorry. Ms. Stowers. Go
24 ahead, Ms. Stowers.

25 MS. STOWERS: I appreciate Ms. Cohen
26 clarifying that she's not voting because she didn't
27 participate on the underlying case.

28 Mr. Nanjo, correct me if I'm wrong, but

1 we've already -- the Board, the 5-Member Board has
2 already taken action on the case in December. So
3 what we're doing now is just approving the summary
4 decision.

5 But a decision has already been made on the
6 assessment value. And I understand Mr. Gaines not
7 wanting to -- or he's abstaining, because he voted no
8 on the underlying case. So it would not be
9 consistent for him to vote yes on the summary
10 decision.

11 And then for those who are --

12 MR. NANJO: Again --

13 MS. STOWERS: -- questioning why I'm
14 voting -- if you are questioning -- if you care, I'm
15 voting because Controller Yee did participate in that
16 decision in December. So she exercised certain
17 constitutional functions.

18 And so when she does that, I can go ahead
19 and do the administrative side, adopt summary
20 decisions, adopt Section 40 cases. And we have
21 precedent on that.

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: All right.

23 MR. GAINES: Member Gaines, if I could.

24 MR. VAZQUEZ: Oh, Member Gaines. I'm sorry.
25 Go ahead.

26 MR. GAINES: That was well described by
27 Member Stowers. So that's why I'm abstaining,
28 because I voted no prior on this.

1 Thank you.

2 MR. VAZQUEZ: And, Member Cohen, is that
3 hand still up? Is that an old hand? You're good?

4 Okay. With that, let me just entertain a
5 motion to approve the summary stated by staff on this
6 particular matter.

7 MR. SCHAEFER: Vice Chair Schaefer. I so
8 move.

9 MS. STOWERS: Second.

10 MR. VAZQUEZ: Moved by our Vice Chair, and
11 seconded by Ms. Stowers.

12 With that, Ms. Taylor, if we can have a roll
13 call of those able to vote.

14 Is Ms. Taylor there?

15 You're probably muted, Ms. Taylor.

16 MS. TAYLOR: Chair --

17 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes. I'm getting some back
18 noise from you I think.

19 And, Ms. Taylor?

20 While we wait for Ms. Taylor, maybe -- is
21 AT&T available? Can we just check if there's anybody
22 wanting to comment on this item before we vote?

23 Is AT&T available?

24 Is Ms. Taylor available?

25 AT&T OPERATOR: Okay. I just want to make
26 sure you can hear AT&T on this line.

27 MR. VAZQUEZ: I can hear you now.

28 AT&T OPERATOR: Oh, thank you.

1 Let me check for questions again. Just a
2 moment.

3 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

4 AT&T OPERATOR: Somehow the line got muted.
5 I apologize.

6 Just a moment.

7 Ladies and gentlemen, for public comment,
8 please press 1, then 0 on your telephone keypad.

9 I have no one queuing up on the phone at
10 this time.

11 Please continue.

12 MR. NANJO: Chairman Vazquez, this is Chief
13 Counsel Henry Nanjo. Can you hear me?

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, I can hear you. Go
15 ahead.

16 MR. NANJO: Okay. Thank you.

17 We had a situation. I wasn't able to speak
18 while Deputy Controller Stowers was making her
19 comments, and I might have missed some of it.

20 But, just for the record, I believe
21 Ms. Deputy Controller Stowers stated it
22 appropriately.

23 What the Board is doing in this action is
24 merely confirming that the summary decision that
25 was -- that was prepared by Ms. Garrett is an
26 accurate reflection of the decision that took place
27 at the last -- at the last meeting in December --
28 excuse me December meeting.

1 And, therefore, whether Members abstained,
2 or voted against, or what have you, as long as they
3 are confident that it is an accurate representation
4 of what occurred at the meeting, they can still
5 support.

6 Now, obviously, if they choose for other
7 reasons not to vote or what have you, that's their
8 option. But that is also why Deputy Controller can
9 participate, because the decision is already made.

10 This is merely confirming that the document
11 that was prepared is an adequate or appropriate
12 reflection of what occurred in December.

13 Thank you.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

15 AT&T OPERATOR: And excuse the interruption.
16 This is the AT&T operator. I just want to let you
17 know we have someone queuing up on the phone.

18 Would you like to have the person say their
19 public comment at this time on the phone?

20 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, please. I'm sorry.

21 AT&T OPERATOR: Oh, thank you. I have line
22 No. 43 for public comment.

23 If you can please state your name and
24 affiliation, if you have an affiliation.

25 Thank you.

26 MS. MORGAN: Hi. This is Allison Morgan
27 with AT&T. I was having technical difficulties
28 getting in when you asked if you -- when they asked

1 if you needed a comment from an AT&T representative.

2 We didn't have any objection at this time to
3 the audit matter that is currently on the agenda.

4 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

5 Anybody else, Ms. Taylor, or AT&T, or is
6 that it?

7 AT&T OPERATOR: On the phones for AT&T, we
8 have no one else in the queue.

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

10 And, Ms. Taylor, do we have any written
11 comments on this?

12 MS. TAYLOR: We do not.

13 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

14 With that, why don't we go ahead and call
15 the roll on the motion then.

16 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman Vazquez.

17 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

18 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

19 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

20 MS. TAYLOR: Deputy Controller Stowers.

21 MS. STOWERS: Aye.

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: Shall we have --

23 MS. TAYLOR: Noting Member Gaines --

24 MR. VAZQUEZ: Oh, I'm sorry. And then
25 Member Gaines abstains, right?

26 MS. TAYLOR: Yes. And Member Cohen not
27 participating.

28 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes. All right. We have that

1 down for the record. But we do have three in
2 support, so that moves forward.

3 And with that, Ms. Taylor, if you could
4 please call the next item.

5

6

ITEM F1

7

---o0o---

8

9 MS. TAYLOR: The next item is F1, Other Tax
10 Program Nonappearance Matters, Property Tax Matters
11 Audit.

12 Mr. McCool will present two items for your
13 consideration, which may be voted on individually or
14 collectively.

15 Contribution disclosure forms are not
16 required for these items.

17 As these matters are constitutional
18 functions. Ms. Stowers is not participating in
19 accordance with Government Code Section 7.9.

20 Mr. McCool will present.

21 MR. McCOOL: Good morning again,
22 Mr. Chairman and Honorable Members of the Board.

23 Jack McCool, Chief of the State-Assessed
24 Properties Division once again.

25 The State-Assessed Properties Division
26 performs routine audits of state assessees under the
27 authority of the California Revenue and Taxation Code
28 Section 828, and Government Code Section 15618.

1 The purpose of a property tax audit is to
2 determine the accuracy, completeness and reliability
3 of the financial data furnished by state assessees
4 and used by the Board's valuation process.

5 Audits also include an internal review of
6 the methods, calculations and assumptions used by the
7 State-Assessed Properties Division.

8 Before you today for your consideration are
9 two property tax audits completed by State-Assessed
10 Properties Division staff.

11 Both assessees have been presented with a
12 copy of the audit report. And both assessees are in
13 agreement with the findings of their respective
14 reports.

15 I ask -- I'm available to answer any
16 questions. I ask for your adoption.

17 Thank you.

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: Members, are there any
19 questions or comments of staff?

20 Member Cohen, is that hand an old hand?

21 Oh, you're good? Okay.

22 MS. COHEN: No, sir. I don't have any
23 questions. Let me put this hand down. There we
24 go.

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: Perfect. Okay.

26 MS. COHEN: Sorry about that.

27 MR. VAZQUEZ: Anybody else?

28 Seeing no hands or comments of staff,

1 Ms. Taylor, are there any written comments from the
2 public on this?

3 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman, there are no written
4 comments on this item.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: Can we check with AT&T if
6 there's anybody in the public?

7 MS. TAYLOR: Certainly.

8 AT&T moderator, we will now take public
9 comment on Other Tax Program Nonappearance Matters
10 Audits.

11 Each caller will have up to three minutes to
12 speak.

13 For the record, we request that the public
14 commenters provide their name.

15 Is anyone on the line who would like to make
16 a public comment regarding this matter?

17 AT&T MODERATOR: And, ladies and gentlemen,
18 for public comment, you may press 1, then 0 on your
19 telephone keypad.

20 I have no one queuing up for public comment.
21 Please continue.

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

23 With that, Members, I'd like to entertain a
24 motion to adopt the staff's summary decision and
25 recommendation here.

26 MR. GAINES: So moved.

27 MR. VAZQUEZ: It's been moved by Member
28 Gaines.

1 MS. COHEN: Second.

2 MR. VAZQUEZ: And seconded by Member
3 Cohen.

4 Seeing no other hands or comments or
5 questions, Ms. Taylor, can we have a roll call
6 vote.

7 MR. NANJO: And just for the record -- I'm
8 sorry to interrupt, Chairman Vazquez. I just want
9 the record to be clear.

10 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes.

11 MR. NANJO: This is not a summary decision.
12 It's the audit findings.

13 MR. VAZQUEZ: I'm sorry. So it's an audit
14 finding, not a summary decision. Yes. Thank you.

15 MR. NANJO: Thank you very much.

16 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman Vazquez.

17 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

18 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

19 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

20 MS. TAYLOR: Member Gaines.

21 MR. GAINES: Aye.

22 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen.

