

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 63

Tuesday, November 19, 2024

The Board convened at May Lee State Office Complex Auditorium, 651 Bannon Street, Sacramento, at 10:08 a.m., with Ms. Lieber, Chair, Mr. Gaines, Vice Chair, Mr. Vazquez, and Mr. Schaefer present, Mr. Emran present on behalf of Ms. Cohen, in accordance with Government Code, section 7.9. A quorum was established.

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Mr. Schaefer.

Mary Cichetti, Clerk, Board Proceedings, provided guidelines for public participation and other Boardroom procedures.

Mr. Emran left the Boardroom and Ms. Cohen entered via teleconference.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Ms. Lieber invited persons who wish to address the Board regarding items not on the agenda to come forward, but none provided comment.

TAX PROGRAM MATTERS

Christian Younger, Appeals Attorney, presented a summary decision of *Race Telecommunications, LLC (8099), SAU24-016, Property Tax Nonappearance Adjudicatory*, petition for reassessment of Board-adopted 2024 unitary value in the amount of \$320,800,000. Contribution Disclosure forms were filed as required pursuant to Government Code, section 15626: No disqualifying contributions were disclosed.

MOTION: Mr. Gaines made a motion to deny the petition and reaffirm the Board-adopted 2024 unitary value of \$320,800,000 as recommended by the Appeals Attorney. The motion was seconded by Mr. Vazquez. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Ms. Cohen voted yes.

Christian Younger, Appeals Attorney, presented a summary decision of *Pacific Wyyerd, LLC (8238), SAU24-017, Property Tax Nonappearance Adjudicatory*, petition for reassessment of Board-adopted 2024 unitary value in the amount of \$42,900,000. Contribution Disclosure forms were filed as required pursuant to Government Code, section 15626: No disqualifying contributions were disclosed.

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 64

Tuesday, November 19, 2024

MOTION: Mr. Vazquez made a motion to deny the petition and reaffirm the Board-adopted 2024 unitary value of \$42,900,000 as recommended by the Appeals Attorney. The motion was seconded by Mr. Gaines. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Ms. Cohen voted yes.

Sarah J. Wilkman, Appeals Attorney, presented a summary decision of *CVIN, LLC (8151), SAU24-004, Property Tax Nonappearance Adjudicatory*, petition for reassessment of Board-adopted 2024 unitary value in the amount of \$149,300,000. Contribution Disclosure forms were filed as required pursuant to Government Code, section 15626: No disqualifying contributions were disclosed.

MOTION: Mr. Vazquez made a motion to deny the petition and reaffirm the Board-adopted 2024 unitary value of \$149,300,000 as recommended by the Appeals Attorney. The motion was seconded by Mr. Schaefer. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Ms. Cohen voted yes.

Sarah J. Wilkman, Appeals Attorney, presented a summary decision of *Crown Castle Fiber (8169), SAU24-025, Property Tax Nonappearance Adjudicatory*, petition for reassessment of Board-adopted 2024 unitary value in the amount of \$1,270,800,000. Contribution Disclosure forms were filed as required pursuant to Government Code, section 15626: No disqualifying contributions were disclosed.

MOTION: Mr. Schaefer made a motion to deny the petition and reaffirm the Board-adopted 2024 unitary value of \$1,270,800,000 as recommended by the Appeals Attorney. The motion was seconded by Mr. Vazquez. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Ms. Cohen voted yes.

Sarah J. Wilkman, Appeals Attorney, Property Tax Department, requested Board adoption of the following recommendations for petitions for reassessment of unitary value and penalty abatement:

MCI Communication Services, LLC (2274), SAU24-005: deny the petition for reassessment of the Board-adopted 2024 unitary value of \$506,800,000 consistent with the SAPD's recommendation and Petitioner's agreement to instead pursue the issue raised in this petition within a limited scope audit for the 2024 assessment year.

MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC (2372), SAU24-006: deny the petition for reassessment of the Board-adopted 2024 unitary value of \$1,594,800,000 consistent with the SAPD's recommendation and Petitioner's agreement to instead pursue the issue raised in this petition within a limited scope audit for the 2024 assessment year.

