

BOARD WORK GROUP REPORT ON  
PROPERTY TAX ABATEMENT  
WEDNESDAY, JULY 27, 2022  
PAGE 1 of 3

**Board Work Group on Property Tax Abatement**

The Property Tax Abatement Board Work Group (Work Group) met at 10:14 a.m., with Work Group Chair Ms. Cohen, Co-Chair Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Gaines present, Mr. Epolite present on behalf of Controller Ms. Yee in accordance with Government Code, section 7.9.

Ms. Cohen made introductory remarks regarding the purpose of the Work Group, the goal of the Work Group, the Work Group's final product, and acknowledged the Work Group's policy partner, the Bay Area Council as a strategic partner in this work. Mr. Vazquez also made introductory remarks along with Executive Director Stowers, Senator Gaines, and Mr. Schaefer.

The Board received testimony on the following topics from the following presenters:

**Overview of the Current Housing Crisis & Development Challenges of Building Market Rate, "Missing Middle", & Affordable Housing in California (State, Education and Thinktank, Developers, Funders & Housing Advocates Perspectives)**

Speakers State Perspective:

Jason Elliott, Senior Housing Advisor, Governor Gavin Newsom

Lourdes M. Castro Ramirez, Secretary, CA Business, Consumer Services, & Housing Agency

Tiena Johnson, Executive Director, CA Housing Finance Agency

Honorable Fiona Ma, Treasurer, State of California

Honorable Scott Wiener, Senator, Chair, CA Senate Housing Committee

Speakers Education & Thinktank Perspective:

Carol Galante, Founder & Advisor, Turner Center for Housing & Innovation, University of California Berkeley & the Housing Lab

Jason Ward, Ph.D., Associate Director, RAND Center on Housing & Homelessness in Los Angeles

Speakers Funder Perspective:

Nancee Robles, Executive Director, CA Tax Credit Allocation Committee (CTCAC) & CA Debt Limit Allocation Committee (CDLAC), CA State Treasurer's Office

Kate Ferguson, Multifamily Director, California Housing Finance Agency

Josh Hamilton, Senior Vice President, Century Housing Corporation

Speakers Developers:

Cornelius Burke, Vice President of Legislative Affairs, California Building Industry Association

Ray Pearl, Executive Director, California Housing Consortium

BOARD WORK GROUP REPORT ON  
PROPERTY TAX ABATEMENT  
WEDNESDAY, JULY 27, 2022  
PAGE 2 of 3

Kenneth T. Lombard, President & CEO, BRIDGE Housing

Cherene Sandidge, President, Black Developers Forum & Sandidge Urban Group

Speakers Housing Advocacy Perspective:

Dwayne Crenshaw, President & CEO, Sacramento Urban League

Susie Shannon, Policy Director, Housing is a Human Right, AIDS Healthcare Foundation & City of Los Angeles Health Commissioner

**“The Color of Housing”: Systemic Racism, Equity, & Access to Capital and Financing**

Speakers:

Debra Gore-Mann, President & CEO, The Greenlining Institute

Noerena Limon, EVP of Public Policy and Industry Relations, National Association of Hispanic Real Estate Professionals

**Property Tax Abatement Strategies: “Highlighting Initiatives Across the Country and Exploring Successes, Challenges, & Lessons Learned”**

Speakers State of New York – New York City:

Matthew Murphy, Executive Director, Furman Center, New York University

Hayley Raetz, Director, Data & Policy, Furman Center, New York University

Speaker State of Washington – Seattle:

Jennifer LaBrecque, Manager, Market Incentives, Land Use, & Sustainability Manager, City of Seattle, Office of Housing

**Understanding California’s Experience: “Highlighting Local Government Use of Joint Powers Authorities, Welfare Exemptions, and Other Strategies to Increase the Availability to Affordable Housing”**

Speakers:

John P. Stoecker, Financial Advisor, CA Municipal Finance Authority

Ben Barker, Financial Advisor, CA Municipal Finance Authority

Jon Penkower, Managing Director, CA Statewide Communities Development Authority • Sean Rawson, Waterford Property Company

David A. Garcia, Policy Director, Turner Center for Housing Innovation, University of California Berkeley

Michael Lane, State Policy Director, San Francisco Bay Area Planning and Urban Research Association (SPUR)

BOARD WORK GROUP REPORT ON  
PROPERTY TAX ABATEMENT  
WEDNESDAY, JULY 27, 2022  
PAGE 3 of 3

Ms. Cohen provided an overview of the day and thanked all participants for their informative presentations. She also highlighted the next Work Group meeting. Mr. Vazquez also provided closing remarks. Mr. Schaefer commended the Chair for an outstanding Work Group meeting. Ms. Cohen adjourned the Work Group at 5:09 p.m.