23 MS. COHEN: Aye.

24 MR. VAZQUEZ: Oh, and, Ms. Stowers, I'm
25 sorry. She can't vote on this anyways.

26 So with that, it's unanimous of those that
27 are able to participate.

28 And we'll move forward if -- Ms. Taylor, if

1 you would please call the next item.

2

3

ITEM H1

4

---o0o---

5

6

MS. TAYLOR: The next item is H1, Chief
7 Counsel Matters, Property and Special Taxes, Board
8 Consideration of Findings and Decision, GATX
9 Corporation, (0503) 1064217.

10

Contribution disclosure forms are not
11 required. Ms. Garrett will present.

12

MS. GARRETT: Good morning again, Chairman
13 Vazquez and Honorable Members of the Board.

14

Sarah Garrett, Appeals Attorney with the
15 Board's Legal Department.

16

As you'll recall, the Board heard and
17 decided the GATX petition in December 2020.

18

The petitioner requested a findings and
19 decision from the Board to memorialize the decision
20 the Board took in December.

21

Accordingly, I have prepared a draft
22 non-presidential summary decision for the Board's
23 consideration. If adopted, it will be distributed to
24 the petitioner in satisfaction of their appeal
25 rights.

26

So at this time staff recommends the Board
27 adopt the non-presidential written decision prepared
28 for GATX.

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, Ms. Garrett.
2 Members, are there any questions of
3 Ms. Garrett?

4 Seeing no hands or comments, Ms. Taylor, are
5 there any written comments on this item?

6 MS. TAYLOR: There are no written comments
7 on this item.

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Can we check with AT&T if
9 anybody is on the line.

10 MS. TAYLOR: Yes.

11 AT&T moderator, we will now take public
12 comment on Board Consideration of Findings and
13 Decisions.

14 Each caller will have up to three minutes to
15 speak.

16 For the record, we request that the callers
17 provide their name.

18 Is anyone on the line who would like to make
19 a public comment regarding this matter?

20 AT&T OPERATOR: And, ladies and gentlemen,
21 for public comment, please press 1, then 0 on your
22 telephone keypad.

23 I have no one queuing up on the phone.

24 Please continue.

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

26 Members, I'd like to entertain a motion to
27 adopt the staff summary decision and recommendation
28 by Ms. Garrett.

1 MS. STOWERS: Deputy Controller Stowers
2 here. So move approval of the summary decision.

3 MR. VAZQUEZ: It's been moved by
4 Ms. Stowers.

5 MR. SCHAEFER: Vice Chair Schaefer
6 seconds.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: Vice Chair Schaefer seconds.

8 Seeing no hands or comments, Ms. Taylor, if
9 you would please call the roll.

10 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman Vazquez.

11 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

12 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

13 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

14 MS. TAYLOR: Member Gaines.

15 MR. GAINES: Aye.

16 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen.

17 MS. COHEN: Aye.

18 MS. TAYLOR: Deputy Controller Stowers.

19 MS. STOWERS: Aye.

20 MR. VAZQUEZ: So that's unanimous of those
21 present.

22 Ms. Taylor, if you could please call the
23 next item.

24 **ITEM J1**

25 ---o0o---

26
27 MS. TAYLOR: The next item is J1,
28 Administrative Consent Agenda, Approval of the Board

1 Meeting Minutes for January 14th and 15th, 2021.

2 The minutes were from this Board Meeting,
3 January 14th through 15th, 2021 were distributed to
4 the Board on February 12, 2021.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: Members, are there any
6 questions or comments to our minutes?

7 Seeing none, can we -- I'd like to entertain
8 a motion to approve the minutes as presented.

9 MR. SCHAEFER: Vice Chair Schaefer. I --

10 MR. VAZQUEZ: You're muted there.

11 MR. SCHAEFER: Vice Chair Schaefer. I move
12 to approve.

13 MR. VAZQUEZ: It's been moved to approve the
14 minutes.

15 MR. GAINES: Second.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: And second by Member Gaines.

17 Seeing no other comments or questions,
18 Ms. Taylor, if you would please call the roll on the
19 minutes on the motion.

20 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman -- Chairman Vazquez.

21 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

22 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

23 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

24 MS. TAYLOR: Member Gaines.

25 MR. GAINES: Aye.

26 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen.

27 MS. COHEN: Aye.

28 MS. TAYLOR: Deputy Controller Stowers.

1 MS. STOWERS: Aye.

2 MR. VAZQUEZ: So that's unanimous of those
3 present. The minutes have been approved.

4 Ms. Taylor, if I could get you to call the
5 next item.

6 **ITEM K1a**
7 **---o0o---**
8

9 MS. TAYLOR: The next item is K1a, Executive
10 Director's Report, which will provide an
11 organizational update and report on the status of
12 pending and upcoming organizational issues, presented
13 by Ms. Fleming.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Ms. Fleming.

15 MS. FLEMING: Good morning, Chairman Vazquez
16 and Honorable Members. I'm Brenda Fleming, Executive
17 Director.

18 Today's report will provide updates on many
19 of the operational matters, except for our Prop. 19
20 work, which we will exclusively discuss at tomorrow's
21 February 24th Board Meeting.

22 Members, organizationally, first, I'm proud
23 to share the good work performed by staff as they
24 maintain the operational workload and projects,
25 continue making great progress on recruitments as we
26 settle into our new headquarter's office space,
27 perform the broad range of tax administration duties,
28 perform our state agency administrative duties, and

1 implement the provisions of Prop. 19.

2 I don't want to steal their thunder, as each
3 manager will report on the work in their respective
4 areas. But I want to acknowledge their
5 professionalism, their subject-matter expertise, and
6 to their commitment to the success of our tax
7 administration responsibility.

8 If I could draw your attention, Members, to
9 K1b, which is the Board Workgroup Structure.

10

11

ITEM K1b

12

---o0o---

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

MS. FLEMING: In 2019 Board Member Cohen proposed the establishment of a committee structure for Board Members to engage in policy discussions, address emergency and/or urgent issues, and lead committee hearings on property tax administration and modernization efforts.

20

21

22

23

24

25

While our progress in this area has been slow, it certainly has not been forgotten. We have, however, been successful at leveraging the benefits of a committee structure, and the form of our informational hearings, our Board Workgroup, and our public policy hearings.

26

27

28

All of these forums have been contributed to our property tax modernization goals. It helps with our public education objective, and allowed us to

1 receive input and proposals from a range of
2 distinguished speakers and subject-matter experts,
3 including assessors, Assessment Appeals Board,
4 taxpayers, and other interested parties. All on
5 property tax administration policy and practices.

6 In December of 2020 Board Member Cohen
7 requested that we revisit a committee structure for
8 Board Members to engage in significant policy
9 discussions in a format that does not require the
10 full use of agency resources that are normally
11 required for regular Board Meetings.

12 Taking advantage, Members, of the many
13 lessons learned from committees, from our workgroups
14 and the informational hearing, coupled with the need
15 to establish a forum for Board Members to address
16 property tax matters that are broader than our
17 standard meeting agenda -- our standard meeting
18 agenda procedures and norms.

19 I would propose a structure that includes
20 the benefits realized from these other forums,
21 including the needed guidelines and procedures.

22 The proposal will be presented at our March
23 Board Meeting for discussion and possible action.
24 Much more detail will be provided in written form
25 also at the March meeting.

26 In brief, however, the structure could
27 include two types of forums: A, an ad hoc workgroup
28 or committee structure; and B, a standing workgroup

1 committee structure.

2 For example, an ad hoc would address
3 emerging or urgent issues, would meet to
4 expeditiously examine and research issues in order to
5 recommend immediate or short-term solutions.

6 A standing committee, for example, would
7 address complex matters with broad scope. Those that
8 require more lengthy studies and examination in order
9 to propose solutions with longer-term implementation
10 time lines.

11 A standing committee would be similar in
12 some terms, mostly in terms of processes, to our
13 interested parties meetings for example, but
14 certainly would not replace -- again, would not
15 replace our interested parties meeting.

16 The proposal will include the criteria to
17 determine which structure to utilize, procedural
18 rules, recommended roles and responsibilities, and
19 suggested work flow.

20 I'll pause for now, but will provide much
21 more detail with a more fully developed proposal in
22 the March timeline.

23 If I may, Members, K1c on the agenda is
24 regarding the BOE advisory council.

25
26
27
28

//

1 a few.

2 The meeting involved a series of
3 presentations made by staff that informed and updated
4 the stakeholders on activities in each organizational
5 department, followed then by open discussion with the
6 Members and staff -- the membership and staff for
7 information exchanged and just general partnering.

8 The advisory council members, the meetings
9 were formally organized, including bylaws, meeting
10 structure, membership, voting rights, etc.

11 Having had the pleasure of participating in
12 advisory council meetings and having the benefit of
13 talking with prior Executive Directors about their
14 experience, I propose that it is now indeed a good
15 time to reestablish the council meeting to enrich my
16 relationship with an extraordinary community of
17 partners, and property tax administration, and state
18 government operations.

19 Again, Members, this month's report is just
20 a report out to give you an update on its progress.
21 I will provide a more detailed plan for
22 reestablishing the advisory council at our March
23 Board Meeting for your discussion and possible
24 decision and action.

25 Members, as we continue on the path forward
26 to modernize our property tax system, I look forward
27 to working with you on these and the many other items
28 designed to rebuild our agency and strengthen our

1 ability to better serve our taxpayers.