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 65

Tuesday, November 19, 2024

AT&T Mobility LLC (2606), SAU24-019: reduce the Board-adopted 2024 unitary value by \$294,112,846 to \$3,176,599,646 to reflect agreement with Petitioner's request for reassessment of unitary value.

Southern California Edison Company (0148) EAU24-002: reduce the Board-adopted unitary land escaped assessment for lien date 2023 by \$1,160,000 to \$7,250,000 to reflect agreement with Petitioner's request for abatement of both the penalty and assessment in lieu of interest.

MOTION: Ms. Cohen made a motion to approve staff recommendations. The motion was seconded by Mr. Schaefer. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Ms. Cohen voted yes.

Jack McCool, Chief, State-Assessed Properties Division, Property Tax Department, requested Board adoption of the following recommendations for 2023 State-Assessed Property Board Roll Changes:

2023 33-02 2099 Smart City Networks, LP
Decrease \$81,658 Unitary Personal Property assessment in Tax Rate Area 000-001 due to Assessee reporting error.

2023 34-02 2099 Smart City Networks, LP
Increase \$81,658 Unitary Personal Property assessment in Tax Rate Area 000-001 due to Assessee reporting error.

MOTION: Mr. Vazquez made a motion to approve corrections to the 2023 Board Roll of State-Assessed Property as recommended by staff. The motion was seconded by Mr. Gaines. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Ms. Cohen voted yes.

Ms. Cohen left the teleconference and Mr. Emran entered the Boardroom on behalf of Ms. Cohen in accordance with Government Code, section 7.9.

CONSENT AGENDA

MOTION: Mr. Schaefer made a motion to adopt the consent agenda including the Board Meeting Minutes of September 24-25, 2024, and October 29, 2024, as presented. The motion was seconded by Mr. Gaines. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Emran voted yes.

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 66

Tuesday, November 19, 2024

BOARD MEMBER MATTERS

Mr. Emran made introductory remarks regarding affordable housing on underutilized school property and introduced Richard Barrera, Senior Policy Advisor to Tony Thurmond, State Superintendent of Public Instruction, California Department of Education, who provided information about land owned by local educational agencies (LEA) that is potentially suited for developing public education workforce housing.

The Board recessed at 11:26 a.m. and reconvened at 11:44 a.m. with Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Emran present.

David Yeung, Deputy Director, Property Tax Department, provided comments on the matter of affordable housing on underutilized school property.

Mr. Vazquez made introductory remarks and presented a proposal for a Board Resolution Policy for the Board Governance Policy annual review and update ([Exhibit 11.1](#)).

Exhibits to these minutes are incorporated by reference.

Mr. Vazquez proposed to establish a 2025 Board Work Group to address key issues and concerns of the County Assessors and Assessment Appeals Board (AAB) ([Exhibit 11.2](#)). The Board received public comments from the following speakers:

Kate Bell, Lobbyist, Ryan, LLC

Tobias Wolken, Policy Advocate, California
Taxpayers Association (CalTax)

James DePasquale, Chair and President of the
California Alliance of Taxpayer Advocates (CATA)

The Board recessed at 1:59 p.m. and reconvened at 2:08 p.m. with Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Emran present.

CHIEF COUNSEL MATTERS

Richard Moon, Chief Counsel, provided a response to a Board Member question and a review of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act on whether persons must identify themselves at a Board meeting when submitting written or verbal public comments ([Exhibit 11.3](#)).

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 67

Tuesday, November 19, 2024

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORTS

Yvette M. Stowers, Executive Director, reported on the status of pending and upcoming organizational issues.

Lisa Renati, Chief Deputy Director, reported on the status of operational priorities and the BOE budget for the current fiscal year.

Richard Moon, Chief Counsel, provided a quarterly report on the Legal Department's workload ([Exhibit 11.4](#)).

Peter Kim, Chief Communications Officer, provided a quarterly report on BOE communications ([Exhibit 11.5](#)).

Lisa Thompson, Taxpayers' Rights Advocate, reported on the workload of the Taxpayers' Rights Advocate Office ([Exhibit 11.6](#)).