## **Board Work Group on Property Tax Abatement**

The Property Tax Abatement Board Work Group (Work Group) met at 10:02 a.m., with Work Group Chair Ms. Cohen, Co-Chair Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Gaines present, Mr. Epolite present on behalf of Controller Ms. Yee in accordance with Government Code, section 7.9.

Ms. Cohen opened the meeting with the Pledge of Allegiance. She called on Mr. Vazquez and Executive Director Stowers to make opening remarks. Mr. Vazquez acknowledged the presenters, reiterated the importance of today's discussion, and commended the Agency and Board Member's offices for organizing today's meeting. Executive Director Stowers also acknowledged the presenters on the agenda and emphasized the importance of hearing from stakeholders on this important topic. Ms. Cohen made introductory remarks highlighting the focus of today's meeting, the importance of the dialogue, and acknowledged the Agency and Board Member offices for their contributions towards today's meeting.

The Board received testimony on the following topics from the following presenters:

### **Overview of Current Property Tax Incentives in California** (Postponed from July 27, 2022)

Speaker:

David Yeung, Deputy Director, Property Tax Department, Board of Equalization

### **"The Color of Housing": Systemic Racism, Equity, & Access to Capital and Financing** (Continued from July 27, 2022)

Speakers:

Fred Blackwell, President & CEO, San Francisco Foundation

Beatriz "Bea" Olvera Stotzer, Project Co-Founder, Women's Law Center & New Economics for Women (NEW), CEO of NEWCapital, LLC, and Member, Women and Girls Initiative Governing Council, County of Los Angeles

### **Examining the Impact of Abatements to Incentivize the Development of Housing in California: "Why Do Abatements Matter?"** (Postponed from July 27, 2022)

Speakers:

Louise Carroll, Partner, Katten Muchin Rosenman & former New York City Housing Preservation and Development Commissioner

Sean Spears, President & CEO, Community Housing Works & former Assistant General Manager for Housing Development, City of Los Angeles Housing and Community Investment Department

BOARD WORK GROUP REPORT ON  
PROPERTY TAX ABATEMENT  
WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 31, 2022  
PAGE 2 of 3

Deborah Norwood Ruane, Founder & Managing Partner, Norwood Development Strategies & former Executive Vice President, Chief Strategy Officer, San Diego Housing Commission

William A. Witte, Chairman & CEO, Related California

Michael E. Johnson, President & CEO, UrbanCore Development

V. Fei Tsen, Founder, Managing Partner, Windflower Properties

Marc Stivers, Director of Advocacy, CA Housing Partnership

Honorable Shelly Scott, Marin County Assessor-Recorder-Clerk

**Exploring a Statewide Solution: “What Makes Sense for California?”**

**Speakers City of Los Angeles:**

Honorable Gil Cedillo, Council Member & Chair, City Council Housing Committee, City of Los Angeles

Ann Sewill, General Manager, Housing Department, City of Los Angeles

**Speaker City of Fresno:**

Matthew Grundy, Deputy Mayor, City of Fresno

**Speakers City of Riverside:**

Honorable Pat Lock Dawson, Mayor, City of Riverside

Edward Enriquez, Chief Financial Officer & Interim Assistant City Manager, City of Riverside

**Speakers City of Vallejo:**

Honorable Pippin Dew, Councilmember, City of Vallejo

Christina Ratcliffe, Director, Planning and Development Services, City of Vallejo

Michael Nimon, Director, Economic Development Department, City of Vallejo

**Speakers City of Santa Monica:**

Honorable Sue Himmelrich, Mayor, City of Santa Monica

Tara Barauskas, Executive Director, Community Corporation of Santa Monica

**Speaker City of El Centro & County of Imperial:**

Honorable Tomas Oliva, Mayor, City of El Centro

**Examining the Impact of Abatements to Incentivize the Development of Housing in California: “Why Do Abatements Matter?” (Postponed from July 27, 2022) (Continued)**

**Speaker:**

Louise Carroll, Partner, Katten Muchin Rosenman & former New York City Housing Preservation and Development Commissioner

Ms. Cohen provided an overview of the day, thanked all participants for their informative presentations and acknowledged the BOE, CDTFA, and Board Member offices for their contributions in executing the Work Group meeting. She also highlighted that the Board would convene the next Work Group meeting on September 28, 2022. Mr. Vazquez provided closing remarks emphasizing the time presenters invested in preparing their remarks and participating in the Work Group. Mr. Schaefer and Mr. Gaines also provided closing remarks commending the presenters for their contributions and acknowledging Ms. Cohen’s and Mr. Vazquez’s leadership. Ms. Cohen adjourned the Work Group at 4:54 p.m.