2 That, Members, concludes my portion of this
3 month's report.

4 Again, I don't want to steal the thunder
5 from the staff, who will go through a lot more detail
6 with you.

7 And unless there are questions, I will
8 direct it to Ms. Renati.

9 Thank you, Members.

10

11

ITEM K1d

12

---o0o---

13

14 MS. RENATI: Chairman Vazquez and Honorable
15 Members, I am Lisa Renati, Chief Deputy Director.

16 The implementation of Prop. 19 requires a
17 great deal of planning and operational work. As one
18 of our top priorities, staff has drilled down into
19 the details of the provisions to ensure the necessary
20 guidance, forms, systems' processes, procedures and
21 communications are in place.

22 Additionally, we have continued to manage
23 and perform all other duties and responsibilities,
24 both operational and strategic.

25 To ensure that you're kept informed, I will
26 highlight some of the other priorities and projects.

27 The first is our workforce capacity. As of
28 January 31st, we had 35 vacant positions in various

1 stages of the active recruitment process. This
2 accounts for 82 percent of our agency vacancies.

3 Over the last few months, we have
4 significantly increased recruitment activities in
5 order to reduce the number of vacancies. Three
6 positions were filled in January; two new hires, and
7 one internal promotion.

8 Filling our vacancies continues to be one of
9 our top priorities. We are pleased that our
10 recruitment strategies are resulting in attracting
11 and hiring many more talented professionals to our
12 agency.

13 In addition to our recruitment, our
14 succession plan is yielding the knowledge transfer,
15 improved documentation and processes results needed
16 to help optimize our work force capacity.

17 The second item is our office relocation
18 project. The construction of our headquarter offices
19 in Natomas is completed, and with a few final touches
20 to be completed by the end of this month.

21 We are thankful for the partner -- for our
22 partners and team members who contributed to this
23 project's success.

24 Members, due to COVID-19 guidelines to
25 ensure the safety of our staff, the majority of the
26 BOE staff continue to telework, with a small portion
27 of staff rotating and coming into the office to
28 handle essential business operations.

1 We continue to follow all safety measures as
2 provided by the California Department of Health to
3 ensure the safety of all of our staff.

4 And with that, Members, this concludes my
5 brief report on the agency's day-to-day operational
6 priorities.

7 As noted on the agenda before you, I will
8 provide a separate report regarding our Prop. 19
9 implementation project, including all activities to
10 date, when that item is before you.

11 Thank you.

12 MR. VAZQUEZ: Can you hear me? Hello?
13 Hello?

14 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman Vazquez, we can hear
15 you.

16 MR. VAZQUEZ: Sorry about that. But I
17 got -- I don't know what's -- and now I'm hearing
18 back when I'm talking.

19 Ms. Taylor --

20 MS. TAYLOR: Chair Vazquez, you're breaking
21 up a bit. But I can go ahead and call the next item.

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: Please.

23

24 **ITEM K3a**

25 **---o0o---**

26

27 MS. TAYLOR: The next item is K3a, Property
28 Tax Deputy Director's Report with Operational

1 Updates. A report on the status of pending and
2 upcoming projects, activities and departmental
3 issues.

4 Mr. Yeung.

5 MR. YEUNG: Yes. Good morning, Chair
6 Vazquez and Honorable Members of the Board.

7 Once again -- oh, I'm sorry, this is David
8 Yeung, Deputy Director of the Property Tax
9 Department.

10 Today I will provide an update of the
11 operational going-ons in the Property Tax Department.

12 I will start out with the State-Assessed
13 Properties Division.

14 Our staff is now preparing for the appraisal
15 season by updating either appraisal templates and
16 reviewing their appraisal methodologies, they are
17 also finishing up their capitalization rate study.

18 As you will recall, this is an item that the
19 State-Assessed Properties Division performs every
20 single year. We -- we study and then publish --
21 compile, calculate and publish capitalization rates
22 to be used in conjunction with the income approach
23 when valuing state-assessed properties.

24 So that will be wrapped up in the next month
25 or so in -- and ready for our appraisal season.

26 So moving on to our appraisal season, as you
27 will recall last month, I mentioned that property
28 statements were sent out to state assessees the

1 beginning of January.

2 The property statements are due by March 1st
3 of this year. Upon receiving them, staff will have
4 approximately two-and-a-half months to finish the
5 appraisal work for 2021. And we anticipate over 300,
6 and probably right around 350 state assesseses.

7 Staff will be putting together the
8 recommended values for the Board to review and take
9 action on in the May Board -- in the May Board
10 Meeting.

11 Next, I will move on to the County-Assessed
12 Properties Division. As I mentioned last month, we
13 are continuing the project on this community land
14 trust and the assessment of affordable housing built
15 on community land trust property.

16 We issued a revised guidelines beginning of
17 the month in January. Comments and edits were due by
18 February 12 of this month. The Department has indeed
19 received some. Staff is right now analyzing and
20 putting all the comments into a matrix.

21 And we will try to resolve any issues. It
22 may be through an interested parties meeting, or it
23 may not, depending on the issues raised, and whether
24 we can come to a resolution or not.

25 Our goal is to complete that project and
26 bring the guidance before the Board for adoption in
27 the very near future.

28 Next, I will move on to our handbooks. Last

1 month I mentioned that we were in the midst of
2 redrafting two new hand -- two existing handbooks,
3 and one new handbook. Those handbooks are the 215,
4 it's the Assessment Map Standards; and the 260, the
5 General Exemptions; and the last one -- and also
6 Handbook 570.

7 I would like to update you on developments
8 of 570. That one has gotten the most progress. My
9 last report on that is we were completing the final
10 chapter of that review and redrafting of that
11 handbook, and that has to do with the valuation of
12 commercial aircraft.

13 Staff has finished recraft -- has finished
14 drafting that chapter. It is now under internal
15 review.

16 After our internal review, we will reach out
17 to various stakeholders. In particular, the CAA
18 Aircraft Subcommittee. And hopefully we can resolve
19 any issues that are -- that are left remaining, and
20 we can bring that handbook before the Board for
21 action and adoption.

22 And my final update will be on LTAs. Since
23 our last Board Meeting, the Board has issued -- the
24 CAPD has issued six LTAs. They are the Valuation of
25 Certificated Aircraft Standard Flight Times.

26 That LTA is used in conjunction with
27 assessing commercial aircraft in determining their
28 presence in California for allocating their values

1 through California, and also amongst counties.

2 We also issued LTAs -- an LTA on the new
3 construction exclusion for governor-proclaimed
4 disasters. That LTA explains the passage of a new
5 section of the R and T Code Section 70.5.

6 We also issued an LTA on the Vessel
7 Valuation Factors for Lien Date 2021. That LTA is
8 used by county assessors in -- in determining the
9 assessable value of -- of vessels.

10 We also issued an LTA with the property
11 director -- property tax directory. That LTA
12 includes key contact people from the BOE and their
13 telephone numbers, and how they go ahead and get in
14 contact with those if they have questions.

15 Two more LTAs to cover. We also issued LTA
16 2021/007. And that LTA basically publishes the forms
17 that we, the Board, have created -- created and
18 revised for the implementation of Prop. 19, the
19 intergenerational transfer exclusion.

20 And the last one I wanted to highlight is
21 LTA 2021/008. And that is the LTA also on Prop. 19.
22 And what that one does is that it poses in a
23 question-and-answer format basically 44 questions
24 that have to do with the implementation of the
25 intergenerational transfer exclusion.

26 All those are published and available on our
27 Web site right now.

28 I would like to also highlight a couple LTAs

1 that are upcoming. These are LTAs in various forms
2 of drafting right now. The anticipated release time
3 for these are 30-to-60 days out.

4 We will be -- we are working on an LTA, this
5 is an annual LTA. And it basically lists new
6 contracts for property built with California
7 Pollution Control Financing authority.

8 We are also issuing instruction -- an
9 instruction LTA on BOE Form 100. And that has to do
10 with legal entities and changes in ownership.

11 And we are also working on an LTA right now,
12 once a year we gather the assessment appeals filing
13 periods for each county, and we publish that also.
14 So that will be amongst the -- the LTAs that staff is
15 currently working on.

16 And then finally, staff is also looking at
17 drafting additional LTAs for the implementation of
18 Proposition 19. There will be more on that probably
19 tomorrow.

20 And, finally, the last thing I wanted to
21 report on was, during the last Board Meeting I was
22 asked to review section -- LTA No. 2008/018. And
23 that is the old LTA that was published in 2008. And
24 it dealt with parent-child and grandparent-grandchild
25 exclusions.

26 I was asked to take a look at that and give
27 my recommendation as to which part of that LTA is
28 applicable, and which parts are not.

1 I gave a preliminary analysis last -- during
2 the last Board Meeting. I would just like to confirm
3 that analysis. While that LTA does deal with the old
4 parent-child and grandparent-grandchild exclusion,
5 that LTA, I believe, is still needful. Because there
6 are still transactions that occur prior to the
7 February 16th operational date for Proposition 19 for
8 this type of transaction, either has -- either has
9 not been granted or worked yet by the assessors, or
10 the assessors have not discovered them yet. They
11 have not -- they have not been recorded just yet.

12 So there are -- there are still some
13 transactions out there. And I believe there will
14 probably be transactions out there that are eligible
15 for the treatment under the law for perhaps a couple
16 more years down the road.