David Yeung, Deputy Director, Property Tax Department, reported on the status of pending and upcoming projects, activities, and departmental issues. Lauren Keach, Chief, County-Assessed Properties Division, reported on the status of Letters to Assessors ([Exhibit 11.7](#)), and the Appraisal Training and Certification Program. Holly Cooper, Chief, Assessment Practices Survey Division, provided a quarterly report on Assessment Practices Surveys. Jack McCool, Chief, State-Assessed Properties Division, reported on the status of pending and upcoming projects and activities for the Division.

Mr. Schaefer left the Boardroom.

Laurel Williams, Technical Advisor for Special Taxes, provided a quarterly report on the Special Taxes workload.

Ted Angelo, Chief, Legislative, Research & Statistics Division, reported on administrative and program related legislative bills impacting the BOE.

CLOSING

Members made commemorative comments and closing remarks.

The Board recessed at 3:51 p.m.

The foregoing minutes are adopted by the Board on December 17, 2024.

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 68

Wednesday, November 20, 2024

The Board reconvened at May Lee State Office Complex Auditorium, 651 Bannon Street, Sacramento, at 10:02 a.m., with Ms. Lieber, Chair, Mr. Gaines, Vice Chair, and Mr. Vazquez, present, Mr. Emran present on behalf of Ms. Cohen, in accordance with Government Code, section 7.9.

INFORMATIONAL HEARING: UNDERSTANDING AND EXPLORING OPTIONS FOR INCENTIVIZING CALIFORNIA'S HYDROGEN HUB PROJECT

Mr. Vazquez provided greetings and opening remarks regarding the Informational Hearing on Understanding and Exploring Options for Incentivizing California's Hydrogen Hub Project. Members provided additional greetings and opening remarks.

The following speaker provided input on the establishment of California's Hydrogen Hubs Program through the Alliance for Renewable Clean Hydrogen Energy Systems (ARCHES), its authority, funding, policies, members, progress, and challenges and recommendations for needed incentives for further development opportunities.

Tyson Eckerle, Senior Advisor for Clean Infrastructure and Mobility, GO-Biz and Government Liaison, ARCHES

The following speakers provided the legislative perspective for developing the hydrogen market, challenges, and recommendations, as well as input on recent statutory changes augmenting the development of the hydrogen industry in California, continuing challenges, potential tax and other incentives, and possible future legislation.

Hon. Bob Archuleta, Senator, California State Senate District 30

Hon. Ben Allen, Senator, California State Senate District 24

The Board recessed at 11:57 a.m. and reconvened at 12:08 p.m. with Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, and Mr. Emran present.

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 69

Wednesday, November 20, 2024

The following speakers provided input on key local and state assessment issues regarding the hydrogen industry, including for construction and development, production, infrastructure, distribution, and end usage.

David Yeung, Deputy Director, Property Tax
Department, BOE

Hon. Claude Parrish, Orange County Assessor

The Board recessed at 12:36 p.m. and reconvened at 1:38 p.m. with Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, and Mr. Emran present.

The following speakers provided the progress, challenges, and recommendations of the hydrogen market from various stakeholder perspectives, including industrial production, transportation, storage, and end use.

Eleanor Torres, Managing Director of Strategic
Advocacy, Port of Long Beach

Jackie Birdsall, Senior Engineering Manager of
Fuel Cell Integration Group, Toyota North America

Jason Coble, Head of Hydrogen Strategy and
Development, Nikola Motor Corporation

The Board recessed at 2:35 p.m. and reconvened at 2:47 p.m. with Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, and Mr. Emran present.

The following speakers provided information on the positive community impact, progress, challenges, and recommendations for the hydrogen industry for California, and incentives for promoting interest and growth.

Teresa Cooke, Executive Director, California
Hydrogen Coalition and Partner, California Lobby

Olman Valverde, Secretary, Hispanics in Energy

Mr. Vazquez invited persons who wish to address the Board regarding the Informational Hearing on Understanding and Exploring Options for Incentivizing California's Hydrogen Hub Project to come forward, but none provided comment.

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 70

Wednesday, November 20, 2024

Members made closing remarks regarding the Informational Hearing on Understanding and Exploring Options for Incentivizing California's Hydrogen Hub Project.

The Board adjourned at 3:33 p.m.

The foregoing minutes are adopted by the Board on December 17, 2024.