BOARD WORK GROUP REPORT ON  
PROPERTY TAX ABATEMENT  
WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 28, 2022  
PAGE 1 of 2

**Board Work Group on Property Tax Abatement**

The Property Tax Abatement Board Work Group (Work Group) met at 10:25 a.m., with Work Group Chair Ms. Cohen, Co-Chair Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Gaines present, Mr. Epolite present on behalf of Controller Ms. Yee in accordance with Government Code, section 7.9.

Ms. Cohen opened with introductory remarks highlighting testimonies heard to date, the focus of today's Work Group meeting, and the importance of this work. She called on Mr. Vazquez and Executive Director Stowers to make opening remarks. Mr. Vazquez acknowledged the presenters, reiterated the importance of today's discussion, and commended the Agency and Board Member's offices for organizing today's meeting. Executive Director Stowers also acknowledged the presenters on the agenda and emphasized the importance of hearing from stakeholders on this important topic. Ms. Cohen made introductory remarks highlighting the focus of today's meeting, the importance of the dialogue, and acknowledged the Agency and Board Member offices for their contributions towards today's meeting.

The Board received testimony on the following topics from the following presenters:

**The Financial Impact of Implementing Property Tax Abatements: "Exploring the Backfill Options for Local Government and Schools"**

Speakers State Government Perspective:

Honorable Tony Thurmond, CA Superintendent of Public Instruction  
Brian Uhler, Deputy Legislative Analyst, CA Legislative Analyst's Office

Speakers Private Sector Perspective:

Honorable Michael "Mike" Roos, Former Speaker Pro Tempore, CA State Assembly  
Eric McKean, Managing Director, Ramirez & Co.

Speakers Education Community Perspective:

Cheryl Ide, Legislative Advocate, CA School Boards Association  
Katie Hardeman, Legislative Advocate, CA Teachers Association  
Megan Baier, Legislative Advocate, Association of CA School Administrators Speakers City and County

Speakers Local Government Perspective:

Mark Neuberger, Legislative Advocate, CA State Association of Counties  
Geoffrey Neill, Legislative Advocate, CA State Association of Counties  
Nicolas Romo, Legislative Affairs, Lobbyist, Revenue & Taxation, League of California Cities

BOARD WORK GROUP REPORT ON  
PROPERTY TAX ABATEMENT  
WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 28, 2022  
PAGE 2 of 2

Speakers Labor Perspective:

Jeremy Smith, Legislative Director, State Building & Construction Trade Council

Speakers Local Government (Continued)

Honorable Eric Garcetti, Mayor City of Los Angeles

**Examining Constitutional, Statutory, and Regulatory Implications: “What’s Required?”**

Speakers:

Richard Moon, Tax Counsel, CA State Board of Equalization

Honorable Leslie Morgan, President, CA Assessors’ Association, and Shasta County Assessor-Recorder

**The Future of Property Tax Abatements in California: “Where Do We Go from Here?”**

Speakers:

Louise Carroll, Partner, Katten Muchin Rosenman & former New York City Housing Preservation and Development Commissioner

Michael Lane, State Policy Director, San Francisco Area Planning & Urban Research (SPUR)

Dr. Jason Ward, Associate Director, RAND Center on Housing & Homelessness

David Garcia, Policy Director, Turner Center for Housing Innovation, University of California Berkeley

Ms. Cohen provided an overview of the day, thanked each Board Member and their offices, thanked the Executive Director and the Agency for all their administrative support in executing the Work Group, and acknowledged all participants for their informative presentations. She also stated that the Board would issue a report summarizing the testimony heard and policy recommendations. Mr. Schaefer and Mr. Gaines both made closing remarks acknowledging the meaningful and informative testimonies heard over the three Work Group meetings and commended Ms. Cohen and Mr. Vazquez once again for their leadership on this important policy issue. Mr. Epolite also acknowledged Ms. Cohen and Mr. Vazquez for their leadership. Mr. Vazquez in his closing remarks thanked all participants and highlighted the importance of streamlining, the use of government owned land, and accountability as areas of focus for next steps based on testimony heard during the Work Group meeting. Ms. Cohen called on the Executive Director to make closing remarks. Executive Stowers commended the participants for their valuable contributions to the discussion. Ms. Cohen adjourned the Work Group at 3:40 p.m.