17 So my original assessment is that we
18 actually notate on that LTA that this is applicable
19 to transactions between parents and their child, and
20 grandparents and their grandchild that occurred prior
21 to the operational date of Prop. 19 of February 16th,
22 2021. So we will go ahead and make that notation.

23 This concludes my presentation for the
24 Property Tax Department. I'm available for any
25 questions or comments you may have.

26 MS. FLEMING: Excuse me, Members. This is
27 Brenda Fleming, Executive Director.

28 I was going to ask if I can -- for a quick

1 two- to- three minute break. The Chairman is having
2 some technical problems with his audio, and so we're
3 going to need to assist him with rebooting it.

4 So, Members, if we could take -- how about
5 we take a five-minute break. Gives us an opportunity
6 to have it rebooted, and then we can proceed with
7 questions for Mr. Yeung's presentation.

8 Thank you.

9 Staff, five-minute break please.

10 (Whereupon a break was taken.)

11 MR. VAZQUEZ: Seeing none, Ms. Taylor.

12 MS. TAYLOR: Would you like me to call the
13 next item?

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, please.

15

16

ITEM K3b

17

---o0o---

18

19 MS. TAYLOR: The next item is K3b, Property
20 Tax Deputy Director's Report, with an overview of
21 proposed legislation to extend the sunset date for
22 Revenue and Taxation Code Section 401.10.

23 This item will be presented by Mr. Yeung.

24 MR. YEUNG: Yes. Good morning again. David
25 Yeung here.

26 Today I would like to give you an overview
27 of property tax -- I'm sorry, of Revenue Taxation
28 Code Section 401.10. This section of the code

1 prescribes a methodology in which to assess prop --
2 pipeline right-of-ways.

3 This code section was put in in 1996. What
4 it does is that it provides a formula for the
5 assessment of these right-of-ways used by pipelines.

6 And if the assessor actually uses this type
7 of prescribed method, there is a strong presumption
8 of correctness in the assessment.

9 As I mentioned, it was -- the law was first
10 put in place in 1996. It had a five-year sunset
11 date. In -- in 2000 it extended for ten years. And
12 in 2010, it was extended for another five. And in
13 2015, it was extended for another five. So it's had
14 three extensions, or ten years, five and a five.

15 The current sunset date on this provision is
16 January 1st of 2022. So I am recommending that we
17 seek legislation in which to extend this for another
18 five-year term.

19 This assessment methodology has provided
20 some real stability and fairness and -- and
21 consistency in the assessment of these types of
22 pipeline right-of-ways over the last 25 years.

23 So once again, I am available for any
24 comments or questions you may have on this issue.

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you. I have a couple --
26 oh, I see one hand.

27 Ms. Stowers, go ahead. Ms. Stowers.

28 MS. STOWERS: Thank you.

1 I do -- I don't understand, Mr. Yeung, why
2 we keep extending the sunset date. We've been doing
3 this for 25 years. You just said it's very stable
4 and reliable. Why aren't we trying -- why aren't we
5 seeking to have this permanent?

6 MR. YEUNG: There are -- there are some real
7 benefits to having this type of methodology in the
8 assessment pipeline right-of-ways. I have already
9 mentioned that it does provide some stability and
10 some presumption of correctness when used.

11 We initially did extend it for ten years.
12 And now we've had two other extensions since then.
13 So it's been a total of 25 years that it's been in
14 practice that it's been basically used.

15 I would like -- the reason why I would
16 recommend the five-year extension instead of a
17 permanent extension is that within the body of this
18 statute, they provide a -- basically a tiered method
19 of calculating the value. And it's actually embedded
20 in the code. It's \$20,000 per linear mile of these
21 pipeline right-of-ways if they flow through a
22 high-density area.

23 If it's a transitional or a medium-density
24 area, it's 12,000. And for low-density areas, it's
25 9,000 per linear mile.

26 I would just like the opportunity for -- for
27 staff and assessors and interested parties to relook
28 at maybe some of those numbers to see if they're

1 still relevant.

2 This was a -- this was an agreed-upon
3 methodology stemming from a lawsuit in 1993. And
4 this, basically, agreement, came into effect in 1996.
5 It's -- it will -- it's been 25 years. And at the
6 end of the extension, it will be 30 years. I think
7 that methodology could -- could stand a second
8 look.

9 MS. STOWERS: So you're saying that the
10 different tiers, you may believe that stakeholders
11 might want to take a look at it to see if it's still
12 relevant?

13 I actually agree --

14 MR. YEUNG: Correct.

15 MS. STOWERS: -- with that, and would like
16 for the Executive Director to direct you guys to do
17 so.

18 I'm not saying I'm against extending it.
19 But it seems like every five years extending
20 something without taking a second look at the
21 underlying numbers and the facts, it's kind of not
22 efficient. It's not a very efficient way to do it.

23 So I'd really appreciate a look at it.

24 MR. YEUNG: Thank you. Of course.

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: You know, along those same
26 lines, Mr. Yeung, what happens if the statute is not
27 extended? How would these right-of-ways be valued?

28 MR. YEUNG: If -- if -- if the statute is

1 not extended, these right-of-ways will be valued as
2 any other property in California.

3 It would be the fair -- right now, those
4 that do not have a change in ownership, they are
5 still valued at their factored base year, just
6 added -- adjusted one place in every year.

7 The ones that are -- that do have a change
8 in ownership, the ones that have been sold or traded
9 or transferred, those would be to the fair market
10 value as of the date that transaction happened.

11 So there is -- there is -- that three-tiered
12 system that I described will no longer be in play.

13 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

14 Ms. Stowers, was there a motion to your
15 comments?

16 MS. STOWERS: I don't have a motion right
17 now. I think he just wanted to give us an overview.
18 And then when the acting Leg. Director speaks, she's
19 going to be looking for a motion.

20 MR. VAZQUEZ: Okay.

21 MS. STOWERS: I mean -- and I don't believe
22 that I could direct Mr. Yeung to evaluate the
23 numbers. But I think he agreed to it.

24 MR. YEUNG: It's -- it's a long-term project
25 that -- that I believe we should endev -- we should
26 take on. It's a -- it's been 25 years. Basically a
27 quarter of a century, and it can stand to have its
28 methodologies re-examined.

1 MS. STOWERS: Let me go ahead and just make
2 a motion that staff, under the direction of the
3 Executive Director, take on this long-term project to
4 reevaluate the numbers, and to confirm that they're
5 still meeting their needs.

6 MR. SCHAEFER: Vice Chair Schaefer.

7 I second that.

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Any others comments from any
9 Members?

10 Seeing none, why don't we go ahead and just
11 take a roll call vote on that, Ms. Taylor.

12 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman Vazquez.

13 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

14 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

15 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

16 MS. TAYLOR: Member Gaines.

17 MR. GAINES: Aye.

18 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen.

19 MS. COHEN: Aye.

20 MS. TAYLOR: Deputy Controller Stowers.

21 MS. STOWERS: Aye.

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: So that's unanimous.

23 With that, is there any other comments or
24 questions of Mr. Yeung on this item?

25 Seeing and hearing none, Ms. Taylor, what's
26 our next item?

27

28

//

1 **ITEM K5a**

2 ---o0o---

3
4 MS. TAYLOR: Our next item is K5a,
5 Taxpayers' Rights Advocate Annual Report Presentation
6 of the 2019-2020 Taxpayers' Rights Advocates' Annual
7 Report, highlighting the office's accomplishments,
8 involvement in projects, current issues, and examples
9 of cases illustrating services provided.

10 This will be presented by Ms. Thompson.

11 MS. THOMPSON: Good morning, Chair Vazquez
12 and Honorable Board Members. I'm Lisa Thompson,
13 Chief of the Taxpayers' Rights Advocates' Office for
14 the Board of Equalization.

15 I am pleased to present to you the 2019-20
16 Taxpayers' Rights Advocates' annual report for
17 property taxes and the alcoholic beverage tax.

18 As part of my presentation, I'll be
19 providing an update on the contents of the Taxpayers'
20 Rights Advocates' annual report.

21 This report is issued in accordance with the
22 Morgan Property Taxpayers' Bill of Rights, under the
23 provisions of Revenue and Taxation Code Section 5904.

24 The report highlights the Taxpayers' Rights
25 Advocates' Office accomplishments, examples of cases
26 illustrating the services that our office provides,
27 issues that our office works on to resolve, and our
28 office's involvement in educational projects to help

1 taxpayers.

2 In fiscal year 2019-20, our office worked on
3 approximately 250 new cases. All were in the area of
4 property taxes.

5 Most cases were in the valuation category,
6 which pertains to topics such as value reduction,
7 change in ownership, new construction, exclusions
8 from reassessment, exemptions, assessment appeals,
9 and general property taxation.

10 The remaining cases were in the
11 administrative category, which included topics such
12 as creating mailing of tax bills, refunds and
13 penalties.

14 Of the 250 case -- cases, most were from
15 taxpayers from counties in District One and District
16 Two.

17 In addition to property tax cases worked on,
18 we've received contacts from taxpayers that are
19 seeking assistance in an area that our agency is not
20 involved in. In those cases, the TRA office assists
21 those taxpayers by directing them to the appropriate
22 state or county agency.

23 The number of contacts received from
24 taxpayers that need assistance from other agencies
25 that are not involved with property taxes varies each
26 month or year. But generally it's around 60 to 70 a
27 year.

28 The annual report also describes how

1 taxpayers are referred to the TRA office. County
2 assessors' offices refer taxpayers to our offices,
3 and your Board Member offices direct taxpayers to the
4 TRA office, or forward inquiries from taxpayers that
5 need assistance who reach out to your offices for
6 assistance.

7 Our agency's Web site is also a source of
8 referral, so they are aware that the TRA office
9 exists.

10 On every page of our Web site there is a
11 link at the bottom of the page to link to the
12 Taxpayers' Rights Advocates area of our Web site.

13 Taxpayers can contact us by completing a
14 Web intake form that sends the person's information
15 to our office by e-mail instantly, or they can
16 contact us by phone.

17 The Web site intake form is easy for
18 taxpayers to use, and allows them to identify the
19 property that they were having a problem with, and
20 explain the nature of their concern or issue.

21 Additionally, taxpayers become aware of the
22 Taxpayers' Rights Advocates' Office for our agency
23 from the Taxpayers' Rights Advocates Office of other
24 agencies, and the Franchise Tax Board, the California
25 Department of Tax and Fee Administrations refer
26 taxpayers to the State Board of Equalization's
27 office.

28 And our office is also identified in the

1 agency's publications covering all state advocates,
2 and the IRS advocate that's located in California.

3 The primary -- two primary functions,
4 actually, of the Taxpayers' Rights Advocates' Office
5 are to ensure fair and equitable treatment of
6 taxpayers in the assessment and collection of
7 property taxes, and to recommend changes in
8 procedures and laws to improve the ease of taxpayer
9 compliance.

10 The annual report this year contains
11 examples of cases that our office works on,
12 illustrating how taxpayers' problems are resolved.

13 Our role usually involves review and
14 explanation of processes and laws, and it involves
15 contact with local county assessors' offices, or tax
16 collectors' offices to help resolve those taxpayers'
17 problems or concerns.

18 Oftentimes a taxpayer just needs assistance
19 in understanding what documentation needs to be
20 provided to the county assessor's office to arrive at
21 a solution that they need. Or to receive
22 confirmation from another party that they were
23 treated fairly and in accordance with the law.

24 An annual report also issues -- identifies
25 issues that the Taxpayers' Rights Advocate's Office
26 was involved in resolving.

27 And the result of specific contact from
28 taxpayers and issues raised at the annual taxpayer

1 Bill of Rights hearing, our agency may become aware
2 of issues the taxpayers are having that develop into
3 a project to resolve the issue, and result in changes
4 being implemented.

5 This year's annual report for fiscal year
6 19-20 identifies two such projects: the assessment
7 appeals process project, and the solar energy new
8 construction exclusion project.

9 The assessment appeals project began in
10 fiscal year 2017 and '18, and continued into year
11 2019-20, the year of this annual report.

12 In addition to property tax rule changes,
13 that -- this project brought about revisions to the
14 agency's publications entitled Assessment Appeals
15 Manual, and a new form that assessors must use when
16 requesting information from a taxpayer under
17 Section 441(d).

18 The project concluded shortly after fiscal
19 year 2019-20 with the issuance of the revision to the
20 postponement and continuance language in the
21 Assessment Appeals Manual and letters to assessors
22 2020 33.

23 The second project identified in the
24 advocate's 2019-20 annual report is the Solar Energy
25 New Construction Exclusion Project, which began in
26 September of 2018, and remains ongoing.

27 The project was initiated due in part to
28 contacts made with the Taxpayers' Rights Advocates'

1 Office in 2018 by a taxpayer representative.

2 Our agency -- our agency's Property Tax
3 Department then initiated an interested parties
4 process to address issues that emerged since the
5 issuance of our agency's guidelines for active solar
6 energy system, new construction exclusions.

7 The project includes several phases. The
8 first of which addresses the reporting requirement,
9 where a draft of a proposed new property statement
10 reporting form was developed for reporting solar
11 energy power plant equipment in the assessor's
12 office.

13 Letters to Assessors 2018 47 discusses the
14 project. And just as other projects, the project
15 scope and all tasks within this project are posted to
16 our agency's Web site.

17 A draft form was distributed by the Property
18 Tax Department in November 2019 with interested
19 parties invited to make comments in 2020.

20 The Taxpayers' Rights Advocate annual report
21 for 19-20 contains a section on taxpayer service
22 improvements.

23 The section is broken up into two parts.
24 One which identifies service improvements made by
25 county assessors, and one for improvements made by
26 the TRA office.

27 Our office thinks it is important to
28 highlight customer service improvements made by

1 assessor's offices, as well as by our office.

2 With respect to county improvement, the
3 advocate office solicits input from county assessors
4 offices each year on customer service improvements
5 that they make. We incorporate that information into
6 our report.

7 This year for the 2019-20 annual report, six
8 counties submitted information that we are
9 highlighting for enhancing service to the public.
10 They are Alameda, Los Angeles, Mariposa, Napa,
11 San Francisco, and San Mateo.

12 With respect to the Alameda County
13 Assessor's Office, they made taxpayer education and
14 community engagement a priority, and made efforts
15 aimed at improving taxpayer access and education.

16 It held Home Owners' Expo, attended by 200
17 constituents, providing information about tax
18 savings.

19 Additionally, the Alameda County Assessor's
20 Office digitized paper files to improve taxpayer
21 services.

22 With respect to the Los Angeles County
23 Assessor's Office, they were diligent in its public
24 education efforts to inform taxpayers about savings
25 program and other resources through online
26 platforms.

27 The Los Angeles County Assessor's Office
28 also initiated, tested, and deployed new technology

1 to allow employees to have full access to the
2 assessor's system from home, and allow video
3 conferences -- conferencing and file-sharing.

4 They also implemented a communications
5 application known as Cisco Jabber to enable staff to
6 receive public service calls from their home
7 computer, laptop, or mobile device during normal
8 business hours, to ensure that the assessor was able
9 to continue to provide operational public services
10 during the effects of COVID-19 pandemic.

11 The Mariposa County Assessor's Office made
12 property characteristics available to taxpayers
13 through a request on their Web site, because the
14 public could not walk into its office at times during
15 the pandemic closure. The assessor's office
16 established an e-mail account specifically for
17 assessor-related questions.

18 Additionally, the Mariposa County Assessor's
19 Office added a link to the CA Assessor e-Forms
20 portal, and entered into a contract with Megabyte
21 Systems for a complete upgrade to its property
22 management system.

23 The Napa County Assessor's Office made
24 improvements to its process for calamity role
25 correction with the assistance of its property tax
26 vendor, Megabyte Systems.

27 It provided property tax relief to impacted
28 property owners smoothly and quickly, and maintained

1 appropriate value of history in its database.

2 With respect to the San Francisco County
3 Assessor's Office, it undertook a series of
4 initiatives focused on taxpayer education and system
5 improvements to enhance customer service.

6 In early 2020, the San Francisco County
7 Assessor's Office hosted their office's first welfare
8 exemption workshop to help local nonprofits save on
9 property taxes, and over 130 nonprofit organizations
10 attended.

11 Additionally, the San Francisco County
12 Assessor's Office upgraded its website, which
13 included refining the search function for forms and
14 notices, and reorganized Web site pages for easy
15 access.

16 With respect to the San Mateo County
17 Assessor's Office, they kicked off implementation of
18 its new assessor property system, a business-driven
19 effort to replace its legacy system, modernize
20 assessment tools, improve work flow, provide 24/7
21 online self-service capabilities, and streamline
22 internal and external interface.

23 The San Mateo County Assessor's Office is
24 being implemented in phases, and has many benefits.

25 Additionally, in response to COVID-19, the
26 San Mateo County Assessor's Office implemented online
27 chat and DocuSign to improve timely response to
28 citizen inquiries and streamline filing of official

1 documents.

2 This new electronic portal was created for
3 permitting agencies to submit information to the
4 assessor's office as well.

5 And the next portion is on the Taxpayers'
6 Rights Advocate Office improvements. And we are
7 committed to making improvements to taxpayer
8 education, and providing taxpayers with information
9 in simple, understandable terms.

10 Under the Property Tax Bill of Rights, our
11 office has a role in taxpayer education. And that is
12 specifically to assist assessors in their effort to
13 provide education to local taxpayers.

14 Following the discussion of customer service
15 improvements made by the county assessors' office,
16 this TRA annual report discusses work done by the
17 Taxpayers' Rights Advocate's Office to educate the
18 public.

19 And the taxpayer service improvements made
20 by our Taxpayers' Rights Advocate's Office in the
21 area of taxpayer education are the direct result of
22 discussions made with county assessors concerning
23 ideas our office had for taxpayer education.

24 With the support of assessors in 2018 to
25 pursue educational efforts, the TRA office began
26 developing a series of short information sheets on
27 various exclusion and exemption topics to provide
28 information to taxpayers that are written in simple,

1 nontechnical terms.

2 Since that time, the Taxpayer Rights
3 Advocate's Office has issued information sheets on
4 four topics. The first two information sheets on
5 property tax exclusions were published in July 2018.
6 One for property transfers between parents to
7 children, and another for transfers between
8 grandparents and grandchildren.

9 The third information sheet addressing the
10 transfer of the base year value on the principal
11 residence for persons aged 55 and over was published
12 in June 2019.

13 The fourth information sheet was issued in
14 June 2020 that addresses the base year value transfer
15 for a disabled person.

16 These information sheets are a resource for
17 taxpayers where they can read about the main
18 requirements, how they can apply for it, helpful
19 hints about the topic, and where to find additional
20 information.

21 They provide a resource that we can direct
22 the taxpayer to, and the county assessors' offices'
23 staff can direct them to.

24 It can help taxpayers avoid reassessment of
25 property if they qualify for the exclusion, or have
26 property -- and have property tax savings.

27 We plan to continue working on developing
28 information sheets on either topic, and to revise

1 existing publications to reflect changes in law as
2 needed.

3 The annual report lists these publications,
4 which can be accessed through our taxpayer education
5 area on the Taxpayer Advocates page on our agency's
6 Web site.

7 The next part is concerning the improvement
8 section. There is an improvement section in the
9 annual report where there's discussion on ease of
10 access to information.

11 And the Taxpayers' Rights Advocate is
12 committed to ensuring that the public has access to
13 information when they need it.

14 So our office continually examines our
15 agent's Web site with the taxpayer in mind, and
16 coordinates with our agency's Property Tax Department
17 and Communications Officer to obtain information on
18 the Web site.

19 This year's Taxpayers' Rights Advocate
20 report has been posted to our Web site, and can be
21 accessed under the Taxpayers' Rights Advocate area as
22 educational resources offered by our office.

23 So the basis of this report, in accordance
24 with the Morgan Property Taxpayer Bill of Rights
25 statutory provision, this annual report provides the
26 basis for the upcoming Taxpayer Bill of Rights
27 Hearing.

28 In relevant part, Revenue and Taxation Code

1 Section 5906(d) states that the Board shall conduct
2 the public hearing soliciting input from assessors,
3 other local agency representatives, and taxpayers to
4 address the advocates annual report, and identify a
5 means to correct any problems identified in that
6 report.

7 With respect to the Alcoholic Beverage Tax
8 Section 32463 provides that the Board shall conduct
9 an annual hearing where industry representatives and
10 individual taxpayers may present their proposals on
11 changes to the alcoholic beverage tax law, which may
12 further improve voluntary compliance, and the
13 relationship between taxpayers and the government.

14 Both provisions are identified in the
15 appendixes of the TRA annual report.

16 And the Taxpayer Bill of Rights Hearing will
17 be noticed with ample time to taxpayers, and ample
18 time for assessors and tax collectors statewide to
19 display posters and fliers in their offices for
20 taxpayers to see.

21 Generally, the hearing is held in August of
22 each year with posters and fliers distributed in
23 June. We will be confirming the specific date and
24 time of this Taxpayer Bill of Rights Hearing with our
25 agency's Executive Director, Brenda Fleming, and
26 Board Chair, Anthony Vazquez.

27 Last -- like last year, a letter to
28 assessors will be distributed advising assessors and

1 interested parties of the hearing for the opportunity
2 to provide comments before this elected Board.

3 It is important to keep in mind that the TRA
4 office works with taxpayers on issues throughout the
5 year. So many issues have been resolved during the
6 year, so there is no need for taxpayers to speak at
7 the hearing.

8 But at the hearing, speakers can comment on
9 areas in the annual report, as well as on any other
10 areas that they may be working with on our office, or
11 areas of concern regarding our agency's services.

12 That concludes my update. I'm happy to
13 address any questions that you may have.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Members, do we have any
15 questions of Ms. Thompson?

16 I have one quick one for Ms. Thompson.

17 You know, I believe you mentioned during
18 your past years that the reason you present the TRA
19 annual report in February is, you know, eight months
20 after the fiscal year end, is that it takes a great
21 deal of preparation in preparing this.

22 I was just wondering -- and I know you're a
23 little bit short-staffed right now. But it would be
24 helpful, at least to me, and I'm assuming the rest of
25 the Board Members as well, if you could somehow
26 provide us with the list of the types of taxpayer
27 issues addressed throughout the year, ideally
28 quarterly, so that we have realtime data.

1 Just so we can kind of get -- you know, have
2 an opportunity to respond sooner on taxpayer issues
3 in our respective districts, I think would be
4 beneficial to all.

5 Is that a possibility?

6 MS. THOMPSON: So we have -- I mean, we
7 collect, you know, statistics on the number of cases.
8 But oftentimes, you know, the taxpayers that are
9 approaching us can -- you know, they approach us
10 confidentially.

11 And so I could discuss with the Executive
12 Director how best to provide feedback on, you know,
13 maybe how many inquiries are received from taxpayers
14 or constituents in each Member's district, you know,
15 that are received from outside sources.

16 Of course when a Board Member's office
17 forwards inquiries to us, you know, constituents, we
18 advise you that we assisted the taxpayer, so you're
19 aware of that.

20 But, you know, for -- for the others that we
21 receive through either phone or by the Web site, you
22 know, I think that we could compile some statistics
23 on, you know, the quantities by district, so you'll
24 have a little bit more metric.

25 MR. VAZQUEZ: That would be helpful.

26 MS. THOMPSON: Okay. And as to your comment
27 on, you know, timing, I would hope to get that out
28 earlier in the future -- in the future year if it's

1 nice to space them. I think February we also -- so
2 if you issue it in February, then at least with, you
3 know, within eight months.

4 But we solicit input from assessors on the
5 annual report. So after the fiscal year ends, we
6 generally wait until August to ask for information
7 from assessors, so we can finish the prior year and
8 Bill of Rights Hearing before we go ahead and do
9 that.

10 And we have to allow assessors sufficient
11 time to provide that information to us.

12 But I'm happy to provide -- try to, you
13 know, increase that content.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

15 Ms. Stowers, was that a hand, or is that an
16 old hand?

17 MS. STOWERS: Thank you, sir. I did have my
18 hand up, and then I took it down. But I put it back
19 up again.

20 I was trying to see about your question to
21 the advocate when you were asking about some of the
22 cases that they're resolving.

23 And I understand that she said she would
24 give you some statistics, but I thought you were also
25 asking for some -- some issues. Like you wanted to
26 get a flavor of some common issues that are out there
27 that you can be aware of when you're out speaking
28 with your constituents.

1 Am I reading more into that?

2 MR. VAZQUEZ: No, no. You're right on
3 point.

4 MS. STOWERS: Okay. Then I don't believe I
5 heard a response from Ms. Thompson that she could
6 provide you with a little summary.

7 MS. THOMPSON: Um, so as of now we -- we
8 have been working with Lisa Renati, the Chief Deputy
9 Director to provide metrics reporting. And we
10 indicate the types of inquiries on an annual basis.
11 But we might be able to expand that a little bit.

12 We do identify the number of cases by
13 district, and then also kind of the different
14 categories. What -- you know, how many were in
15 valuation category versus how many were in
16 administrative category.

17 And also identify them kind of by types. So
18 like if it involved a parent-child transfer, or if it
19 involved an exemption.

20 We had quite a few dealing with parent-child
21 exclusions and base year value transfers. I mean,
22 those -- those are done. But we might be able to
23 expand them, you know, a little bit more to elaborate
24 on that.

25 So, you know, I'm happy to do that and look
26 forward towards doing that starting with the March
27 report.

28 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you. That would be

1 helpful at least to me, and I'm assuming the other
2 Members as well.

3 You know, the other question --

4 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah, I would be happy to do
5 that.

6 MR. VAZQUEZ: I had one more question, and I
7 don't see any other hand up.

8 You know, I noticed on page 10 there,
9 Ms. Thompson, you were -- it was regarding
10 improvement by counties. You described the efforts
11 by the Los Angeles County Assessor's Office in
12 responding to this pandemic, including their quick
13 deployment of new technologies to assist its
14 teleworking employees to effectively communicate
15 with -- with and respond to the needs of the public.

16 And I was just wondering, has your office
17 been utilizing any similar new technologies in your
18 work with the public during this pandemic?

19 MS. THOMPSON: Yes, we have. We -- we do
20 use Cisco Jabber to communicate with the members of
21 the public.

22 So our office is working remotely. Our main
23 person who answers the telephone, she answers it on
24 her computer using Cisco Jabber. And it's -- it's
25 working quite well. So, yes, we do do that.

26 So, actually, for the following years, you
27 know, annual report, we might, you know, indicate
28 we've -- we've started to do that -- doing that more.

1 So in 20 -- you know, the 2021 timeframe, 2021 fiscal
2 year.

3 We've also moved a lot of our files and
4 processes electronically now. So before we -- when
5 we set up case files, we would have hard copy files.
6 And we would pass them between our office technician
7 creating the folder, and then myself for assignments,
8 and my technical adviser.

9 So now actually it's all electronic. So
10 when we get an inquiry received through our Board Web
11 site, we -- or the intake form that's received
12 through our Web site, we save that information.

13 And if a taxpayer submits an e-mail to us
14 attaching a document, claim form or tax bill, then
15 that is saved electronically to kind of a file
16 management system.

17 So it's all online. So we're looking at our
18 computers to handle that. So it is more efficient.
19 And, you know, we're saving paper and not --
20 contributing positively to the environment, rather
21 than using a lot of paper.

22 So -- so, yes. So --

23 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you. Thank you. We're
24 saving trees. That sounds good.

25 MS. THOMPSON: We're saving trees. That's
26 what I was trying to say. So, yes, exactly.

27 And it is more efficient. You can work with
28 two screens, you know, very easily.

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you. I see another -- I
2 see a hand by Member Gaines.

3 MR. GAINES: Great. Yeah. Thank you, Chair
4 Vazquez.

5 Just a question, Ms. Thompson, in terms of
6 Jabber. Can you expand on that a little bit in terms
7 of how that works.

8 MS. THOMPSON: Well, from a technical
9 standpoint, I cannot. But if -- it's just an icon
10 that appears on the little portion of my screen, or
11 of our staff's screen. And if a call comes in, your
12 computer just starts ringing. And you just open up
13 Jabber, and you click on it, and you can answer it.

14 So it's in realtime. You're not getting
15 messages. You can just answer it that way.

16 Or if you are not there, so let's say
17 somebody calls on a weekend, it just leaves a
18 voicemail automatically on your phone as it would.

19 And if they're calling your main line, it
20 actually records a message on Cisco -- well, it
21 records a message, and it sends you an e-mail. So
22 you have that.

23 And just for calling someone, like I can
24 just click on the Jabber icon and just dial a
25 telephone number just like you do on your phone, and
26 you talk to your computer.

27 So you have to have a laptop that has a
28 speaker and microphone. Which I -- which everyone

1 has at this point. Or, you know, if you have a
2 desktop, I suppose you can have a webcam that has a
3 microphone.

4 So it's very -- it's very easy, and it's
5 very clear. Because we've tested them amongst
6 ourselves, you know, before we actually, you know,
7 rolled it out to the public.

8 So we called one another, like, I called
9 someone on my cell phone like I was stimulating a
10 taxpayer call so we could make sure, you know, if it
11 could be clear. And it is. It's just like you're
12 talking on a telephone.

13 MR. GAINES: Yeah, that's nice.

14 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah, it's really nice. Very
15 efficient.

16 MR. GAINES: Yeah, it's all --

17 MS. THOMPSON: And then you just communicate
18 via Teams for --

19 MR. GAINES: Very nice. And then it
20 leaves -- did you say it leaves a message, or you can
21 leave a message and it turns it into an e-mail?

22 MS. THOMPSON: Well, it's just like
23 calling -- and I can't really address that, but it
24 could be that it's just our system phones out of our
25 office.

26 MR. GAINES: Okay.

27 MS. THOMPSON: But if somebody calls my desk
28 phone, like my personal desk phone, just like it

1 leaves a message on this phone, like you retrieve
2 voicemail, but I also receive an e-mail that has the
3 voice --

4 MR. GAINES: Yes.

5 MS. THOMPSON: -- recognition. So you're
6 aware of it. And Cisco Jabber tells you when
7 somebody calls. Like if you missed a call, it will
8 tell you actually that you missed a call, and what
9 the phone number is displaying.

10 MR. GAINES: Yes.

11 MS. THOMPSON: So it's quite nice.

12 MR. GAINES: Wow, that's great.

13 MS. THOMPSON: Thank you.

14 MR. GAINES: Yeah. During the pandemic
15 we've had -- trying to figure out how to operate my
16 business so we can have everybody working out of the
17 home. But we have similar technology in terms of how
18 an incoming call can turn into an e-mail that they
19 get. Otherwise, they answer the phone directly,
20 unless they're busy with another client. So I'm glad
21 that --

22 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah.

23 MR. GAINES: -- yours is even more
24 incorporated, and that it's -- it's part of your
25 laptop. So that is a nice feature.

26 I want to follow up on the staffing
27 question. How are you doing on that -- in that area?
28 I know that you were talking about needing, I think

1 at least an additional individual. I don't know if
2 it was more than that.

3 MS. THOMPSON: Yeah. So as far as -- yeah,
4 technical advisers. So I -- you know, I'm a manager,
5 but I'm definitely a working manager.

6 So to assist taxpayers, it's myself and
7 another technical adviser who is a senior specialist
8 property appraiser. That's her classification. So
9 we're doing that.

10 We have an office assistant also -- an
11 office technician, excuse me, that answers the phone
12 and sets up our cases, and, you know, really is the
13 foundation of our office, you know, getting, you
14 know, first contact with the taxpayers and setting up
15 their files.

16 And so recently two positions were
17 reallocated from other areas of the Board to fill in
18 the Taxpayers' Rights Advocate Office. So paperwork
19 has been submitted. It's currently, I think, pending
20 review at CalHR.

21 But -- and it's an associate property
22 appraiser position, and an assistant property
23 appraiser position that we're looking to fill. So
24 they would be assisting taxpayers, you know.

25 MR. GAINES: Wonderful.

26 MS. THOMPSON: It's definitely needed.

27 MR. GAINES: Oh, that's great. So I want to
28 thank you, Ms. Thompson, for advancing that. And

1 also Executive Director Fleming for allocating those
2 positions.

3 Because it's an important position that you
4 fill. And I'm glad to see we're getting the right
5 staffing for it. So thanks for your report. I
6 appreciate it.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

8 Seeing no other comments or hands, I would
9 like to entertain a motion to approve the TRA annual
10 report from the Members.

11 MR. GAINES: So moved.

12 MR. VAZQUEZ: It's been moved by Member
13 Gaines.

14 MS. COHEN: Second.

15 MR. VAZQUEZ: And second by Member Cohen.

16 Before we vote on this, let me just check
17 with Ms. Taylor.

18 Is there any comments from any of the
19 assessors or speakers or anybody on in the audience
20 on this issue?

21 MS. TAYLOR: At this time, we don't have any
22 speakers or written comments, but there may be
23 someone on the AT&T line.

24 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you. If you could
25 please check.

26 MS. TAYLOR: Thank you.

27 AT&T moderator, we will now take public
28 comment on the Taxpayers' Rights Annual Report.

1 Each caller will have up to three minutes to
2 speak.

3 For the record, we request that the callers
4 provide their name.

5 Is anyone on the line that would like to
6 make a public comment regarding this matter?

7 AT&T OPERATOR: And, ladies and gentlemen,
8 for public comment, please press 1, then 0 on your
9 telephone keypad.

10 I have no one queuing up on the phone.
11 Please continue.

12 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

13 With that, Ms. Taylor, why don't we go ahead
14 and call the roll on this motion to approve the TRA
15 annual report.

16 MS. TAYLOR: Chairman Vazquez.

17 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

18 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

19 MR. SCHAEFER: Vice Chair Schaefer, aye.

20 MS. TAYLOR: Member Gaines.

21 MR. GAINES: Aye.

22 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen.

23 MS. COHEN: Aye.

24 MS. TAYLOR: Deputy Controller Stowers.

25 MS. STOWERS: Aye.

26 MR. VAZQUEZ: So that's unanimous of all
27 those present.

28 Ms. Taylor, if you would please call our

1 next item.

2 MS. TAYLOR: Would you like me to call Item
3 K4a?

4 Sir, you're muted.

5 MR. VAZQUEZ: Sorry. I believe that's the
6 last one, no?

7 MS. TAYLOR: Yes. And then we'll have
8 Item N as in Nancy.

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes.

10

11 **ITEM K4a and K4c**

12 ---o0o---

13

14 MS. TAYLOR: Item K4a, Legislative, Research
15 and Statistics Division, Chief's Report, Update on
16 Legislative Issues; and K4c, Proposed Legislation
17 Related to Revenue and Taxation Code Section 401.10,
18 presented by Ms. Renati.

19 MS. RENATI: Good afternoon, Chairman
20 Vazquez and Honorable Members. My name is Lisa
21 Renati, Chief Deputy Director.

22 This afternoon I'll provide an update on
23 legislative bills impacting the BOE for both our tax
24 programs and agency administration.

25 Members, as you are aware, last Friday,
26 February 19th, was the last day for bills to be
27 introduced in the state legislature.

28 Several new bills related to our tax

1 programs were introduced prior to the deadline. We
2 are currently reviewing all of the new bills, and
3 will keep you informed as part of our weekly
4 legislative update process.

5 Additionally, we are continuing to monitor
6 the Board-sponsored legislative proposals, and
7 whether they will be incorporated into a bill in the
8 near future.

9 As you know, there are currently two
10 Board-sponsored legislative proposals. They are
11 Revenue and Taxation Code 214.02. To avoid
12 revisiting the sunset date every three years, we are
13 suggesting the sunset date be eliminated.

14 Properties that qualify under this exemption
15 include land conservancies and land trusts.

16 Revenue and Taxation Code 1752.2, we are
17 proposing to amend the Revenue and Taxation Code to
18 provide that the same property tax rules that apply
19 to local Assessment Appeals Boards should also apply
20 to multijurisdictional Assessment Appeals Boards.

21 And, Members, earlier today Mr. David Yeung,
22 Deputy Director of Property Tax provided a detailed
23 explanation and report regarding Revenue and Taxation
24 Code 401.10 pertaining to the valuation methodology
25 of pipelines rights-of-way.

26 The BOE staff has been in discussions with
27 the Senate Governance and Finance Committee, who has
28 previously been the lead in extending the sunset date

1 on two previous occasions.

2 The committee is aware of the need for an
3 extension of the sunset date, and it is expected that
4 a five-year extension will be included in the
5 proposed committee bill.

6 Therefore, Members, today we ask that the
7 Board vote to support a legislative proposal to
8 extend the sunset date for Revenue and Taxation Code
9 401.10 regarding the pipeline rights-of-way until
10 January 2027.

11 This concludes my report on this matter.

12 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

13 Members, are there any questions for
14 Ms. Renati?

15 Hearing and seeing none, I believe you had a
16 motion, didn't you, that you wanted to present to us?

17 MS. RENATI: Correct, Chairman.

18 We ask that the Board support a legislative
19 proposal to extend the sunset date for RTC 401.10
20 regarding the pipeline rights-of-way.

21 MS. STOWERS: Chairman Vazquez, Deputy
22 Controller Stowers.

23 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes. Go ahead, Ms. Stowers.

24 MS. STOWERS: I move that we support
25 legislation to extend the sunset date on RTC 401.10
26 as described by Ms. Renati.

27 MR. GAINES: Second. Member Gaines.

28 MR. VAZQUEZ: It's been moved and second.

1 Any comments or questions?

2 Hearing and seeing none, before we take a
3 vote, Ms. Taylor, can we just check to see if there's
4 any assessors, or anybody in the public that wishes
5 to speak on this?

6 MS. TAYLOR: We have no written comment.
7 But I can ask the AT&T moderator.

8 AT&T moderator, we will now take public
9 comment on the Proposed Board Support for Legislation
10 to extend the sunset date for Revenue and Taxation
11 Code 401.10.

12 Is there anyone that would like to comment?

13 For the record, we request that the callers
14 provide their name.

15 Is there anyone on the line who would like
16 to make a public comment?

17 AT&T OPERATOR: Ladies and gentlemen, for
18 public comment, please press 1, and then 0 on your
19 telephone keypad.

20 I have no one queuing up on the phone.

21 Please continue.

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

23 Let's go ahead and take a roll call vote on
24 that, Ms. Taylor.

25 MS. TAYLOR: Certainly.

26 Chairman Vazquez.

27 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

28 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

1 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

2 MS. TAYLOR: Member Gaines.

3 MR. GAINES: Aye.

4 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen. Member Cohen.
5 Deputy Controller Stowers.

6 MS. STOWERS: Aye.

7 MR. VAZQUEZ: So that's -- we got a four.
8 So it's still -- we have a majority there. So that
9 moves forward.

10 With that, Ms. Taylor, if you would please
11 call our next item.

12

13

ITEM N

14

---o0o---

15

16 MS. TAYLOR: Our next item is N, Public
17 Comment on matters not on the agenda.

18 Persons who wish to address the Board of
19 Equalization regarding items not on the agenda may do
20 so under this item on the agenda.

21 Please note that the Board cannot take
22 action on items not on the agenda. However, the
23 Board can schedule issues raised by the public for K
24 at future hearings.

25 We have two written comments.

26 The first comment is from an unidentified
27 taxpayer.

28 Loss of state revenue to illegal marijuana

1 grows in San Bernardino County, Hinkley Valley area.
2 Code Enforcement to regain control for revenue.

3 Our second comment is from taxpayer
4 Terry Burns.

5 Loss of millions of dollars in state revenue
6 associated with illegal marijuana grows in San
7 Bernardino County, Hinkley Valley area.

8 That concludes the written comments.

9 AT&T moderator, we will now take public
10 comment on matters not on the agenda.

11 Each caller will have up to three minutes to
12 speak.

13 For the record, we request that the callers
14 provide their name.

15 Is anyone on the line who would like to make
16 a public comment regarding this?

17 AT&T OPERATOR: And, ladies and gentlemen,
18 for public comment, please press 1, then 0 on your
19 telephone keypad.

20 I have no one queuing up at this time.

21 Please continue.

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you.

23 Members, do -- does anybody have any final
24 comments or remarks for the day before we take a
25 recess until tomorrow?

26 Seeing and hearing none, let me just remind
27 folks before we do take our recess for today that we
28 will reconvene tomorrow at 10:00 a.m.

1 And we will discuss in detail
2 Proposition 19, issues pertaining to the proposed
3 legislation SB-539 by Hertzberg, and to propose
4 emergency regulations clarifying items not covered in
5 the legislation.

6 So unless we have any other final comments,
7 we will go ahead and --

8 MS. FLEMING: Chairman Vazquez.

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: Oh, I see -- yes, Member --

10 MS. FLEMING: Brenda Fleming, Executive
11 Director.

12 Sir, I would like to assist. Looks like we
13 had a technical issue with one of our Members in the
14 process of voting. We've resolved the issue, and I'd
15 like to suggest for the record that we give an
16 opportunity for the legislative vote to support the
17 RTC 401.10, if we could reprocess that vote now that
18 the technical issue has been resolved. It will allow
19 all Members to vote.

20 MR. VAZQUEZ: Yes, yes. By all means.

21 MS. FLEMING: Thank you.

22 MR. VAZQUEZ: Ms. Taylor, can we go back to
23 the vote? I believe everyone had a chance to vote.
24 Is it appropriate just to ask if Ms. Cohen is on the
25 line so she can vote?

26 MS. FLEMING: We would need to process the
27 motion again, restate the motion, and then process
28 the vote again, sir, please.

1 MR. VAZQUEZ: We will do that.

2 MS. FLEMING: Thank you.

3 MR. NANJO: Hi. This is Henry Nanjo, Chief
4 Counsel. Just to be procedurally correct, we need a
5 motion to reopen the roll.

6 MR. VAZQUEZ: Can I entertain a motion to
7 reopen the roll.

8 MS. COHEN: Second.

9 MR. VAZQUEZ: It's been moved and second.
10 I'm assuming we need to vote on that,
11 Mr. Nanjo.

12 MR. NANJO: That is correct, Chairman
13 Vazquez.

14 MR. VAZQUEZ: All right. Let's --
15 Ms. Taylor, call the roll on this motion to reopen.

16 MS. TAYLOR: Certainly.
17 Chairman Vazquez.

18 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

19 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.
20 Vice Chair Schaefer.

21 MR. VAZQUEZ: You're muted.

22 MR. SCHAEFER: Vice Chair Schaefer votes
23 aye.

24 MS. TAYLOR: Thank you.
25 Member Gaines.

26 MR. GAINES: Aye.

27 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen.

28 MS. COHEN: Aye.

1 MS. TAYLOR: Deputy Controller Stowers.

2 MS. STOWERS: Aye.

3 MR. VAZQUEZ: So that's unanimous.

4 All right. We will go ahead -- Ms. Taylor,
5 I guess you need to -- or do we need to restate the
6 motion again?

7 MS. TAYLOR: Let's do that for clarity.

8 MR. VAZQUEZ: Okay.

9 MS. STOWERS: This is Deputy Controller
10 Stowers. I would like to make a motion to support
11 efforts to extend RTC Section 410.10 and the sunset
12 date as described by Ms. Renati.

13 MR. VAZQUEZ: So that was moved by
14 Ms. Stowers. And I believe it was Member Gaines that
15 second it. Is that correct?

16 MR. GAINES: Correct.

17 MR. VAZQUEZ: Okay. Let's go ahead and take
18 another -- let's take a vote on that, Ms. Taylor.

19 MS. TAYLOR: Thank you.

20 Chairman Vazquez.

21 MR. VAZQUEZ: Aye.

22 MS. TAYLOR: Vice Chair Schaefer.

23 MR. SCHAEFER: Aye.

24 MS. TAYLOR: Member Gaines.

25 MR. GAINES: Aye.

26 MS. TAYLOR: Member Cohen.

27 MS. COHEN: Aye.

28 MS. TAYLOR: Deputy Controller Stowers.

1 MS. STOWERS: Aye.

2 MR. VAZQUEZ: So that's unanimous of all
3 those present.

4 Sorry for the viewing public. I know with
5 this technology sometimes we lose connectivity here.

6 So with that, let's go back -- and I was
7 just letting everybody know as we take a recess of
8 this meeting until tomorrow, that we will reconvene
9 tomorrow at 10:00 a.m. to discuss in detail
10 Proposition 19 as it's being proposed under
11 Legislation SB-539, the Hertzberg bill, and to
12 propose any emergency regulations and clarifying
13 items that are not covered in that legislation.

14 So with that, unless there's any other
15 closing remarks or comments, we stand adjourned.
16 Well, actually not officially adjourned. But in
17 recess until tomorrow morning at 10:00 a.m.

18 And thank you all for your patience. I know
19 it's been tough with this technology these days.
20 Sometimes we lose folks.

21 With that, we will go ahead and take a
22 recess until tomorrow morning.

23 Thank you all and enjoy the rest of your
24 day. And we'll see you in the morning, 10:00 a.m.

25 Thank you.

26 MR. GAINES: Thank you.

27 MS. FLEMING: Thank you, Members.

28 Thank you, staff.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

MR. VAZQUEZ: Thank you, staff.
(Whereupon the meeting concluded.)

1 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

2
3 State of California)
4) ss
5 County of Sacramento)
6

7 I, Jillian Sumner, Hearing Reporter for
8 the California State Board of Equalization, certify
9 that on February 23, 2021, I recorded verbatim, in
10 shorthand, to the best of my ability, the
11 proceedings in the above-entitled hearing; that I
12 transcribed the shorthand writing into typewriting;
13 and that the preceding pages 1 through 93 constitute
14 a complete and accurate transcription of
15 the shorthand writing.

16
17 Dated: June 1, 2021
18
19

20 *Jillian Sumner*

21 -----
22 JILLIAN SUMNER, CSR #13619

23 Hearing Reporter
24
25
26
27
28